

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **22nd November, 2013 at 3.30 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member

Shri Anand B. Kulkarni Member Secretary and Addl. Chief Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Mantralaya and Dr. (Prof.) Arun Jamkar, Member & Vice Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik being unable to attend the meeting was granted leave of absence.

Invitees:

- 1) Dr. P.R. Raikar : Officer on Special Duty on behalf of Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 2) Shri Narasu R. Patil : Superintendent on behalf of Director, Department of AYUSH, Government of Maharashtra

Shri P.E. Gaikwad, Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was on Election Duty in Chattisgarh therefore, Mrs. Sane, Section Officer was present in the meeting.

Mrs. K.V. Sane. Section Officer, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 25th October 2013 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti - Medical Education held on Friday, the 25th October 2013 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed.

gla

Item No. 2: To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on 25th October, 2013 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 25 th October 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 25 th October 2013.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 1/11/2013.
Item No. 3	To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during the admission process conducted at Institute level for the Academic Year 2013-14.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.
Item No. 4	To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submission on 4 th and 7 th October 2013 regarding extended cut-off-date for MBBS and BDS courses for the Academic Year 2013-14 in furtherance of a letter dated 3/10/2013 received from Association (AMUPMDC).	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.
Item No. 6	To consider and decide the following letters requesting to give free and fair trial and for approval of admission process of A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule for the Academic Year 2012-13 in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 11 th January 2013 (at Item No.3[m]) in furtherance of Hon'ble High Court order in Writ Petitions 2820 and 2818 of 2013. a) Office note dated 15 th October 2013. b) Letter dated 14 th October 2013 received from Annasaheb Chudaman Patil Memorial Medical College, Dhule c) Letter dated 14 th October 2013 received from Miss Anam Mohd. Moobin Siddique along with Hon'ble High Court order in Writ Petition No. 2820 of 2013. d) Letter dated 14 th October 2013 received from Mr. Mante Srinivas Dattatraya along with Hon'ble High Court order in Writ Petition No. 2818 of 2013.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.

50

Meeting of 25 th October 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 7	<p>a) : Letter dated 20th September 2013 received from Chatrapati Shahu Maharaj Shikshan Sanstha's Dental College and Hospital, Aurangabad requesting to approve the admission of Dr. Zavar Chetan for AY 2013-14 on the basis of Govt. NEET MDS CET 2013.</p> <p>b) : Letter dated 20th September 2013 received from S.M.B.T Dental College, Sangamner, Ahmednagar requesting to approve admission of Dr. Singh Anujkumar and Dr. Desai Tejaswini on the basis of NEET CET 2013.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.</p>
Item No. 8	<p>a) Letter dated 26th July 2013 received from Madhukar Namdev Patil complaining against S.D. Dental College, Parbhani for demanding excess fees for MDS admission for the Academic Year 2013-14 and the reply submitted by aforesaid College/Institute vide its letter dated 25/09/2013.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 26th July 2013 received from Vilas Sambhaji Davane complaining against S.D. Dental College, Parbhani for refusal of admission for MDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14 and the reply submitted by aforesaid College/Institute vide its letter dated 17/08/2013.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 27th September 2013 received from Ashwini Rural Medical College, Hospital and Research Center, Solapur asking for clarification / guidelines on point C of the office letter dated 20th September 2013.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 24th September 2013 received from Association of Management of Homoeopathic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra alongwith the detailed programme of admission procedure in respect of vacancies after DMER's First Round for BHMS- AY 2013-14.</p> <p>e) Letters dated 13th August 2013 and 15th October 2013 received from Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur requesting to correct the approval details Dr. Kamal Yadav (Ref : Samiti Approval the admission of the said candidate for MDS course in 15% NRI Quota in its meeting held on 18/04/2013).</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.</p>

