

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **12<sup>th</sup> December, 2014 at 12.00 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4<sup>th</sup> floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

---

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member
3. Dr. Arun Jamkar : Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik (Participated through Video Conferencing System)

Smt. Manisha M. Mhaiskar Member Secretary and Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra being unable to attend the meeting were granted leave of absence.

Invitees:

- 1) Dr. P.R. Raikar : Officer on Special Duty on behalf of Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 2) Shri R.B. Nakve : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik
- 3) Shri N.R. Patil : Office Superintendent on behalf of Director, Department of AYUSH, Maharashtra State.

Shri P. E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. holding additional charge of Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

*Patil*

**Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai.**

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyran Samiti - Medical Education held on Friday, the 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed

**Item No. 2(a): To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.**

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> October, 2014 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2014.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 7/11/2014.
Item No. 3	To review – Present Scenario – in respect of First Year Medical and Dental courses Admissions for Academic Year 2014-15 - after cut-off-date.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.
Item No. 4	To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute level for the AY 2014-15. a) Letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Atul Kaneja complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission for non availability of Transfer Certificate at the time of admission and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014. b) Letter dated Nil received from Gore Krushnprasad complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission admitted less meritorious candidates for the First Year MBBS course for the AY 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes and students/parents by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.

*Handwritten signature/initials*

Meeting of 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 4	<p>c) Letter dated 29/09/2014 received from Sakshi Patil complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission to meritorious students for the First Year MBBS course for the AY 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 7/10/2014 received from Vishwajit R. Gaikwad complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik admitting students who were not present for counseling and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.</p> <p>e) Letter dated 5/10/2014 received from Shahrukh Khan complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission for non availability of Transfer Certificate at the time of admission and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.</p> <p>f) Letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Sai Akhil Tarun complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admissions to meritorious students for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>g) Letter dated 16/10/2014 received from Akshay S. Suryawanshi asking for admission in vacant seats for the First Year B.H.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15 at Smt. Chandaben Mohanbai Patel Homoeopathic Medical College, Mumbai.</p> <p>h) Letter dated 14/10/2014 received from Ms. Prachi Bhide complaining against M.A.E.E.R's College of Physiotherapy, Pune in respect of refund of fees and original documents.</p> <p>i) Letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Ms. Sharwaree P. Sawant complaining against Yogita Dental College, Khed, Ratnagiri in respect of refund of fees and return of original documents and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 28/10/2014.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/ Institutes and students/parents by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.</p>

*BA*

Meeting of 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 4	<p>j) Letter dated 9/10/2014 received from Mr. Kapil Baliram Shekdar complaining against Yashwant Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Kolhapur refusing the admission because of delay in submission of fees to Post Graduate Ayurved course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 27/10/2014.</p> <p>k) Letter dated 4/10/2014 received from Ms. Prerana B. Bhide complaining against Kedari Redekar Ayurved College, Kolhapur asking donation for admission to First Year BAMS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 22/10/2014.</p> <p>l) Letter dated 23/09/2014 received from Ms. Kamini D. Sureshe asking for admission in vacant seats of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 at 1) N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur, 2) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgon, 3) Dr. P.D. Medical College, Amravati, 4) Pad. Dr. Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar and 5) MVP Dr. Vasant Rao Pawar Medical College, Nashik and there on replies submitted by the Colleges/Institutes viz. 1) N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur, 2) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon and 3) Pad. Dr. Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar vide its letters dated 30/09/2014 and 14/10/2014 respectively.</p> <p>m) Letter dated 20/09/2014 received from Mr. Mithilesh S. Solanki complaining against Dr. Hegdewar Smruti Dental College, Hingoli in respect of refund of fees and return of original documents and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 28/09/2014.</p> <p>n) Letter dated 26/08/2014 received from Vivek Alnure complaining against M.G.M. College of Physiotherapy, Navi Mumbai admitting open category students in vacant seats for First Year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 20/10/2014.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes and students/parents by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.</p>

