

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **17th July, 2015 at 2:00 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member
3. Dr. Arun Jamkar : Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik (Participated through Video Conferencing System)

Smt. Medha Gadgil Member Secretary and Addl. Chief Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra and Shri N.K. Deshmukh, I.A.S. holding additional charge of Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai unable to attend the meeting. However, Mrs. K.V. Sane. Desk Officer, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai represented the office and Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai.

Samiti observes that the Member Secretary of the Samiti has been unable to attend the meetings of the Samiti continuously since long. He being the head of the department concerned and also being the Member Secretary of the Samiti his attendance in the meetings would help Samiti to arrive at the just; proper and reasoned decisions. Samiti further observes that the office secretary functions under the guidance and control of the Samiti. Agenda of the meeting is being signed by him and also sent by him to all the concerned. Thus defacto impliedly he works as the Member Secretary in absence of Member secretary. Present office secretary has been keeping away from the meetings since he took over. He never kept the chairman or the Samiti informed of his inability to attend and the grounds thereof. Samiti therefore thinks it fit; proper; just and reasonable to resolve for the intervention of Principal Secretaries concerned and also of the general administration department ensuring the attendance of the concerned officer in the meetings of the Samiti.

Invitees:

- 1) Dr. P.H. Shingare : Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 2) Dr. R.T. Aher : Asst. Registrar On behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

sw

The next meeting after 30th April 2015 was to take place on 26th June 2015. But it could not be held due to intervening Ordinance No. VII of 2015, dated 12th May 2015 issued by Government of Maharashtra. Thereafter Notification dated 8th July 2015 came to be issued by the Government of Maharashtra. Hence this meeting is called.

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Thursday, the 30th April 2015 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai.

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti - Medical Education held on Thursday, the 30th April 2015 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed.

Item No. 2(a): To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on Thursday, the 30th April 2015 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 30 th April 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 30 th April 2015.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to All concerned Department by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.
Item No. 3	dated 3 rd March 2015 received from Dr. Balaji Kinikar, Hon'ble M.L.A. complaining against Shaan Education Society's Guardian Dental College, Ambarnath regarding criminal conspiracy in forgery and cheating.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.
4	To consider and decide the letter dated 3 rd March 2015 received from Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra along with letter dated 28/10/2014 from Anti Corruption Beauru, Mumbai regarding Post Graduate Admission Process after the third round of selection process for the AY 2014-15.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned Department by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.

SM

Meeting of 30 th April 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 5	<p>To consider and decide on the following letters received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental College of Maharashtra, Mumbai.</p> <p>a) Letter dated 30/03/2015 regarding approval of admissions of admitted candidates on the basis of other than Asso-CET-2014 for First Year B.P.Th. and B.Sc. Nursing Courses for the AY 2014-15 (Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 27th March 2015 - at Item No. 5[a]).</p> <p>b) Letter dated 30th March 2015 submitting data of First Round of Selection Process of APGM-APGD-CET-2015 for admissions to Post Graduate Medical and Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 26th March 2015 submitting the seat matrix for Post Graduate admissions to Medical and Dental Colleges for Academic Year 2015-16.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned Association by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.</p>
Item No. 6	<p>To discuss and decide on letters/representations received from:-</p> <p>a) Letter dated 1st April 2015 received from Association of Management of Homoeopathic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra asking for approval of draft brochure for ASSO-PGH-CET-2015 for the admissions of Post Graduate Homoeopathy Course for the Academic Year 2015-16.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 4th April 2015 received from KDA Nursing College, Mumbai regarding approval of admission of Ms. Okabekwa Perpetua Ujunwa admitted in First Year B.Sc. Nursing Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>c) Letters dated 2nd and 3rd February 2015 received from A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule and letter dated 9th and 18th February 2015 and 21st March 2015 received from Dr. Harsh Tiwari respectively regarding refund of fees of Dr. Harh Tiwari admitted in Post Graduate Course for the Academic Year 2014-15 – Ref. : Minutes of the Meeting dated 16th January 2015 at Item No. 7(a).</p> <p>d) Letters dated 17/11/2014, 23/01/2015, 10/03/2015 and 4/2/2015 received from Simran Maqsood Dingankar and Yashwant Ayurved College, Kodoli, Kolhapur respectively regarding refund of fees.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned Association/College/Institute and Student/Parent by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.</p>

