

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **6th September, 2013 at 3.30 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
3. Dr. Arun Jamkar : Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik (Participated through Video Conferencing System)

Shri Anand B. Kulkarni Member Secretary and Addl. Chief Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Mantralaya being unable to attend the meeting was granted leave of absence.

Dr. M.S. Kekre, Member couldn't remain present. Hence, leave of absence granted.

Invitees:

- 1) Shri K.B. Kenga : Dy. Secretary on behalf of Member Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra
- 2) Dr. P.H. Shingare : Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 3) Shri R.B. Nakave : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Science, Nashik
- 4) Shri Narsoo Patil : Superintendent on behalf of Director, Department of AYUSH, Government of Maharashtra

Shri P. E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

PW

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 23rd August 2013 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti - Medical Education held on Friday, the 23rd August 2013 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed, subject to following corrections/modifications:

a) **Item No. 3 (a) – (page No. 8) should be read as under :-**

Sr. No.	Programme	Schedule
1	Reporting College wise Vacancies to Association by Colleges	2nd September 2013
13	Verification process to be conducted by Samiti for admissions.	27th September 2012

Instead of

Sr. No.	Programme	Schedule
1	Reporting College wise Vacancies to Association by Colleges	3rd September 2013
13	Verification process to be conducted by Samiti for admissions.	28th September 2012

Item No. 2: To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on 23rd August, 2013 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 23rd August 2013	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 1 to 10:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 23 rd August 2013.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 5/9/2013.

Samiti noted and approved it.

BW

Item No. 3 : **To conduct the verification process for Second round of Asso-CET-2013 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra.**

Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra submitted the C.D. of Second Round of Asso-CET-2013 for approval of admission process of Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14 vide its letter No. AMUPMDC/Asso-CET-2013, dated 5th September 2013 received on 5/9/2013 at 5:30 p.m. (by hand).

The CD containing the data of Asso-CET-2013 submitted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra is sent to the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai through email on 5th September 2013 at 5.32 p.m. for their scrutiny and remarks/suggestions.

It is observed that report of Expert Committee is yet to be received. Samiti directs the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai to verify and scrutinize the data submitted by the Association and submit their report to Samiti immediately.

Item No. 4 : **To consider the letter dated 25th August 2013 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra, Mumbai regarding revised schedule of admission process for Asso-CET-2013 for admissions to first year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 25th August 2013 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra conveying the reschedule of admission process of Asso-CET-2013.

In view of the foregoing Samiti resolves as under :

A) 85% Quota - Vacant Seats after last "Common Admission Process" (CAP) :-

Samiti directs all Private and Unaided Medical and Dental Colleges (Except those who joined NEET-UG-CET-2013 – conducted by Directorate of Medical Education and Research, M.S.) as under :-

- a) Where the vacancy arises after the last CAP round of Asso-CET-2013 Colleges/Institutes shall publish the vacancy position on its notice board and website of the College/Institute, Association, Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State as well as Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik, strictly without fail.

- b) The Notifications in 05 leading newspapers having wide circulation in the State as per the order of the Hon'ble High Court in Writ Petition No. 7799 of 2010 (para 39) should contain the following details:-
- (i) Category wise vacancy position,
 - (ii) Specimen format of Application Form (all contact details to be mentioned in the form),
 - (iii) Schedule of admission with date, time and venue.
- c) After 26th September 2013, waiting list of next meritorious candidates immediately to be displayed on the notice board and website of all the concerned Colleges/Institutes.
- d) After 26th September 2013, if any vacancies arise then the College/Institute to publish the same on the notice board and website of the College/Institute, Association, Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State and Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik without fail.

In furtherance of the decision taken by Samiti in its meeting held on 23rd August 2013 at Item No. 3(a) – Samiti further directs the Association/Colleges/Institutes to submit the following admissions details in duplicate to the Samiti on or before 24th September 2013 (within office hrs) :-

- a) Category wise vacancy position after second round - (*Annexure - A*).
- b) Copy of advertisements - (*Annexure - B*).
- c) Merit list prepared by concerned College - (*Annexure - C*).
- d) List of Applicant along with photocopy of applications - (*Annexure - D*).
- e) List of provisional admissions granted against the vacant seats - (*Annexure - E*).
- f) List of candidates selected through CAP round (*Annexure - F*).
- g) Names of students in Merit list but not selected - (*Annexure - G*).
- h) Refusal letters from Merit Candidates, if not selected - (*Annexure - H*).
- i) Any other information which could be important to assess the transparency of the system - (*Annexure - I*).

Samiti also directs all Private Medical and Dental Colleges to mark their presence along with admissions details before Samiti on 27th September 2013 at

20

PNS(Medical)
6th September 2013

3:30 pm at Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001 for verification and confirmation of admission process. Authorized representative of the College should bring with him all the relevant documents related to the admission process.

