

Minutes of Meeting of the **Admission Regulating Authority (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **15th January, 2016 at 12:30 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Central, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member

Smt. Medha Gadgil Member Secretary (Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti – Medical Education) and Addl. Chief Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra and Dr. Arun Jamkar, Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik were unable to attend meeting, were granted leave of absence.

Shri M. Sankarnarayanan, Secretary and Commissioner (holding additional charge) of Admissions Regulating Authority and State CET-CELL, Maharashtra State, respectively was absent.

Shri P.L. Darade, Under Secretary, Admissions Regulating Authority, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

Invitees:

- 1) Mrs. Anjali Ambhire : Dy Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra
- 2) Shri Ajit Sasulkar : Under Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra.
- 3) Dr. R.T. Aher : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

bw

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Admissions Regulating Authority (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 18th December 2015 in the Conference Hall office of the Conference Hall, Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai.

Minutes of the Meeting of Admissions Regulating Authority- Medical Education held on Friday, the 18th December 2015 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed, subject to following modifications/corrections.

A) Item No. 5(2) sub clause (a) page No. 7 to be read as under :-

2) D.Y. Patil Dental School, Lohgaon, Pune.

a) Name of the Complainant : **Anagha Devidas Jadhav**

Nature of complaint : ~~College has not displayed the merit list for vacancy round.~~

Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply.

Decision of the Samiti : After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said complaints/representations to the concerned College/Institute. College/Institute to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Instead of ...

2) D.Y. Patil Dental School, Lohgaon, Pune.

a) Name of the Complainant : Ansari Bibi Rahima Rizwan

Nature of complaint : College has not displayed the merit list for vacancy round.

Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply.

Decision of the Samiti : After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said complaints/representations to the concerned College/Institute. College/Institute to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

22

In view of the provisions of section 9 sub section 3 of Maharashtra Unaided Private Professional Education Institutions (Regulation of Admissions and Fees) Act, 2015 (Mah. Act No. XXVIII of 2015) published on 17th August 2015.

The Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti existing as on the date of commencement of the Act shall continue to exercise the powers of Admissions Regulating Authority till such authority is duly constituted under the Act.

Samiti therefore resolve that the agenda of the meeting of the Authority could be sined by Under Secretary/Desk Officer of the Authority with the prior permission of Hon'ble Chairman of Authority in absence of the Member Secretary of the Authority.

Item No. 2: To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on Friday, the 18th December 2016 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 18 th Dec. 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 18 th December 2015.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 28/12/2015.
Item No. 3	To consider and decide the following objections/ representations received from the students/parents in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15 th September 2015 - at Item No. 3. a) Letters dated 5/11/2015 received from Mr. Harshwardhan Sawane. b) Letters dated 26/09/2015 & 5/11/2015 received from Mr. Dayanand Sambhajirao Manjaramkar. c) Letter dated 5/11/2015 received from Mr. Nakul Dinkar Sonune. d) Letter dated 13/10/2015 received from Ms. Pooja Jagdish Patil.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 28/12/2015. Decision is conveyed to All concerned students/parents by a separate letter dated 14/01/2016.
Item No. 4	To consider and decide on letters/ representations received from :- a) Letter dated 21 st November 2015 received from Directorate of AYUSH, Mumbai regarding admission of Sagar Madhukar Salunkhe for First Year degree course for the Academic Year 2015-16.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 28/12/2015. Decision is conveyed to All concerned Department/ Association/College/Institute by a separate letter dated 14/01/2016.