Meeting of 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
	<p>o) Letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Ms. Snehal Sonawane complaining against Sangam Sevabhavi Trust Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Sangamner, Ahmednagar denial admission for want of Nationality Certificate and Original documents for admission to First Year B.A.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 14/10/2014.</p> <p>p) Letter dated 7/8/2014, 26/09/2014 and 29/09/2014 received from Dr. Harsh Tiwari complaining against A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule asking for return of original documents and refund of fees and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 4/9/2014.</p>	
Item No. 5	To decide on circulatory submission in respect of a letter dated 29 <sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai about admissions in Sinhgad Dental College, Pune and M.I.D.S.R Dental College, Latur on the basis of Asso-CET-2014, along with office note dated 30/09/2014	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Directorate and Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.
Item No. 6	<p>To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:-</p> <p>a) Letter dated 24<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai conveying remarks on draft brochure of APGP-CET-2014 – Ref.: Agenda of the meeting dated 5<sup>th</sup> September 2014 (Item No. 7[c]).</p> <p>b) Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Mr. R.A. Sonawane requesting for personal counselling admission process for vacant seats – after CAP rounds of MBBS and BDS courses, along with office note dated 30/09/2014.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara conveying the details of admission process being followed by the institute in view of order in W.P.(Civil) 469/2014 date 25/09/2014 passed by Hon'ble supreme court of India for First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p>	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Department and Colleges/ Institutes by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.

Meeting of 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 6	<p>d) Letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara asking for approval of admissions of students admitted under 15% NRI Quota for First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>e) Letter dated Nil received from Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil Vidyapeeth, Pune requesting to approve the admissions of students selected on the basis of Asso-CET-2014 for the First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>f) Letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from JIIU's Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Medical College, Jalna submitting admission details of admitted students for First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, in furtherance of order in W.P.(Civil) 469/2014 passed by Hon'ble supreme court of India on 18/09/2014.</p> <p>g) Letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Saraswati-Dhanwantari Dental College, Parbhani submitting an explanation in respect of decision taken by Samiti in its Meeting held on 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 (at Item No.3).</p>	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Department and Colleges/ Institutes by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.
Item No. 7	<p>To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a])).</p> <p>a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.</p> <p>b) To discuss and decide on proposals where the relation between candidate and sponsor is other than first degree blood relative</p>	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.
Item No. 8	<p>To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.</p> <p>a) Letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Dy. Registrar, High Court of Bombay, Nagpur Bench, Nagpur in respect of W.P. No. 4051/2014 – Sameera M. Shaikh v/s Pravesh Niyrantran Samiti, Mumbai regarding Post Graduate admissions for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara submitting admissions details of admitted candidates in First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p>	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Court and Associations by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.

DN

Meeting of 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 8	<p>c) Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra asking for permission to conduct Second CET for admissions of Post Graduate Ayurved Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to permit to admit candidates on the basis of BAMS degree holder, APGA-CET and PGA-CET for the admissions of Post Graduate Ayurved Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 7/11/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Court and Associations by a separate letter dated 14/11/2014.</p>

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

**Item No. 3:** **To consider and decide on the letter dated 28<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 5<sup>th</sup> September 2014 regarding verification of admission process of P.B.B.Sc. and M.Sc. Nursing Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Ref. : Government Resolution No. एनयुआर-१४१४/प्र.क. १२९/शिक्षण-२, dated 7/6/2014).**

Samiti perused and noted the clarification submitted by Dy. Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra vide its letter dated 28<sup>th</sup> October 2014 in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its Meeting held on 5<sup>th</sup> September 2014 regarding verification of admission process of P.B.B.Sc. and M.Sc. Nursing Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

However, the Government circular referred above deciding not to hold Common Entrance Test for admissions to P.B.B.Sc. and M.Sc. Nursing Courses is violative of the directions issued under the Judgment of Constitutional bench of Hon'ble Supreme Court of India (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 in Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka para no. 16, directing that admissions to all professional courses need to have to be on the basis of Common Entrance Test held by the State or Association of the private, Unaided colleges per the said judgement. Admissions based on this judgement followed by the Common Entrance Test to professional (Under Graduate and Post Graduate) courses can be only monitored by this Committee and modifications in this process can be made only by a parliamentary legislation. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No.4:** **To consider and decide on the letter dated 18<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Asst. Registrar, Supreme Court of India, New Delhi in the matter of Special Leave to appeal (Civil) Nos. 31900, 32666, 35573, 35832 and 35855 of 2013 – Krina Ajay Shah and Ors V/s AMUPMDC.**

Samiti perused. Noted the contents.