Meeting of 30 th April 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 7	<p>Colleges/Institutes requesting to enlist with Government CET for the Academic Year 2015-16:-</p> <p>a) Letter dated 8th April 2015 received from Vijaysinh Mohite-Patil College of Nursing, Akluj, Solapur for admissions to First Year B.Sc. Nursing Course.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 8th April 2015 received from M.G.M. College of Nursing, Navi Mumbai for admissions to First Year B.Sc. Nursing Course.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 4th April 2015 received from Shree Anant Smriti Charitable Trust's Institute of Nursing, Kasal, Sindhurg for admissions to First Yea B.Sc. Nursing Course.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 11th April 2015 received from M.E.S. College of Nursing, Ratnagiri for admissions to First Year B.Sc. Nursing course.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned College/Institute by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.</p>
Item No. 8	<p>To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a])).</p> <p>a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.</p> <p>b) To consider, discuss and decide on proposals received for approval of admissions where there are discrepancies.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned College/Institute by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.</p>
Item No. 9	<p>To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.</p> <p>a) Letter dated 23rd April 2015 received from D Y Patil Dental School, Pune requesting to approve the admissions of 29 admitted candidates through the Asso-CET-2014 for the First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 along with Hon'ble High Court order dated 21/04/2015 in Writ Petition No. 11281 of 2014.</p> <p>b) Following Colleges/Institutes requesting to enlist with Government CET for the Academic Year 2015-16:-</p> <p>i) Letter dated 18th April 2015 received from KDA Nursing College, Mumbai for the B.Sc. Nursing course.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned College/Institute by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.</p>

20

Meeting of 30 th April 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 9	<p>ii) Letter dated 25th April 2015 received from M.E.S. Institute of Health Sciences, Ratnagiri for B.Sc. Nursing Course</p> <p>iii) Letter dated 23rd April 2015 received from Savitribai Phule College of Nursing, Kolhapur for B.Sc. Nursing Course.</p> <p>iv) Letter dated 20th April 2015 received from Late Pandurang Patil Nursing College, Akola for B.Sc. Nursing Course.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 2nd January 2015 received from C.S.M.S.S. Dental College Aurangabad asking for approval of admission of Dr. Chetan Dilip Zavar admitted on the basis of Govt. – NEET-MDS-CET-2013 for the Post Graduate MDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14 – Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 12/12/2015 at Item No. 8(e) (f) & (g) along with office note.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 9th January 2015 received from Post Graduate Institute of Swasthiyog Pratishthan, Miraj asking for approval of admission of admitted candidate on the basis of AICET-2014 for the Post Graduate Medical course for the Academic Year 2014-15 - Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 12/12/2015 at Item No. 8(e) (f) & (g) along with office note.</p> <p>e) Letter dated 23rd April 2015 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik regarding Non-CET admission of Post Graduate Ayurved courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 12/05/2015. Decision is conveyed to concerned College/Institute by a separate letter dated 13/05/2015.</p>

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

Item No. 3(a): To ratify the decision on circulatory submission in respect of a letter dated 12th May 2015 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to visit and observe the Asso-CET-2015, along with office note dated 13/05/2015

And

Item No. 3(b): To ratify the decision on circulatory submission in respect of a letter dated 23rd April 2015 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik regarding approval of Post Graduate Ayurved admissions on the basis of Non-CET for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with office note dated 8/5/2015.

And

DWS

Item No. 3(c): **To ratify the decision on circulatory submission in respect of a letters dated 15th, 18th and 30th May 2015 received from i) Seva Mandal Education society's College of Nursing, Mumbai, ii) Shri Yashvant Shikshan Prasarak Mandal, Kodoli, Kolhapur and iii) B.K.L. Walavalkar Rural Medical College, Ratnagiri, respectively asking for permission to enlist with Govt. CET for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with office note dated 2/6/2015.**

And

Item No. 4: **To consider and decide the following letters/representations – Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 30th April 2015 (at Item No. 9[c] & 9[d]):-**

And

Item No. 4(a): **Letter dated 9th January 2015 received from Post Graduate Institute of Swasthiyog Pratishthan, Miraj asking for approval of admission of admitted candidate on the basis of AICET-2014 for the Post Graduate Medical course for the Academic Year 2014-15 - Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 12/12/2015 at Item No. 8(e) (f) & (g) along with office note.**

