

Minutes of Meeting of the **Admission Regulating Authority (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **18th December, 2015 at 3:30 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Directorate of Medical Education and Research, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member
3. Mr. Nirmal K. Deshmukh, I.A.S. : Secretary

Smt. Medha Gadgil Member Secretary (Pravesh Niyamtran Samiti – Medical Education) and Addl. Chief Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra and Dr. Arun Jamkar, Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik unable to attend meeting.

Mrs. K.V. Sane, Desk Officer, Admissions Regulating Authority, Mumbai was present in the meeting.

Invitees:

- 1) Shri Ajit Sasulkar : Under Secretary, Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra.
- 2) Vd. (Mrs) Shradha Sude : Asst. Director on behalf of Director, Dept. of AYUSH, Maharashtra State.
- 3) Dr. B.N. Hiwale : Officer on Special Duty on behalf of Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 4) Dr. R.T. Aher : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 6th November 2015 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai.

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti - Medical Education held on Friday, the 6th November 2015 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed.

Samiti resolves that as per Maharashtra Unaided Private Professional Education Institutions (Regulation of Admissions and fees) Act, 2015 (Mah Act No. XXVIII of 2015), dated 17th August 2015 the 'PRAVESH NIYANTRAN SAMITI, MUMBAI' now known and called as "ADMISSIONS REGULATING AUTHORITY".

Item No. 2: To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on Thursday, the 15th October 2015 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 6th November 2015	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 6 th November 2015.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 23/11/2015.

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

Item No. 3: To consider and decide the following objections/representations received from the students/parents in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 - at Item No. 3.

- a) Letters dated 5/11/2015 received from Mr. Harshwardhan Sawane.
- b) Letters dated 26/09/2015 & 5/11/2015 received from Mr. Dayanand Sambhajirao Manjaramkar.
- c) Letter dated 5/11/2015 received from Mr. Nakul Dinkar Sonune.
- d) Letter dated 13/10/2015 received from Ms. Pooja Jagdish Patil.

Samiti perused aforesaid letters received from various students/parents in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 – at item No. 3.

Samiti also went through the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 - at item No. 3.

After deliberation, Samiti decides that the decision for approval of admission in disclosed in the decision. Therefore, these suggestions/objections can not be sustanse. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4: **To consider and decide on letters/representations received from :-**

Item No. 4(a): **Letter dated 21st November 2015 received from Directorate of AYUSH, Mumbai regarding admission of Sagar Madhukar Salunkhe for First Year degree course for the Academic Year 2015-16.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Directorate of AYUSH, Mumbai regarding admission of Sagar Madhukar Salunkhe in First Year degree course for the Academic Year 2015-16.

It is notice that complaint of Sagar Salunkhe dated 21/11/2015 is address to DMER, Mumbai regarding cancellation of admission and Directorate forward their views to the Samiti.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti decides that no action is necessary from the Samiti on the complaint of Sagar Madhukar, hence said complaint disposes off accordingly. Office to inform.

Item No. 4(b): **Letter dated 30th October 2015 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 29th September 2015 – Item No. 7(c) regarding permission of admission of B.P.Th. admissions other than Asso-CET-2015 for the Academic Year 2015-16.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 29th September 2015 (at Item No. 7[c]).

Samiti went through the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 29th September 2015 (at Item No. 7[c]).

It is noticed that Cut-off-date is over for all Allied Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16. Samiti therefore feels that at this stage no changes can be considered.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti decides not to approve the admissions of B.P.Th. course on the basis of other than Asso-CET-2015 for the Academic Year 2015-16. Office to inform accordingly.

9

Item No. 4(c): Letters dated 30th November and 7th December 2015 received from M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune asking permission to conduct College level Entrance Test for MDS & BDS course for the Academic Year 2016-17 (Ref.: Minutes of the meeting dated 6/11/2015 at Item No. 4[c]).

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune asking permission to conduct College level Entrance Test for MDS and BDS courses for the Academic Year 2016-17.

Samiti went through the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 6/11/2015 (at Item No. 4[c]).

Attention is drawn on the Government of Maharashtra in Act No. XXVIII of 2015, dated 12th August 2015 in Chapter I clause (2) sub clause (m).

After deliberations, Samiti directs to the M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune unless produced the notification issued by the State Government as mentioned in above Act, Samiti can not treat the aforesaid College/Institute as a Minority Institute. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(d): Letter dated 26th November 2015 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara submitted Review Application in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15/10/2015 at Item No. 3 & 4.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara submitted review application in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15/10/2015 - at Item No. 3 & 4.

Samiti went through the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th October 2015 at Item No. 3 & 4.

Samiti deliberated at length on the pointes raised by aforesaid College/Institute in the review application. Samiti seems no reason for revision. Hence Review application is dismissed. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(e): Letter dated 28th November 2015 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane asking for approval of admission along with Hon'ble High Court order of Jammu and Kashmir in Write Petition No. 2028 of 2015.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane asking for approval of admission along with Hon'ble High Court order of Jammu and Kashmir in Writ Petition No. 2028 of 2015.

It is noticed that copy of Hon'ble High Court order submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute is not readable, hence it is not possible to take decision.

In view of this, after deliberation, Samiti directs to the College/Institute to submit the clear, readable and certify full order copy of the Hon'ble High Court along with full petition within 10 days. After receipt of the same it will be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(f): Letter dated 15th October 2015 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti its meeting held on 11th August 2015 (at Item No. 14[h]) submitted the copy of order of Hon'ble High Court of Jammu and Kashmir.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 11th August 2015 (at Item No. 14[h]).

It is noticed that College/Institute has not submitted the original or authenticated copy of the order of Hon'ble High Court of Jammu and Kashmir at Shrinagar.