**Item No.5:** **To consider and decide on the letter dated 12<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from National Commission for Minority Educational Institutions, New Delhi in respect of the admissions of Foreign National Candidates admitted in First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14 at M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune.**

Samiti perused. Noted the contents and order dated 28<sup>th</sup> October 2014 passed by the National Commission for Minority Educational Institutions, New Delhi in F. No. 2284 of 2014.

**Item No.6:** **To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submission of 18<sup>th</sup> November 2014 in respect of a request approval of admissions of admitted candidates in 15% NRI quota for the Academic Year 2012-13, letter dated 12/11/2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letters received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara requesting for approval of admissions in First Year MBBS course in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13. Said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti for the decision vide its circulatory submission dated 18<sup>th</sup> November 2014.

In respect of admissions of a) Amol Chandrakant Deshmukh, b) Komal Dilip Panchgane, c) Parag Ashok Hirey and d) Rajeshwari Sidheshwar Devkar it is observed that the affidavit submitted by the sponsor is not signed by the sponsor & in respect of the admissions of a) Vahidpajal Vallahmad Tamboli, b) Suyog Vijaykumar Katkar and c) Chintala Nagasai Manojkumar it is observed that Passport of Sponsors expire before the completion of study of a student and in the case of Nivedita Sanjay Sarode required to submit all original documents, hence Samiti directs the College/Institute to submit proper documents to Samiti within 15 days. After receipt they be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Samiti ratifies the decision to approve the admission of Swapnil Chandrakant Shirole in 15% NRI Quota for First Year M.B.B.S. Course for the Academic Year 2012-13. Office to inform.

no



**Item No.7:** **To consider and decide on the following explanations received from Colleges/Institutes in respect of decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 at Item No. 3 regarding non submissions of admission through online.**

**Item No. 7(a):** **Letter dated 24<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from SMBT Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar.**

**And**

**Item No. 7(b) :** **Letter dated 11<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Yoqita Dental College and Hospital, Khed, Ratnagiri**

Samiti perused the contents of the aforesaid communications received from Colleges/Institutes concerned.

Samiti observes that the said Colleges/Institutes have already submitted the admission details online. Samiti noted.

**Item No. 7(c):** **Letter dated 24<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 at Item No. 3.

Samiti in its meeting held on 4<sup>th</sup> July 2014 - at Item No. 5 sub clause (c) (i) Samiti directed all Colleges/Institutes to submit the list of admissions 'online' within 15 days, but aforesaid College/Institute has failed to submit its admission list online within the stipulated time period.

College/Institute has submitted its explanation and stated that concerned clerk of the College/Institute was on leave, so the concerned forgot to submit and the the College authorities were not aware that there was any cut-off-date for the online submission. The explanations submitted is not acceptable and Samiti expresses its displeasure.

However, after deliberation, Samiti decides to charge the penalty to the aforesaid College/Institute at Rs. 25,000/-. Samiti further directs the College/Institute that payment be paid in the form of Demand Draft / Pay order in favour of "PRAVESH NIYANTRAN SAMITI, MUMBAI", payable at Mumbai. Office to take further necessary steps.

*M*

**Item No. 7(d): Letter dated 26<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Vidarbha Youth Welfare Society's Dental College and Hospital, Amravati**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Vidarbha Youth Welfare Society's Dental College and Hospital, Amravati in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 at Item No. 3.

Samiti in its meeting held on 4<sup>th</sup> July 2014 - at Item No. 5 sub clause (c) (i) Samiti directed all Colleges/Institutes to submit the list of admissions 'online' within 15 days, but aforesaid College/Institute failed to submit its admission list online within stipulated time period.

College/Institute submitted its explanation vide its aforesaid letter. It has not stated any reasons for condonation of delay. Samiti expresses its displeasure over this attitude of the College.

However, after deliberation, Samiti decides to charge the penalty to the aforesaid College/Institute at Rs. 25,000/-. Samiti further directs the College/Institute that payment be paid in the form of Demand Draft / Pay order in favour of "PRAVESH NIYANTRAN SAMITI, MUMBAI", payable at Mumbai. Office to take necessary steps.

**Item No. 7(e): Letters dated 1<sup>st</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Sinhgad Dental College, Pune**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Sinhgad Dental College, Pune in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 at Item No. 3.

Samiti in its meeting held on 4<sup>th</sup> July 2014 - at Item No. 5 sub clause (c) (i) Samiti directed all Colleges/Institute to submit the list of admissions 'online' within 15 days, but aforesaid College/Institute has failed to submit its admission list online within stipulated time period.