And

Item No. 4(b): **Letter dated 2nd January 2015 received from C.S.M.S.S. Dental College Aurangabad asking for approval of admission of Dr. Chetan Dilip Zavar admitted on the basis of Govt. – NEET-MDS-CET-2013 for the Post Graduate MDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14 – Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 12/12/2015 at Item No. 8(e) (f) & (g) along with office note.**

And

Item No. 5: **To consider and decide the Government resolution dated 29th April 2015 regarding admission process in respect of the B.Sc. Nursing course from the Academic Year 2015-16.**

And

Item No. 6: **Letter dated 5th June 2015 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra regarding online examinations of Association CET's from the Academic Year 2016-17.**

And

DW

- Item No. 7:** **To consider and decide on the following letters received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental College of Maharashtra, Mumbai.**
- a) **Letter dated 2nd May 2015 submitting data of Second round of APGM/APGD-CET-2015.**
 - b) **Letter dated 21st May 2015 regarding Scanning process of OMS sheets of Asso-CET-2015.**
 - c) **Letter dated 30th May 2015 submitting provisional result of Asso-CET-2015.**
 - d) **Letter dated 5th June regarding Final result and Merit list of Asso-CET-2015**
 - e) **Letter dated 10th June 2015 submitting revised Merit List of Asso-CET-2015.**
 - f) **Letter dated 25th June 2015 submitting data of First Round of Asso-CET-2015 for the admissions of First Year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.**
 - g) **Letter dated 12th July 2015 regarding withheld allotment for admission to First Year MBBS course of SMT Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Centre, Nashik for the Academic Year 2015-16.**

And

- Item No. 8:** **To consider and decide on the letter dated 8th May 2015 received from Desk Officer, Medical Education and Drugs Department along with letter 20th January 2015 from Dr. Vijay Kumar Agarwal compliant regarding UG and PG admission process of Private Medical Colleges of Maharashtra.**

And

- Item No. 9:** **To discuss and decide on letters/representations received from:-**

- Item No. 9(a):** **Letter dated 9th June 2015 received from Directorate of AYUSH, Maharashtra State submitted report of Expert Committee on draft brochure of Asso-PGH-CET-2015 - Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 30th April 2015 (Item No. 6[a]).**

And

del

Item No. 9(b): Letter dated 23rd June 2015 received from Association of Managements of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra regarding approval of Asso-PGA-CET-2015 along with draft brochure for the admissions of Post Graduate Ayurvedic Course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

And

Item No. 9(c): Letter dated 13th May 2015 received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to approve the admission of admitted candidates other than Asso-CET-2014 for B.A.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with order of Hon'ble High Court Bombay in Writ Petition No. 3424/2015 dated 7/5/2015.

And

Item No. 9(d): Letter dated 11th and 13th June received from Yogita Dental College and Hospital, Ratnagiri regarding refund of fees of Mr. Prakash Ramchandra Alhat admitted in First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

And

Item No. 9(e): Letter dated 6th May 2015 received from Akhil Bhartiya Vidyarthi Parishad, Mumbai complaining against admission process of Pravara Medical College, Loni, Ahmednagar.

And

Item No. 9(f): Letter dated 20th April 2015 received from Jamia Islamia Ishaatul Uloom, Akkalkuwa, Nandurbar asking for approval for Minority CET for the admissions of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2015-16 along with Hon'ble High Court order dated 13th April 2015 in WP No. 3161/2015.

And

Item No. 9(g): Letter dated 15th May 2015 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane asking for Minority CET for the admissions of First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

And

Item No. 9(h): Letter dated 20th May 2015 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane asking approval of 04 non CET students admitted for First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 on the basis of Hon'ble High Court of Jammu and Kashmir dated 22/01/2015.

And

gm

Item No. 9(i): Letter dated 15th May 2015 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane requesting for eligibility of the students admitted in First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with Hon'ble High Court order dated 6th May 2015 in WP No. 90/2015.

And

Item No. 9(j): Letter dated 15th May 2015 received from M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Pune regarding Institute Level Entrance Test for the admission of Post Graduate Dental Course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

And

Item No. 9(k): Letter dated 28th and 30th May 2015 received from Yogita Dental College, Khed, Ratnagiri asking permission to admit students for Post Graduate Dental Course for the Academic Year 2015-16 – as a new batch.

And

Item No. 9(l): Letter dated 15th May 2015 received from Sidhakala Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Sangamner, Ahmednagar requesting for approval of admissions of Non-CET students admitted for Post Graduate Ayurved Course for the Academic Year 2014-15 along with Hon'ble High Court order dated 7th May 2015.