Meeting of 25 th October 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 9	<p>a) To consider, discuss and decide letter dated 8th October 2013 received from Hon'ble Member and Vice-Chancellor (Prof) Dr. Arun Jamkar in respect of the decision taken on circulatory submission on 4th and 7th October 2013 regarding extended cut-off-date for MBBS and BDS courses for the Academic Year 2013-14</p> <p>b) To consider, discuss and decide on Letter dated 12th October 2013 received from Medical Council of India, New Delhi regarding complaint against Private Medical Colleges for selling MBBS seats.</p> <p>c) To consider, discuss and decide on Letter dated 17th October 2013 received from Vishal Ram Sing asking</p> <p>d) To consider, discuss and decide on Letter dated 11th October 2013 received from Shaikh Mohd. Shujaat regarding withdrawal of complaint against Terna Dental College, Navi Mumbai – Ref : Minutes of the Meeting dated 27th Sept. 2013 (at Item No. (4)(7).</p> <p>e) To consider the requests of following Colleges/Institutes to permit to admit candidates from State-CET for vacant seats B.P.Th and M.P.Th courses for the Academic Year 2013-14.</p> <p>i) Letter dated 8th and 10th October 2013 received from V.S.P.M. College of Physiotherapy, Nagpur.</p> <p>ii) Letter dated 17th October 2013 received from P.E.S. Modern College of Physiotherapy, Pune</p> <p>iii) Letter dated 21st October 2013 received from Chaitnya Medical Foundation's College of Physiotherapy, Pune</p> <p>f) To consider the requests of following Colleges/Institutes to permit to admit candidates from State-CET/ APBN-CET-2013 / MT- CET / Non CET against vacant seats for P.B.B.Sc. and B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2013-14.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.</p>

bw

Meeting of 25 th October 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
	<p>i) Letter dated 3rd October 2013 received from Smt. Subhadra K. Jindal College of Nursing, Pune.</p> <p>ii) Letter dated 4th October 2013 received from St. Luke's Hospital College of Nursing, Ahmednagar</p> <p>iii) Letter dated 8th October 2013 received from K.D.A. Nursing College, Mumbai</p> <p>9(f)(iv) : To consider the letter dated 8th October 2013 received from Seva Mandal Education Society's College of Nursing, Mumbai</p> <p>9(g) : To consider the letter dated 5th October 2013 received from Sangam Sevabhavi Trust's Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Sangamner requesting to permit to admit the candidates from NEET-UG-CET-2013 for first year B.A.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.</p> <p>9(h) : To consider the letter dated 8th October 2013 received from Seva Mandal Education Society's College of Nursing, Mumbai requesting to permit to conduct CET at Institutional level for admissions to B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2013-14, as a Minority Institute.</p> <p>9(i) : To consider the letter dated 9th October 2013 received from Pad. Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Foundations Medical College, Ahmednagar regarding admission of Ms. Asgaonkar Priyanka along with Hon'ble High Court order in writ petition No. 2773 / 2013 - Ref: Minutes of the meeting dated 27/09/2013 at Item No. 6(g).</p> <p>9(j) : To consider the letter dated 8th October 2013 received from Vasantdada Patil Dental College, Sangli requesting to extend the date for submission of online admissions details of MDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14 and waive the penalty.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.</p>

tw

Meeting of 25 th October 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
	<p>9(k) : To consider the letter dated 10th October 2013 received from Association of the Managements of Unaided Nursing Colleges requesting to extend the date for submission of online admission details for B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2013-14.</p> <p>9(l) : To consider the letter dated 22nd October 2013 received from Association of Managements of Homoeopathic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to allow to admit the students for Post Graduate Homoeopathy course as per the Rule No. 12.9 of Asso-PGH-CET-2013 brochure for the Academic Year 2013-14</p> <p>9(m): To consider the letter dated 19th October 2013 and 21st October 2013 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik and Association of Managements of Homoeopathic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra regarding enrolment and eligibility of the candidates of B.H.M.S. course admitted on the basis of Non-CET for the Academic Year 2012-13.</p> <p>9(n): To consider the letter dated 30th September 2013 received from Shri R.A. Sonawane asking for reverification of Caste and Caste Validity Certificate issued by Competent Authority for all categories for MBBS and BDS admission for the Academic Year 2013-14, copy endorsed to us.</p> <p>9(o) : To consider the letter dated 23rd October 2013 received from Association of Managements of Homoeopathic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to permit to admit the students for first year B.H.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2013-14 as per the Samiti resolution dated 27th September 2013 (at Item No. 7[d]).</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.</p>

DW

Meeting of 25 th October 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
	<p>9(p) : Letter dated 23rd October 2013 received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to permit to admit the students for first year B.A.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2013-14 as per the Samiti resolution dated 27th September 2013 (at Item No. 7[d])</p> <p>9(q) : To review disposal of work – Proposals in respect of admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14.</p>	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 1/11/2013. Decision is conveyed to concerned college by a separate letter dated 21/11/2013.

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

Item No. 3: **To consider and decide on the letters/representations received:-**

Item No. 3(a) : **Letter dated 26th October 2013 received from Vasantdada Patil Dental College and Hospital, Sangli regarding enrolment and eligibility of the students admitted through NEET-UG-CET-2013 for first year BDS year course for the Academic Year 2013-14.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference.