College/Institute submitted its explanation vide its aforesaid letter. It has not stated any reasons for condonation of delay. Samiti express its displeasure over this attitude of the College.

However, after deliberation, Samiti decides to charge the penalty to the aforesaid College/Institute at Rs. 25,000/-. Samiti further directs the College/Institute that payment be paid in the form of Demand Draft / Pay order in favour of "PRAVESH NIYANTRAN SAMITI, MUMBAI", payable at Mumbai. Office to take necessary steps.

ew

**Item No. 7(f): Letters dated 26<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 at Item No. 3.

Samiti in its meeting held on 4<sup>th</sup> July 2014 - at Item No. 5 sub clause (c) (i) Samiti directed all Colleges/Institute to submit the list of admissions 'online' within 15 days, but aforesaid College/Institute has failed to submit its admission list online within stipulated time period.

College/Institute submitted its explanations vide its aforesaid letter. It has stated that due to mistake of the clerk, it was unable to comply with the directions. Samiti cannot accept such explanations. Samiti express its displeasure over such an attitude of the College.

However, after deliberation, Samiti decides to charge the penalty to the aforesaid College/Institute at Rs. 25,000/-. Samiti further directs the College/Institute that payment be paid in the form of Demand Draft / Pay order in favour of "PRAVESH NIYANTRAN SAMITI, MUMBAI", payable at Mumbai. Office to take necessary steps.

**Item No. 7(g): Letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Aditya Hospital and Dental College, Beed.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Aditya Hospital and Dental College, Beed in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 at Item No. 3.

Samiti in its meeting held on 4<sup>th</sup> July 2014 - at Item No. 5 sub clause (c) (i) Samiti directed all Colleges/Institute to submit the list of admissions 'online' within 15 days, but aforesaid College/Institute failed to submit its admission list online within stipulated time period.

College/Institute submitted its explanations vide its aforesaid letter. It has not stated any reasons for condonation of delay. Samiti express its displeasure over such an attitude of the College.

However, after deliberation, Samiti decides to charge the penalty to the aforesaid College/Institute at Rs. 25,000/-. Samiti further directs the College/Institute that payment be paid in the form of Demand Draft / Pay order in favour of "PRAVESH NIYANTRAN SAMITI, MUMBAI", payable at Mumbai. Office to take necessary steps.

ow

**Item No. 8: To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:-**

**Item No. 8(a) : Letters dated 19<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara asking for approval to admission process in 85 % and 15% quota admissions of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letters received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Satara asking for approval of admission process in 85% and 15% Quota admissions of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

It is noticed that aforesaid College/Institute vide its letter bearing No. SCSES/IMSR/MYN/454/2014, dated 30/09/2014 were they stated that on 30.09.2014 they doing spot admissions of the students from the merit list of Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra, Mumbai.

In view of the above, Samiti carefully went though the Hon'ble Supreme Court Orders dated 18<sup>th</sup> September 2014 and 25<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in Writ Petition No. 469 of 2014.

After deliberation, Samiti decides not to approve the admissions of students admitted in Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court orders dated 18/09/2014 and 25/09/2014 in Writ Petition No. 469 of 2014.

Samiti further directs the College/Institute to submit the circumstances and basis those led it admit the NRI/Sponsor NRI students in 15% NRI Quota for First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15. After receipt it be placed before Samiti for its consideration.

Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 8(b): Letter dated 24<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from Association of Managements of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra submitting information in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its Meeting held on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 (at item No. 8[c] & [d]) regarding permission to admit candidates on the basis of PGA-CET-2014 or Non-CET instead of APGA-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Ayurved Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra submitting information in respect of its decision of 31<sup>st</sup> October 2014 – at Item No. 8(c) & 8(d) regarding permission to admit the students on the basis of PGA-CET-2014 or Non-CET instead of APGA-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Ayurved Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

22

Samiti concludes that the aspect of granting the permission to admit Non-CET students does not come within the purview of Samiti.

Samiti perused the details submitted by the Associations. In view of these, after deliberations, Samiti decides not to accede to the request of the Association to admit the students from PGA-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Ayurved Course for the Academic Year 2014-15. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 8(c): Letter dated 20<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur requesting to enlist with Govt. CET for the admissions process of Under Graduate, Post Graduate and Super Speciality courses for the Academic Year 2015-16 onwards.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur requesting to enlist with Government CET for admissions to Under Graduate, Post Graduate and Super Speciality Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16 onwards.