W

Meeting of 18 th Dec. 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 4	<p>b) Letter dated 30th October 2015 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 29th September 2015 – Item No. 7(c) regarding permission of admission of B.P.Th. admissions other than Asso-CET-2015 for the Academic Year 2015-16.</p> <p>c) Letters dated 30th November and 7th December 2015 received from M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune asking permission to conduct College level Entrance Test for MDS & BDS course for the Academic Year 2016-17 (Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 6/11/2015 at Item No. 4[c]).</p> <p>d) Letter dated 26th November 2015 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara submitted Review Application in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15/10/2015 at Item No. 3 & 4.</p> <p>e) Letter dated 28th November 2015 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane asking for approval of admission along with Hon'ble High Court order of Jammu and Kashmir in Write Petition No. 2028 of 2015.</p> <p>f) Letter dated 15th October 2015 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti its meeting held on 11th August 2015 (at Item No. 14[h]) submitted the copy of order of Hon'ble High Court of Jammu and Kashmir.</p> <p>g) Letter dated 7th December 2015 received from Late Shri Yashwantrao Chavan Memorial and Rural Development Foundation's Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar asking for correction in minutes of meeting dated 5/9/2014.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 28/12/2015. Decision is conveyed to All concerned Department/ Association/College/Institute by a separate letter dated 14/01/2016.</p>

Meeting of 18 th Dec. 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 4	h) Letter dated 29 th October 2015 received from Saraswati Dhanwantrari Dental College and Hospital, Parbhani asking for correction in Minutes of meeting dated 25/07/2015.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 28/12/2015. Decision is conveyed to All concerned Department/ Association/College/Institute by a separate letter dated 14/01/2016.
Item No. 5	To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute Level for the Academic Year 2015-16.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 28/12/2015. Decision is conveyed to All concerned Students/Parents as well as College/Institute by a separate letter dated 14/01/2016.
Item No. 6	To consider and decide on the representation submitted by the Colleges/Institutes in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15 th September 2015 (at Item No. 4[2]) regarding rejection of claim of students admitted in 15% NRI Quota.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 28/12/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned College/Institute College/ Institute by a separate letter dated 14/01/2016.
Item No. 7	To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25 th October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]). a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 28/12/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned College/Institute College/ Institute by a separate letter dated 14/01/2016.

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

Item No. 3: To discuss and decide the processing fees for verification of admissions proposals and final approval from the Academic Year 2015-16 onwards as per Maharashtra Unaided Private Professional Education Institutions (Regulation of Admissions and fees) Act, 2015 (Mah Act No. XXVIII of 2015), dated 17th August 2015.

In order to enable the Authority to decide the appropriate processing fees to be charged and recovered from the Institutions in view of the provisions of Maharashtra Unaided Private Professional Education Institutions (Regulation of Admissions and Fees) Act, 2015 (Mah. Act No. XXVIII of 2015) published on 17th August 2015 in Section 16, after deliberation, Authority directs the office to appoint a sub committee to prepare the appropriate proposal and submit it with its report before the Authority at the earliest. Office to take necessary steps accordingly.

sw

Item No. 4: To consider and decide on letters/representations received from :-

Item No. 4(a): To consider and decide on the letter dated 29th December 2015 received from Minority Department, Mantralaya, Mumbai regarding Minority Status of M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune (Ref.: Minutes of the Meeting dated 18/12/2015 Item No. 4[c]).

Authority perused the aforesaid letter received from Minority Department, Mantralaya, Mumbai regarding minority status of M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune.

Authority directs the captioned College to act as per the provisions Maharashtra Unaided Private Professional Education Institutions (Regulations of Admissions and fees) Act, 2015 (Mah Act No. XXVIII of 2015) published on 17th August 2015. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(e): Letter dated 10th December 2015 received from M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune regarding approval of admissions of admitted candidates of First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

Authority perused the aforesaid letter received from M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune regarding approval of admissions of admitted candidates of First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

After deliberations, Authority directs to send the list of admitted candidates to the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai for scrutiny and verification and submit its report within 7 days. After receipt it be placed before Authority for its consideration. Office to take necessary steps.

Item No. 4(f): Letter dated 10th December 2015 received from Sinhgad Technical Education Society, Pune in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15-10-2015 (at Item No. 3 & 4).

Noted.