In view of this, after deliberation, Samiti directs to the College/Institute to submit the original or authenticated copy of the order of Hon'ble High Court of Jammu and Kashmir along with entire petition within 10 days. Samiti decides that this is last chance to the College/Institute further no time will be given, kindly note. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(g): Letter dated 7th December 2015 received from Late Shri Yashwantrao Chavan Memorial and Rural Development Foundation's Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar asking for correction in minutes of meeting dated 5/9/2014.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Late Shri Yashwantrao Chavan and Rural Development Foundation's Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar asking for correction in Minutes of meeting dated 5/9/2015.

After deliberation, Samiti approve the admission with correction in minutes of meeting dated 5/9/2014 of Dr. Pavan Pravin Kothari in as MDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(h): Letter dated 29th October 2015 received from Saraswati Dhanwantrari Dental College and Hospital, Parbhani asking for correction in Minutes of meeting dated 25/07/2015.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Saraswati Dhanwantrari Dental College and Hospital, Parbhani asking for correction in Minutes of meeting dated 25/07/2015.

gm

After deliberation, Samiti approve the admission with correction in minutes of meeting dated 25/07/2015 of Dr. Aniket Ashokrao Jogdand in as MDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 5: To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute Level for the Academic Year 2015-16 (Enclose as Annexure - A).

Samiti perused the complaints/representations received during the admission process – Academic Year 2015-16, Samiti also perused replies there on submitted by the Colleges/Institutes.

1) D.S. Naik Ayurved College, Dhule

- a) Name of the Complainant : Ansari Bibi Rahima Rizwan
- Nature of complaint : College has not displayed the selection list.
- Contention of College : Said candidate not present on time, therefore College refused to give admission.
- Decision of the Samiti : After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the explanation submitted by the College/Institute to complainant. Complainant to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.
- b) Name of the Complainant : Nikita Ravindra Patil
- Nature of complaint : College has not displayed the selection list.
- Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply.
- Decision of the Samiti : After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said complaints/representations to the concerned College/Institute. College/Institute to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

91

2) D.Y. Patil Dental School, Lohgaon, Pune.

- a) Name of the Complainant : Ansari Bibi Rahima Rizwan
- Nature of complaint : College has not displayed the merit list for vacancy round.
- Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply.
- Decision of the Samiti : After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said complaints/representations to the concerned College/Institute. College/Institute to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

3) Ayurved College & Research Center, Beed.

- a) Name of the Complainant : Kum. Bhagyashri Dilip Ubale
- Nature of complaint : Candidate admitted through CAP round and College denied admission to applicant.
- Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply.
- Decision of the Samiti : After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said complaints/representations to the concerned College/Institute. College/Institute to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

4) Dr. Panjabrao Deshmukh Medical College, Amravati

- a) Name of the Complainant : Dr. Bhaskar N. Munde
- Nature of complaint : College/Institute has admitted less meritorious students.
- Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply.
- Decision of the Samiti : After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said complaints/representations to the concerned College/Institute. College/Institute to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.



5) Y.M.T. Homoeopathic Medical College, Navi Mumbai

- a) Name of the Complainant : Shrikant Bacche
- Nature of complaint : At the time of admission for Post Graduate Homoeopathy course complainant absent due to illness, after that college authorities denied admission even seats are available.
- Contention of College : College vide its letter dated 9/12/2015 has submitted that the applicant was absent and did not submit the original documents & fees.
- Decision of the Samiti : Considering the submission of the College/Institute, case is disposed off accordingly.

- 6) i) **Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon.**
 ii) **Dr. Vasantao Pavar Medical College, Nashik.**
 iii) **A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule.**
 iv) **Institute of Medical Sciences, Satara.**
 v) **Ashwini Rural Medical College, Solapur**

- a) Name of the Complainant : Kum. Snehal Deshpande
- Nature of complaint : College/Institute admitted less meritorious students for the Academic Year 2012-13
- Decision of the Samiti : After deliberation, Samiti comes to conclusion that at this stage said complaint can not be considered, hence case is disposed off accordingly.

Item No. 6: To consider and decide on the representation submitted by the Colleges/Institutes in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 (at Item No. 4[2]) regarding rejection of claim of students admitted in 15% NRI Quota.

Samiti perused the letters submitted by the 1) Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara and 2) Saraswati Dhanwantari Dental College and Hospital, Parbhani in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 15th September 2015 (at Item No. 4[2]) regarding rejection of claim of students admitted in 15% NRI Quota.

In light of the interest of the students, after deliberation, Samiti directs the office to accept only complete proposal of the students admitted in 15% NRI Quota and submit their report before the Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.



Item No. 7: **To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).**

Item No. 5(a): **To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

Samiti perused the Verification Report submitted by office on the status of the NRI students who were admitted to Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15. Documents were verified and checked by section officer, Pravesh Niyrantran Samiti.

In consideration of the above, Samiti decides to approve admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2012-13, 2013-14 and 2014-15, the details of which are as follows:-

Sr. No.	Name of the College	Name of the Student
1	N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur MD/MS – 2014-15	1. Balpande Puja Damodar 2. Gurunihal Sing Chawla 3. Himanshu Prabhudayal 4. Jatanbir Singh Dhingra 5. Alfia Zamzam Abdul Sami
2	Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Latur MBBS - 2014-15	1. Pratik Charanjitsing Randhawa 2. Chrisy Maureen Valis
3	K.B.H. Dental College and Hospital, Nashik BDS - 2013-14.	1. Sejal Picha

Office to inform accordingly.

Item No.8: **To consider and decide on the following matters with the permission of the Chair.**

Nil

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyrantran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Wednesday, the 6th January, 2016** at 12:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.


(D.K. DESHMUKH)
CHAIRMAN

Date: 28 DEC 2015