Samiti grants its permission to aforesaid College/Institute to join State CET and to follow CET rules as per Government policy, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Samiti further directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 8(d): Letter dated 18<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from M.A. Rangoonwala College of Physiotherapy, Pune submitting order of National Commission of Minority Educational Institutions, New Delhi in the case of 2462 of 2014.**

Samiti perused and noted the contents of letter under reference and order dated 17<sup>th</sup> November 2014 passed by the National Commission for Minority Educational Institutions, New Delhi in F. No. 2462 of 2014.

**Item No. 8(e): Letter dated 3<sup>rd</sup> November 2014 received from Post Graduate Institute of Swasthiyog Pratishthan, Miraj submitting affidavit in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its Meeting 4<sup>th</sup> July 2014 (at Item No. 8[b]) regarding permission to admit candidates from PGM-CET-2014 or AICET-2014 instead of APGM-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Medical courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

**And**

**Item No. 8(f): Letter dated 17<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from K.B.H. Dental College and Hospital, Nashik submitting affidavit in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its Meeting 5<sup>th</sup> September 2014 (at Item No. 9[h]) regarding permission to admit students from PGD-CET-2014 instead of APGD-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Dental courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

**And**

**Item No. 8(g): Letter dated 5<sup>th</sup> November 2014 received from SMBT Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar submitting affidavit for approval of admissions of admitted students on the basis of PGD-CET-2013 instead of APGD-CET-2013 for the Post Graduate Dental Course for the Academic Year 2013-14.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letters under reference.

After deliberations, Samiti directs the Office to examine the affidavits and other details submitted by the College and verify whether the said affidavits and other documents submitted are as per the requirements and whether they are in conformity with the resolutions passed by the Samiti in its earlier meetings and submit the report before Samiti. Thereafter it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 8(h): Letter dated 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2014 received from Sancheti Institute for Orthopedics and Rehabilitation Post Graduate College, Pune requesting to approve the admission of Dr. Anoop Patel admitted on the basis of AIEE-CET-2014 instead of PGM-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Medical Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Sancheti Institute for Orthopedics and Rehabilitation Post Graduate College, Pune requesting to approve the admission of Dr. Anoop Patel admitted on the basis of AIEE-CET-2014 instead of PGM-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Medical Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

It is observed that Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai pointed out that the student viz. - Anoop Patel has passed from AIEE-CET-2014 and has secured requisite marks in CET.

The Institute has stated that the selection of Dr. Anoop Patel has been done strictly in accordance with the guidelines given by Samiti vide its decision dated 24<sup>th</sup> February 2010.

Samiti went through its decision of 24<sup>th</sup> February 2010 at Item No. 5(c).

In view of the above, after deliberation, on its basis of 24<sup>th</sup> February 2010 – at Item No. 5(c) Samiti decides to approve the admission of Dr. Anoop Patel for the Post Graduate Medical Course for the Academic Year 2014-15, subject to fulfillment of eligibility criteria laid down by the respective Authorities. Office to inform accordingly.

Samiti further resolves as under :-

"Samiti directs the All Associations/Colleges/Institutes to admit students for First Year and Post Graduate Health Science Courses from amongst the merit lists drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated accordingly mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as re- produced hereunder:

*" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".*

Samiti directs the Office to inform above to all concerned, Directorates, University, Associations and Colleges/Institutes.

**Item No. 8(i): Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Chaitanya Medical Foundations College of Physiotherapy, Pune asking for permissions to admit students from PGP-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Physiotherapy Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Chaitanya Medical Foundations College of Physiotherapy, Pune asking for permissions to admit students from PGP-CET-2014 for the Post Graduate Physiotherapy Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

ad

Samiti observes that the aforesaid Colleges chose to opt for APGP-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra for admission to Post Graduate Physiotherapy course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti directs the Colleges/Institutes to admit students from amongst the merit lists drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated accordingly mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as re- produced hereunder:

*" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".*

Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 9: To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).**

**Item No. 9(a): To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

Samiti perused the Verification Report submitted by office on the status of the NRI students who were admitted to Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. Documents were verified and checked by section officer, Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti.