Item No. 4(g): Letter dated 18th December 2015 received from Dhanvantari Homoeopathic Medical College, Nashik asking approval for admission of admitted candidate on the basis of other than Asso-CET-2014 for First Year BHMS course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

Authority perused the aforesaid letter received from Dhanvantari Homoeopathic Medical College, Nashik asking approval for admission of admitted candidate on the basis of other than Asso-CET-2014 for First Year BHMS course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

DW

Authority feels that at this stage particularly after the cut-off-date no changes can be considered.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Authority decides not to accede to the request of the aforesaid College/Institute. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(h): Letters dated 19th December 2015 received from Almas Quraishi and Mohd Musaddique in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 - at Item No. 3 along with Hon'ble High Court Bench at Aurangabad order in Writ Petition No. 8039 of 2012 dated 28/09/2012.

Authority perused aforesaid letters received from various students/parents in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 – at item No. 3.

Authority also went through the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 - at item No. 3.

After deliberation, Authority decides that the decision of approval of the admissions in question can not be considered at this point of time by this authority, since the alternate efficacious remedies are available to the aggrieved parties below the appropriate forums.

Item No. 4(i): Letters dated 16th and 17th December 2015 received from Shree Saraswati College of Nursing, Sindhudurg and Dr. Hedgewar Smruti Rugna Seva Mandal's Dental College, Hingoli respectively asking permission to enlist with State CET from the Academic Year 2016-17.

Noted. Provision of the Act to be followed.

Item No. 5: To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16.

Item No. 5 (a): To consider and decide on proposals where no discrepancies.

In view of the Verification Report submitted by office on the status of the NRI students who were admitted to Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16 and in view of the fact that documents were verified and checked by section officer, Admissions Regulating Authority. It is decided to approve the admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16, the details of which are as follows:-

dw

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student
1)	N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur Academic Year 2015-16/MBBS	1) Mr. Dahane Ashray Shashikant
	N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur Academic Year 2015-16/MD-MS	1) Abhinav Kumar 2) Bhoomi Bansal 3) Harshali Gawande 4) Saurabh Patil 5) Anuja Godre
2)	Terna Medical College, Navi Mumbai Academic Year 2015-16/MBBS	1) Shruti Valsan 2) Mahenaz Perveen 3) Raj Vinay Pawar
3)	Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur Academic Year 2015-16/BDS	1) Miss Tamboli Arshiya Jahangir 2) Miss Banshetty Vaishnavi Shrishail 3) Miss Chidgupkar Eesha Sandip 4) Miss Talpallikar Taniya Girish
4)	V.S.P.M. Dental College, Nagpur Academic Year 2015-16/BDS	1) Dhanshree Chandrashekhar Mainde 2) Arya Sanjay Chalkhore 3) Divya Manishkumar Mishra
5)	M.G.M. Dental College, Navi Mumbai Academic Year 2015-16/BDS	1) Shetty Ritiksha Yeshwant 2) Aditi Dinesh Dhirwani
6)	L.S.Y.C.M.M. & R.D.F's Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar Academic Year 2015-16/BDS	1) Gaikwad Sumeet Gopalkrishna 2) Patil Janhavi Ajay 3) Mirajgave Diksha Dilip 4) Wagh Abhishek Rajesh 5) D'Silva Natasha Navina Michael 6) Yadav Shruti Yuvraj
7)	Y.M.T. Dental College, Navi Mumbai Academic Year 2015-16/MDS	1) Dr. Aditi Dinesh Mohandas 2) Dr. Mrunal Dinanath Wagh 3) Dr. Firdos S. Mazgaonkar
8)	Terna Dental College, Navi Mumbai Academic Year 2015-16/BDS	1) Mr. Abraham Munaf Hawaii 2) Ms. Padiyar Mussaratbanu Iqbal
9)	Yogita Dental College, Khed, Ratnagiri Academic Year 2015-16/BDS	1) Yash Nagul
10)	Vasantdada Patil Dental College, Sangli Academic Year 2015-16/BDS	1) More Saloman Udaysing 2) Ras Prachiti Swarup 3) Joshi Ankita Suryakant 4) Koik Nikita Shantinath 5) Ponnath Zac Reuben 6) Sankpal Ruchi Subhash
11)	Sancheti Institute for Orthopedics and Rehabilitation, Pune Academic Year 2015-16/MD-MS	1) Kshitij Mody