Samiti further directs the Association and concerned Colleges to follow above directions strictly. **Those failing to submit their admissions details to Samiti, within time admission process of the said Colleges/Institutes is likely to be disapproved by Samiti for the Academic Year 2013-14,** kindly note.

Item No. 5: To review disposal of work – Proposals in respect of admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2011-12 and 2012-13.

Item No. 5(a) : To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.

Samiti perused the Verification Report submitted by office on the status of the NRI candidates who were admitted in Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. The documents were verified and checked by section officer, Pravesh Niyanttran Samiti.

In consideration of the above, Samiti decides to approve admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2012-13, the details of which are as follows:-

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student
1	Dr. Hedgewar Smruti Rugna Sevs Mandal College, Hingoli (BDS for A.Y 2012-2013)	1) Saweed Hussain jawed Ansari
		2) Khillare Namrata Vilas
		3) Sawake Vinaya Vilasrao
2	M.G.M Dental College & Hospital, Navi Mumbai (BDS for 2012-2013)	1) Bhandary Manikya Sridhar
3	MVPS, Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical college & Hospital Research Centre, Adgaon, Nashik (MD.MS for A.Y 2013-2014)	1) Dr. Kadam Aniruddha Bhikaji
		2) Dr. Rahul Vijay Barve
		3) Dr. Deore Pranay Vijay
		4) Dr. Walavalkar Anand Uday
4	M.I.M.S.R. Medical College & Research Centre, Lature (MD. VD for 2012-2013)	1) Dr. Amey Anand Kelkar

EW

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student
5	Saraswati Dhanwantri Dental College & Hospital , Parbani (BDS Course for A.Y 2012-2013)	1) Chaitrali S. Joshi
		2) Juweriya Lamat Shaikh Mujahed
6	Hinduja College of Nursing, Andheri (M.Sc for A.Y 2012-2013)	1) Anju.R. Arora
7	MIMER Medical College Talagaon Dabhade (P.G Course for A.Y 2013-2014)	1) Pranali Vishwanath Ghuge

Item No. 5(b) : To consider, discuss and decide on proposals received for approval of admissions where there are discrepancies.

After deliberations, Samiti decides **not to approve** admissions of following candidate as the respective Colleges/Institutes have not submitted the requisite documents to the satisfaction of the claim of the candidates as NRI, the details of which are as follows:

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student	Remarks	To Prove the status following document are required
1	Dr.Hedgewar Smruti Rugna Seva Mandal College, Hingoli.(BDS Course for AY 2012-13)	1)Gawate Nishigandha Ashokrao	NRI Status is not Proved.	1) Proof of residence showing minimum continuous 182 day's for 2011-2012 NRI Documents.
2	MVPS, Dr. Vasantao Pawar Medical College Hospital Adgaon Nashik.(MD.MS Course for AY 2013-14.)	1)Dr. More Ashwinkumar Prabhakar	Relation between candidate & Sponsors is not proved.	1) Candidate Mother's PAN Card, Marriage Certificate 2) Sponsor's Mother's PAN Card, Marriage Certificate 3) Sponsor's Affidavit is incomplete
3	M.G.M.Dental College & Hospital, Navi Mumbai. (P.G Course for AY 2012-13.)	1)Gandhi Bhavisha Shirishbhai	NRI Status is not Proved.	1) Proof of residence showing minimum continuous 182 days residence abroad of claimant NRI 2) Electricity Bill
		2)Divya Anil Kumar Singh	NRI Status is not Proved.	1) Proof of residence showing minimum continuous 182 days residence abroad of claimant NRI 2) Electricity Bill

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student	Remarks	To Prove the status following document are required
		3)Mandal Shouvik Sukumar	NRI Status is not Proved. & Relation is not proved.	1) Proof of residence showing minimum continuous 182 days residence abroad of claimant NRI 2) Sponsor's Mothers PAN Card, Marriage Certificate 3) Candidate's Mothers PAN Card, Marriage Certificate 4) Candidate H.S.C & S.S.C Certificate
4	MIMER Medical College Talegaon Dabhade. (P.G Course for AY 2013-14.)	Resnma Ramesh Bhatane	Relation between candidate & Sponsors is not proved.	1) Candidate Fathers PAN Card, Leaving Certificate 2) Candidate Grand Father's PAN Card, Leaving Certificate 3) Sponsors Father PAN Card, Leaving Certificate

Item No. 5(c) : **To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.**

Office to scrutinize and place the proposals before the Samiti in due course.

Item No.6: **To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.**

Item No. 6(a) : **To consider, discuss and decide the Hon'ble High Court orders :-**

Item No. 6(a)(i) : **Order dated 4th September 2013 in Writ Petition (L) No. 1970 of 2013– Jamia Islamia Ishaatul Uloom & Anr. V/s State of Maharashtra and Ors**

Samiti perused aforesaid order passed by Hon'ble High Court. Parties to the said petition are

Jamia Islamia Isaatul Uloom & Anr - Petitioner

V/s

State of Maharashtra and Anr - Respondents.