And

Item No. 9(m): Letter dated 14th May 2015 received from Somaiya Ayurvihar K.J. Somaiya College of Nursing, Mumbai asking permission to admit students for B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2015-16 as per the norms of Indian Nursing Council, New Delhi.

And

Item No. 9(n): Letter dated 8th June 2015 received from Y.M.T. Dental College, Navi Mumbai asking permission to admit students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of other than APGD-CET-2015 for the Academic Year 2015-16.

And

Item No. 9(o): Letter dated 3rd July 2015 received from V.S.P.M. College of Physiotherapy, Nagpur asking for approval to the admitted students for M.P.Th. course on the basis of other than APGP-CET-2014 for the Academic Year 2014-15.

And

gn

Item No. 9(p): Letter dated 14th May 2015 received Nalasopara Ayurvedic Medical College, Vasai, Thane asking for approval to the admitted students in B.A.M.S. course on the basis of other than Asso-CET-2014 for the Academic Year 2014-15.

And

Item No. 9(q): Letter dated 16th April and 10th June 2015 received from Chaitanya Medical Foundation's College of Physiotherapy, Pune asking permission to admit students on the basis of other than Asso/APGP-CET-2015 for the UG/PG courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.

And

Item No. 9(r): Letter dated 4th July 2015 received from Dr. Rajesh R. Kambe Dental College and Hospital, Akola asking permission to admit the students for the First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2015-16 - as a New College.

And

Item No. 9(s): Letter dated 20th June 2015 received from Shree Saraswati College of Nursing, Sindhudurg asking permission to admit the students for the First Year B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2015-16 - as a new College.

And

Item No. 10: To consider the letters of following Colleges/Institutes requesting to enlist with Government CET for the Academic Year 2015-16:-

- a) **Letter dated 9th June 2015 received from Ratnadeep Medical Foundation and Research Centre, Ahmednagar for B.Sc. Nursing course**
- b) **Letter dated 10th June 2015 received from Anuradha College of Nursing, Buldhana for B.Sc. Nursing course.**
- c) **Letter dated 5th June 2015 received from Oyster College of Nursing, Aurangabad for B.Sc. Nursing Course.**
- d) **Letter dated 15th June 2015 received from Terna Physiotherapy College, Navi Mumbai for M.P.Th. course.**
- e) **Letter dated 7th March 2015 received from VSPM College of Nursing, Nagpur for B.Sc, P.B.B.Sc. and M.Sc. Nursing**

rw

Item No. 11: To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).

Item No. 11(a): To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.

And

Item No. 11(b): To discuss and decide on proposals where the relation between candidate and sponsor is other than first degree blood relative

Samiti perused the above letters under references.

Samiti also carefully went through the contents of Maharashtra Unaided Private Professional Educational Institutions (Regulation of Admissions and fees) ordinance published on 12th May 2015. Samiti also went through an order for removal of difficulties issued under section 25. Respective Samiti's have been accordingly authorized to discharge their functions under sections 9 and 13. In light of these provisions; Samiti after deliberations comes to the conclusion that it was beyond the competence of the Samiti to grant or refuse permissions to hold CETs followed by CAP admissions process being conducted by various associations of colleges. However Samiti feels it proper to seek guidance / response from Government.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti resolves as under:

"Office of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, should send a communication to Government through Secretary, Higher and Technical Education Dept, M.S. and Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, asking therein the guidance/response from State Government as to whether the Samiti should proceed to ~~give~~ decide ~~as to~~ giving permission to hold CET to be followed by CAP by the respective association for the Academic Year 2015-16 as was previously being done by the Samiti or not; Samiti fees that such a permission can not be granted by Samiti at this juncture, when the Ordinance dated 12th May 2015 has come into force with immediate effects from the date of publication in the official Government Gazette.

It is further resolved to seek the response from the Government as to whether the CET's conducted by respective directorate of Government after 12th May 2015 shall be treated as valid or not in so far admissions to Private Unaided Colleges are concerned."

After receipt of the responses from the Government the adjourned meeting shall be immediately recalled as immediately as possible. This meeting thus stands adjourned.

gn

PNS(Medical)
17th July 2015

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyamtran Samiti (Medical Education) would be deciding in due course of time.

Date: '28' JUL 2015


(D.K. DESHMUKH)
CHAIRMAN