2/2

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student
12)	S.C.S.E.S. Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Satara Academic Year 2012-13/MBBS	1) Ninad Nandkumar Gharat 2) Nupur Sadhu Ramteke 3) Ashish Kumar Ladhulal 4) Ashwini Shivshankar Mudhole
	S.C.S.E.S. Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Satara Academic Year 2013-14/MBBS	1) Vaibhavi Shashank Deshpande 2) Priyanka Vijay Shingote 3) Shubham Suryabhan Munde

Office to put up the appropriate proposals for regulations and procedure required to be followed/observed while scrutinizing the admissions proposals and grievance redressal mechanism as per the provisions of Section 3(5) clause VII of Maharashtra Unaided Private Professional Education Institutions (Regulation of Admissions and fees) Act, 2015 (Mah Act No. XXVIII of 2015), dated 17th August 2015 before the next meeting.

Item No.6: **To consider and decide on the following matters with the permission of the Chair.**

Item No.6(a): **To ratify the decision on circulatory submission in respect a letters dated 4th and 7th January 2016 received from N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences, Nagpur and letter dated 14th October 2015 received fro Sinhgad Dental College, Pune requesting for approval of admissions of admitted candidates in 15% NRI Quota along with office note dated 8th January 2016.**

Authority perused the aforesaid letters dated 14th and 7th January 2016 received from N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences, Nagpur and letter dated 14th October 2015 received fro Sinhgad Dental College, Pune requesting for approval of admissions of admitted candidates in 15% NRI Quota. Said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti for the decision vide its circulatory submission dated 8/12/2016.

Authority perused the Verification Report submitted by office on the status of the NRI students who were admitted to Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2013-14 and 2014-15. Documents were verified and checked by section officer, Admissions Regulating Authority.

In consideration of the above, Authority decides to approve admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2013-14 and 2014-15, the details of which are as follows:-

Handwritten signature/initials

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student
1)	N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur Academic Year 2013-14 – MD/MS	1) Rolly Kaushik 2) Swati Agrawal 3) Jitesh Jaswani 4) Saurabh Kate 5) Ankita Kabra
2)	Maharashtra Institute of Medical Science and Research, Latur, Academic Year 2014-15 MD/MS	1) Dr. Pathan Mariam Layakali Khan
3)	Vidarbha Youth Welfare Dental College, Amravati Academic Year 2013-14 MDS	1) Jyotsna Nanak Ahuja
4)	Sinhgad Dental College and Hospital, Pune Academic Year 2013-14 MDS	1) Dr. Prachi B. Chhindam
5)	C.S.M.S.S. Dental College, Aurangabad Academic Year 2013-14 MDS	1) Siddiqui Sadaf Afsar 2) Sheetal R. 3) Patil Kuldeep Sudhir
6)	Saraswati Dhanvantari Dental College, Parbhani Academic Year 2013-14 BDS	1) Sangita Nagorao Katore

Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(b): Letter dated 7th December 2015 received from Directorate of AYUSH, Mumbai in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 6/11/2015 (Item No. 4[b]) regarding verification of admission process of Allied Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.

And

Item No. 4(c): Letter dated 17th December 2015 received from SMBT Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar requesting for approval of admissions of admitted candidates on the basis of NEET-MDS-CET-2013 for Post Graduate Dental Course for the Academic Year 2013-14 (Ref.: Minutes of the Meeting dated 12/12/2014 at Item No. 8[g]).

And

dw

Item No. 4(d): Letter dated 22nd December 2015 received from Swargiya Dadasaheb Kalmegh Smruti Dental College and Hospital, Nagpur requesting for approval of admissions of admitted candidates on the basis of NEET-MDS-CET-2013 for Post Graduate Dental Course for the Academic Year 2013-14 (Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 23/08/2013 at Item No. 10[f]).

Samiti decides to consider the captioned agenda items in the next meeting. Office to take necessary steps.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Wednesday, the 27th January, 2016** at 12:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.

Date: 21 JAN 2016


(D.K. DESHMUKH)
CHAIRMAN