BD

PNS(Medical)
6th September 2013

Samiti in its meeting held on 23rd August 2013 (at Item No. 3[e]) has decided not to accede to the request made by petitioner asking for separate CET for Minority Quota admissions to first year M.B.B.S. course for the Academic Year 2013-14. There after petitioner has filed a petition in the Hon'ble High Court of Bombay. Hon'ble Court in writ petition No. 1970 of 2013 has passed the following orders:-

"8. In the circumstances there shall be an ad-interim order staying the impugned order dated 30.07.2013 and permitting the petitioners to conduct the college entrance examination for admission to the first year MBBS course for the academic year 2013-2014 for minority students."

After deliberations, Samiti noted the contents.

Item No. 6(a)(ii) : Order dated 4th September 2013 in Writ Petition (L) No. 2190 of 2013– Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Pune V/s State of Maharashtra and Ors.

Samiti perused aforesaid orders passed by Hon'ble High Court. Parties to the said petition are

Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of
Dental Sciences and Research, Center

- Petitioner

V/s

State of Maharashtra

- Respondents.

Samiti in its meeting held on 23rd August 2013 (at Item No. 3[d]) has decided not to accede to the request made by petitioner asking for a separate CET for Minority Quota admissions to first year B.D.s. course for the Academic Year 2013-14. There after petitioner has filed a petition in the Hon'ble High Court of Bombay and Hon'ble Court in writ petition No. 1970 of 2013 has passed the following orders:-

"1. This petition is similar to Writ Petition (Lodging) No. 1970 of 2013. We have today by a separate order granted ad-interim relief's. For the reasons stated therein, there shall be ad-interim order permitting the petitioners to conduct their own CET for BDS course for academic year 2013-2014. "

After deliberations, Samiti noted the contents.

STW

Item No. 6(b) : **Letter dated 29th August 2013 received from Post Graduate Institute of Swasthiyog Prathishthan, Miraj regarding Post Graduate Medical admissions for the Academic Year 2013-14.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference.

College/Institute has submitted and requested as under:-

1. The institute happens to be the part of Government Medical College, Miraj, but DMER refused to fill in their Post Graduate seats for the Academic Year 2013-14. In spite of compliance to MCI objections having verified by dean Government Medical College, Miraj, DMER refused to fill in their seats.
2. MCI has not derecognized the institute, nor have directed to stop the admissions. DMER can not stop admissions.
3. Already there is a shortfall of PG seats in orthopedics and the fact that we are attached to Government Medical College, Miraj, our say needed to have been considered, which DMER felt to consider.

Samiti considered the above pointes raised by the institute amongst others. After deliberation, Samiti directs the College/Institute to follow the rules, regulations and conditions laid down by respective authorities, subject to having all permissions/approvals from concerned authorities and ensure that they are strictly followed.

Item No. 6(c) : **Letter dated 4th September 2013 received from Jamia Islamia Ishaatul Uloom, Akkalkuwa, Nandurbar asking for CET for Minority Management Quota for admissions to first year M.B.B.S. course for the Academic Year 2013-14 along with Hon'ble High Court order dated 4th September 2013 in Writ Petition (L) No. 1970 of 2013.**

Samiti perused the letter, under reference.

College/Institute has vide its aforesaid letter submitted and requested as under:-

1. It is stated that the institute has obtained permission for establishing new Medical College at Jalna from M.C.I. under section 10A of the IMC Act 1956 for the Academic Year 2013-14 with 100 seats intake capacity and College is the only Muslim Minority Educational institution in the State.
2. It is further stated that Hon'ble Bombay High Court has allowed it to conduct College Entrance Test vide its order in writ petition No. 1970 of 2013. In pursuance of the said order it has prepared stage wise programme to conduct the CET.

After deliberation, Samiti feels no action was necessary at this stage from Samiti. Court orders to be obeyed.

52

Item No. 6(d) : **Letter dated 29th August 2013 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara regarding approval of NRI quota admissions for the Academic Year 2013-14.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter dated 29th August 2013 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara asking for approval of NRI Quota admissions for the Academic Year 2013-14.

It is observed that the said College/Institute has not submitted the requisite documents to the satisfaction of the claim of the candidates as NRI. Therefore no action is to be taken. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 6(e) : **Letter dated 4th September 2013 received from Vitthal B. Devkhile, Advocate, Bombay High Court regarding conduction of the CET as per the High Court order dated 4th September 2013.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference.

College/Institute has vide its aforesaid letter stated that the Hon'ble High Bombay High Court in writ petition No. 2190 of 2013 has allowed Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center to conduct its own CET for its BDS course for Academic Year 2013-14.

After deliberation, Samiti feels no action is necessary at this stage from Samiti. Court orders to be obeyed.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyrantr Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Friday, the 27th September, 2013** at 03:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.

Date: 20/9/13


(D.K. DESHMUKH)
CHAIRMAN