22



In consideration of the above, Samiti decides to approve admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15, the details of which are as follows:-

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student
1)	M.G.V.'s K.B.H.Dental College and Hospital, Nashik - MDS course for Academic Year 2012-13	1) Tejas Nishikant Patange
2)	M.G.M.Dental College & Hospital, kamothe, Navi Mumbai - MDS course for Academic Year 2014-15	1) Priya Kamlakant Gupta
3)	Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Narhe, Pune - MDS course for Academic Year 2014-15	1) Shrunal Sanjiv Kamdar 2) Hardik Dineshbhai Patel
4)	Y.M.T.Dental College & Hospital, Kharghar, Navi Mumbai - MDS course for Academic Year 2014-15	1) Jhanvi Nitin Ganatra 2) Yash Hareshkumar Jethwani 3) Madhavi Ajit Shetty
5)	V.S.P.M.Dental College & Research Centre, Nagpur- MDS course for Academic Year 2014-15	1) Sonam Vivek Gupta
6)	SMBT Dental College & Hospital & Post Graduate Research Centre, Sangamner, Ahmednagar – BDS course for Academic Year 2014-15	1) Shweta Bhanudas Palve

Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 9(b): To consider, discuss and decide on proposals received for approval of admissions where there are discrepancies.**

After deliberations, Samiti decides **not to approve** admissions of following candidate as the respective Colleges/Institutes and or relationship have not submitted the requisite documents satisfying the claim of the candidates as NRI, the details of which are as follows:

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student	Remarks	To Prove the status following document are required
1	Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Narhe, Pune for MDS course Academic Year 2014-15.	1)Chitrangi Prashant Barpade	Relation between candidate & Sponsors is not proved.	1)Candidate Marriage Certificate/Passport/PAN Card.

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student	Remarks	To Prove the status following document are required
2	Vasantdada Patil Dental College & Hospital, Kavalapur, Sangli MDS course Academic Year 2014-15.	1)Umesh Manikrao Zende	NRI Status of Sponsors is not Proved.	1)Sponsor's Any other document to prove 182 day's for NRI Residence.
3	Terna Dental College ,Nerul, Navi Mumbai for MDS course Academic Year 2014-15.	1)Ibrahim Yusuf Kheirgoonwala	NRI Status of Sponsors is not Proved.	1)Sponsor's Any other document to prove 182 day's for NRI Residence.
4	Dr.Panjabrao Alias Bhausahab Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati MD/MS course Academic Year 2014-15.	1)Nikhil Pramod Borde	Relation between candidate & Sponsors is not proved.	1)Candidate Father's PAN Card/ Passport
5	Dr.Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Found. Medical College, Ahmednagar for MD Pediatrics course Academic Year 2014-15	1)Aditya Radhacharan Sawla	NRI Status of Sponsors is not Proved.	1)Sponsor's Residence Card, Tax Bill, Bank Statement all document should be translated in English or Hindi language.
6	M.G.M. Dental College & Hospital, Kamothe, Navi Mumbai for MDS course Academic Year 2014-15	1)Bhoomi Arvindbhai Parmar	Relation between Candidate & Sponsor is not Proved	As per the design of the Samiti taken in it's meeting held on 27 Sep 2007 Item No-3. The Sponsor is not First Degree blood relation with the Candidate, hence claim may not be excepted.
7	Sinhgad Dental College, Vadgaon, Pune for MDS course Academic Year 2014-15	1)Vrishali Ashok Kumavat	NRI Status of Sponsors is not Prove & Relation between candidate & Sponsors is not prove.	1)Document to prove NRI Status of Sponsor 2) )Sponsor's Father's Passport/ PAN Card 3)Candidate Father's Passport/ PAN Card 4)Candidate H.S.C & BDS Certificate 5)Candidate LC
		2)Nair Chandrashekh aran Malvika	NRI Status of Sponsors is not Proved.	1)Sponsor Mother Passport/PAN Card/ Marriage Certificate. 2) Candidate Mother Passport/PAN Card/ Marriage Certificate. 3) )Candidate H.S.C, LC & BDS Certificate 4)Any Other document to prove NRI Status & Sponsor.

Samiti further directs the Colleges/Institutes to comply with the requirements within four weeks failing which admissions are liable to be disapproved. No extension will be given, kindly note. Office to take necessary steps and inform all concerned accordingly.