Samiti concludes that the aspect of enrollment and eligibility of students does not come within the purview of Samiti. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 3(b) : **Letter dated 25th September 2013 received from Kasturba Health Society's Kasturba Nursing College, Wardha requesting to permit to conduct CET at Institutional level for admissions to M.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2013-14.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 25th September 2013 received from Kasturba Health Society's Kasturba Nursing College, Wardha requesting to permit it to conduct at separate CET for admissions to Post Graduate M.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Samiti observes that the letter dated 25th September 2013 received Samiti office on 24th October 2013 and extended cut-off-date for Nursing was 30th October 2013.

In view of the above being cut-off-date is over, Samiti feels no action was necessary at this stage from Samiti. Hence is rejected. Office to inform accordingly.

dw

Item No. 2(c) : **Letter dated 8th October 2013 received from Annasaheb Chudaman Patil Memorial Dental College, Dhule requesting to consider the category of Kum. Hamand Asmita Ramesh from Open to NT3 admitted for first year BDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Noted its contents.

Item No. 4: **As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013 (at Item No. 9[q]) - To review disposal of work of Proposals in respect of admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2011-12 and 2012-13.**

Item No. 4(a): **To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

And

Item No. 4(b): **To consider, discuss and decide on proposals received for approval of admissions where there are discrepancies.**

And

Item No. 4(c): **To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.**

Office to scrutinize and place all the proposals before the Samiti in the next meeting.

Item No. 5: **Any other matter with the permission to the Chair.**

Item No. 5(a): **To consider and decide the following letter in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013 (at Item No. 6) in respect of free and fair trial and for approval of admission process of A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule for the Academic Year 2012-13 in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 11th January 2013 (at Item No.3[m]) in furtherance of Hon'ble High Court order in Writ Petitions 2820 and 2818 of 2013.**

- i) **Letter dated 18th November 2013 received from Mr. Mante Srinivas Dattatraya.**
- ii) **Letter dated 18th November 2013 received from Miss Anam Mohd Moobin Siddiqui**
- iii) **Letter dated 16th November 2013 received from A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule.**

gn

1. Samiti perused the letters dated 18/11/2013 received from Mr. Mante Srinivas Dattatraya and Miss Anam Mohd. Moobin Siddique. Samiti also perused letter No. 6833/ACPMMC/Dhule, dated 16/11/2013 received from the said institute.
2. As far as admissions after the last CAP round was over are concerned, Samiti received 06 complaints from 1) Sandip Ravindrasing Rajput, 2) Khan Mohd. Kasam, 3) Shah Krina Ajay, 4) Parag Agarwal, 5) Vivek Lokhande and 6) Vinod Chandorkar.
3. However, Committee appointed under Government resolution No. एमईडी १०१२/प्र.क्र.३०९/शिक्षण-२, dated 29th November 2012 has found that a) advertisement was not given in news papers and b) merit was not maintained. It is stated that the Committee verified the claims of these complainants and its findings have been confirmed in a meeting held on 11th January 2013. It is also stated that in furtherance of these findings only 02 admissions were disapproved.
4. The institute vide its letter 16/11/2013 communicated that the 1) advertisement was given in the widely circulated newspaper in "Dainik Sakal" on 16/09/2013. 2) applications are accepted from all the candidates and acknowledgement was given to all of them.
5. Considering that the institute we therefore come to the conclusion that it would be in the fittest of the things to consider the claim of students admitted and whose admissions are merit based.

In light of what has been observed in para 3, 4 and 5 above, we think it fit, proper, just and reasonable to approve all the admissions those are merit based. Office to Inform all accordingly.

Item No. 5(b): Letter dated 19th November 2013 received from Maharashtra State Private Nursing Schools and Colleges Management Association, Aurangabad regarding admissions to Nursing Course on the basis of Non-CET, letter addressed to Hon'ble Minister, Medical Education and Drugs Department along with letter dated 14th November 2013 received from Dy. Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department in respect of admission process to Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter dated 19th November received from Maharashtra State Private Nursing Schools and Colleges Management Association urging admissions to Nursing course on the basis of Non-CET. Samiti also perused letter dated 14th November 2013 received from Dy. Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra in respect of admission process of Nursing Course for the Academic Year 2013-14. Vide said letter Government has requested to allow admissions

DW

on the basis of merit and after due publication for Academic Year 2013-14. Samiti perused para 2,3,4,5 and 6 of the letter under reference very carefully.

Samiti in its meeting held on 24th June 2013(at Item No. 6[a] & 6[f]) has passed the following orders:-

"Samiti also perused the circular of Indian Nursing Council, New Delhi dated 29th April 2013.

Samiti decides and also clarifies that the aspect of granting Permission to admit Non-CET students does not come within the purview of Samiti."