**Item No.10:** **To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.**

**Item No.10(a):** **To discuss and decide the policy in respect of the 15% NRI Quota admissions and there upon suggestions/objections submitted by various Associations/Colleges/Institutes (Ref. : decision taken by the Samiti in its Meeting held on 29th September 2014 - at Item No. 11[b]).**

Samiti decides to consider the matter in the next meeting.

**Item No.10(b):** **To consider and decide the Observation/Verification report dated 11<sup>th</sup> December 2014 submitted by the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State in respect of admissions process of Under Graduate and Post Graduate Course for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the Observation/Verification report dated 11<sup>th</sup> December 2014 submitted by the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State in respect of the admission process of Under Graduate and Post Graduate Courses for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15.

After deliberation Samiti decides that, where there are no discrepancies such admissions stand approved, where there are discrepancies such admission are approved, subject to the Expert Committee sorting out and disposing off with said discrepancies after appropriate compliances within four weeks from respective Institutions, the details which are enclosed as **Annexure - A.**

- 1) It is observed that Expert Committee in its report at Sr. No. 12 (MBBS Course) has pointed out that as per Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 18<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in Writ Petition (Civil) No. 469 of 2014 the Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara should have selected the students from Government CET i.e. MH-CET-2014 only. However College/Institute has selected 85 candidates from Asso-CET-2014 and 15 candidates are selected in NRI quota.

After deliberations, Samiti decides as at Item No. 8(a) above.

- 2) Expert Committee further in its report at Sr. No. 4 (BDS Course) has pointed out that M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune admitted 60 students from Minority CET, 25 students were admitted in Non Minority Quota out of these 02 candidates admitted from MH-CET-2014, 07 candidates selected from Asso-CET-2014 & 16 students selected from MINO-CET-2014 and 15 candidates are selected in NRI Quota.

PNS(Medical)  
12<sup>th</sup> December 2014

It is seen that M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune had requested Samiti to allow for a separate CET for admissions to BDS courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 for Minority Quota admissions. Samiti in its meeting held on 22nd November 2013 (at Item No. 5[f] and 5[g]) has denied the request on the basis of judgment of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in the case of Islamic Academy versus State of Karnataka (2003) 6 supreme Court cases 697 (para 16).

Samiti also went through the Hon'ble High Courts order dated 3<sup>rd</sup> April 2014 in Writ Petition No. 2335 of 2014.

In view of the above, after deliberations Samiti feels no action was necessary at this stage from Samiti. Court orders to be obeyed. Office to inform accordingly.

- 3) Expert Committee vide its report at Sr. No. 23 (BDS Course) has Pointed out that Guardian Dental College, Ambarnath, Dist. Thane does not have continuation of affiliation from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik for the Academic Year 2014-15 and said College/Institute has admitted 59 students from Minority CET, 03 candidates are selected in Non Minority Quota from Asso-CET-2014 and 05 candidates are selected in NRI Quota.

It is seen that Shaan Education Society's Guardian Dental College, Ambarnath, Dist. Thane had requested Samiti to allow the Minority CET for admissions to BDS courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 for Minority Quota admissions. Samiti in its meetings held on 11<sup>th</sup> April 2014 - at Item No. 4(c) and 5<sup>th</sup> September 2014 - at item No. 8(b) has denied the request made by the said College/Institute on the basis of judgment of Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in the case of Islamic Academy versus State of Karnataka (2003) 6 supreme Court cases 697 (para 16).

In view of the above, after deliberations Samiti decides not to approve the admissions of selected students in First Year B.D.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15 of Shaan Education Society's Guardian Dental College, Ambarnath, Dist. Thane on the basis of Minority CET and on the basis of Expert Committee's report. Office to inform accordingly.

- 4) Samiti further decides that admissions in a) Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur, b) Vidarbha Youth Welfare Society's Dental College, Amravati, c) Sinhgad Dental College, Pune, d) Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research, Ambarnath, Thane and e) Aditya Hospital and Dental College, Beed will be approved for Academic Year 2014-15, subject to the payment of penalty as decided and directed by Samiti at Item No. 7 above.

*W*

PNS(Medical)  
12<sup>th</sup> December 2014

Samiti further directs the Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik to note the above decision in respect of the eligibility and enrollment of these Colleges/Institutes for the Academic Year 2014-15. Office to take necessary steps and inform accordingly.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyamtran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Friday, the 16<sup>th</sup> January, 2015** at 3:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.



**(D.K. DESHMUKH)**  
**CHAIRMAN**

Date: 130 DEC 2014