Considering above, after deliberation, Samiti concludes that the decision taken by Samiti in its meeting held on 24th June 2013 (at Item No. 6[a] & 6[f]) warrants no change. All decisions of the Committee those were taken herein before in respect of admissions of Nursing courses on the basis of Non-CET for Academic Year 2013-14 stand as they are without any alterations, modifications, etc. The aforesaid Association/Colleges/Institutes can seek the remedy against the decision of Samiti if at all it feels aggrieved before the appropriate authority empowered by law. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 5(c): Letter dated 18th November 2013 received from K.J. Somaiya College of Physiotherapy, Mumbai regarding over and above admissions in 15% NRI Quota in M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

The Samiti perused aforesaid letter dated 18th November 2013 received from K.J. Somaiya College of Physiotherapy, Mumbai regarding over and above admissions in 15% NRI Quota in M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

After deliberations, Samiti directs aforesaid Colleges/Institutes to submit their explanation in respect of excess admissions in done 15% NRI quota. After receipt of the same explanations to be placed before Samiti for its consideration.

Item No. 5(d): Letter dated 31st October 2013 from Progressive Education Society's Modern College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting for conversion of reserved quota seat to the Open quota in M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

The Samiti perused aforesaid letter dated 31st October 2013 received from Progressive Education Society's Modern College of Physiotherapy, Pune regarding requesting for conversion of reserved quota seats to open quota in M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

an

After deliberations, Samiti directs aforesaid Colleges/Institutes to submit their details of admission process of M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2013-14. After receipt of the same to be placed before Samiti for its consideration.

Item No. 5(e): Letter dated 31st October 2013 received from Ashwini Rural Medical, Hospital and Research Centre, Solapur requesting for enlist with Government CET for first year MBBS admissions from the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the letter dated 31st October 2013 received from Ashwini Rural Medical, Hospital and Research Centre, Solapur requesting to allow to enlist with Government CET for admissions to first year M.B.B.S. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

After deliberations, Samiti grants its permission to the aforesaid Colleges/Institutes to join State CET and to follow CET rules as per Government policy, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities.

Item No. 5(f): Letter dated 11th November 2013 received from M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences and Research Centre, Pune requesting to permit to conduct CET-2014 for admissions to Minority Management Quota for first year BDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

And

Item No. 5(g): Letter dated 11th November 2013 M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences and Research Centre, Pune requesting to permit to conduct CET-2014 for admission to Minority Quota for Post Graduate Dental Course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letters received from M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences and Research Centre, Pune requesting to permit it to conduct separate CET for admissions to first year B.D.S. course and Post Graduate MDS courses for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Samiti observes that per the law laid down by the Supreme Court of India in its judgment in the case of Islamic Academy versus State of Karnataka (2003) 6 supreme Court cases 697 (para 16) there is no provision for separate CET for minority institutes.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti decides not to accede to the request made by the aforesaid Institute. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 5(h): Letter dated 18th November 2013 received from Dr. Vandanatai Jagannathrao Dhone Gramin Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Patur, Akola requesting to allow to admit the candidates on the basis of Non-CET for first year B.A.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Handwritten mark

The Samiti perused aforesaid letter dated 18th November 2013 received from Dr. Vandاناتai Jagannathrao Dhole Gramin Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Patur, Akola requesting to allow to admit the candidates on the basis of Non-CET for first year B.A.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Samiti concludes that the aspect of granting permission to admit candidates on the basis of Non CET does not come within the purview of Samiti. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 5(i) : **To discuss and consider the letter dated Nil received from Dr. P.R. Raikar, Officer on Special Duty, Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State requesting for payment of T.A. / D.A. to Committee – C appointed in furtherance of Government Resolution No. MED-2012/प्र.क्र.३०९/शिक्षण-२, दिनांक २९/११/२०१२. claiming honorarium and other incidental expenses.**

Samiti perused the letter dated November 2013 received from Dr. P.R. Raikar, Officer on Special Duty regarding payment of T.A. / D.A. to Committee– C appointed in furtherance of Government of Resolution No. MED-2012/प्र.क्र.३०९/शिक्षण-२, दिनांक २९/११/२०१२. claiming honorarium and other incidental expenses.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to pay the T.A. / D.A. and other incidental expenses to Dr. P.R. Raikar as representative of the Samiti for Committee – C appointed under Government resolution No. MED-2012/प्र.क्र.३०९/शिक्षण-२, dated 29/11/2013. Office to take steps.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Friday, the 20th December, 2013** at 03:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.

Date: **27 NOV 2013**


(D.K. DESHMUKH)
CHAIRMAN