

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **29<sup>th</sup> September, 2014 at 12.30 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4<sup>th</sup> floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

---

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member
3. Dr. Arun Jamkar : Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik (Participated through Video Conferencing System)

Smt. Manisha M. Mhaiskar Member Secretary and Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra being unable to attend the meeting were granted leave of absence.

Invitees:

- 1) Dr. P.H. Shingare : Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 2) Shri R.B. Nakve : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik

Shri P. E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. holding additional charge of Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

*dw*

**Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 5<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai.**

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti - Medical Education held on Friday, the 5<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed, subject to following corrections/modifications:

**a) Item No. 10(a) - (page No. 12) should be read as under :-**

| Sr. No | Name of the College  | Name of the Student     |
|--------|--|-------------------------|
| 5)     | Vasantdada Patil Dental College , Sangli<br><b>(MDS A.Y 2014-15)</b> | 1)Bulbule Rutul Vinod   |
|        |  | 2)Dorkar Pavan Shrimant |

Instead of ....

| Sr. No | Name of the College  | Name of the Student     |
|--------|--|-------------------------|
| 5)     | Vasantdada Patil Dental College , Sangli<br><b>(MDS A.Y 2014-45)</b> | 1)Bulbule Rutul Vinod   |
|        |  | 2)Dorkar Pavan Shrimant |

**Item No. 2(a): To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.**

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on 5<sup>th</sup> September, 2014 details of which are as below:-

*qu*

| Meeting of 5 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2014 | Actionable Points  | Action Taken by Office  |
|---------------------------------------|--|---|
| Item No.1                             | To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 5 <sup>th</sup> September 2014.   | Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 20/09/2014.   |
| Item No. 3                            | To conduct the verification process for Third round of ASSO-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order in Writ Petition (Civil) No(s). 433 of 2013 and Hon'ble High Court order in Review Petition No. 120 of 2006, Writ Petition No. 7799 of 2010.  | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Association by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014.                           |
| Item No. 4                            | To discuss and decide in respect of verification of admission process of P.B.B.Sc. Nursing and M.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 (Ref. : Government Resolution No. एनयुआर-१४१४/प्र.क्र.१२९/शिक्षण-२, dated 7/6/2014).  | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the Department by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014.                                  |
| Item No. 5                            | from Dr. Balaji Kinikar, M.L.A. complaining against Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences, Ambernath, Thane.   | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the Concern by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014.                                     |
| Item No. 6                            | Letters dated 6 <sup>th</sup> and 27 <sup>th</sup> July 2014 received from Sameera M. Shaikh complaining against Post Graduate admission process of N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur for the Academic Year 2014-15 and reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 7/7/2014 along with office note dated 8/7/2014.  | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the College/Institute and concerned complainant by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014. |
| Item No. 7                            | <p>To consider and decide on the following letters/representations received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra:-</p> <p>a) Letter dated 4/8/2014 regarding Second round of ASSO-CET-2014.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 13/08/2014 regarding admission process of P.B.Sc. Nursing and M.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 11/08/2014 regarding conduct of APGP-CET-2014 along with draft brochure for the admission of Post Graduate Physiotherapy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the Association by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014.                                 |

zul

| Meeting of 5 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2014 | Actionable Points  | Action Taken by Office   |
|---------------------------------------|--|--|
| Item No. 8                            | <p>letters/representations regarding conduct of CET-2014 for admissions to Minority Managements Quota admissions for the AY 2014-15</p> <p>a) Letters dated 1<sup>st</sup> August 2014 received from the Association of Muslim Minority's Medical Educational Institutions of Maharashtra, Pune for admissions to first year B.U.M.S. and Post Graduate Unani Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 6<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane for admissions to first year B.D.S. courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p>   | <p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the concerned Association and College/Institute by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014.</p> |
| Item No. 9                            | <p>To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:-</p> <p>a) Letter dated 5<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai regarding list of newspapers for publishing advertisement for admissions to vacant seats for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 18<sup>th</sup> July 2014 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik regarding eligibility and enrolment of candidates admitted in M.A. Rangoonwala College of Physiotherapy, Pune in first year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 25<sup>th</sup> July 2014 received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to send Observer for ASSO-PGA-CET-2014 for the admission to Post Graduate Ayurved Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 20<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Association of Management of Unaided Nursing Colleges, Pune asking for permission to admit candidates on the basis of Non-CET for M.Sc. and P.B.B.Sc. Nursing courses for the Ay 2014-15.</p> <p>e) Letter dated 20<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Sinhgad Denal College and Hospital, Pune requesting for permission to allow to admit the students from Asso-CET-2014 or any other recognized CET for the admissions of first year B.D.S. Course for the academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>f) Letter dated 5<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Seva Mandal Education Society's College of Nursing, Mumbai requesting to enlist with Govt. CET for admissions to Non Minority Quota for B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> | <p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the concerned Department and College/Institute by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014.</p>  |

| Meeting of 5 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2014 | Actionable Points   | Action Taken by Office   |
|---------------------------------------|---|--|
| Item No. 9                            | <p>g) Letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from C.S.M.S.'s Dental College, Aurangabad requesting to permit to allow to submit the admission details through online.</p> <p>h) Letters dated 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2014 and 11<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Vasantdada Patil Dental College, Sangli and K.B.H. Dental College, Nashik asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 conducted by DMER, Mumbai for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with affidavit.</p> <p>i) Letter dated nil received from Mr. Bharat S. Ladge in respect of decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 20<sup>th</sup> June 2014 (at Item No. 6[i]) regarding complaint against Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune for the admission process of AY 2013-14.</p>   | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the concerned Department and College/Institute by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014. |
| Item No. 10                           | <p>To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).</p> <p>a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.</p>  | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the concerned College/Institute by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014.                |
| Item No. 11                           | <p>a) Letter dated nil received from Bhavin Pankaj Rawal complaining against Aditya Dental College, Beed regarding cancellation of admission and refund of fees with original documents.</p> <p>b) Letters dated 22<sup>nd</sup> and 25<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to visit exam centers of APGP-CET-2014 and submitting result of APGP-CET-2014 for the admissions of Post Graduate Physiotherapy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 25<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Sancheti Institute for Orthopedics and Rehabilitation College of Physiotherapy, Pune asking for permission to admit the students against vacant seats from Govt CET for the Post Graduate Physiotherapy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 25<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Smt. Kashibai Navle College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to enlist with Govt. CET for the admissions of Post Graduate Physiotherapy Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>e) Letter dated 20<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Shri Shivaji Education Society's Amravati asking for permission to enlist with Govt CET for the admission of first year MBBS and Post Graduate Medical Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 onwards.</p> | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the concerned College/Institute by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014.                |

| Meeting of 5 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2014 | Actionable Points  | Action Taken by Office  |
|---------------------------------------|--|---|
| Item No. 11                           | <p>f) Letter dated 27<sup>th</sup> August 2014 C.S.M.S.S. Dental College and Hospital, Aurangabad asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 conducted by DMER, Mumbai for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with affidavit.</p> <p>g) Letter dated 30<sup>TH</sup> August 2014 received from SMBT Dental College and Hospital and Post Graduate Research Center, Ahmednagar asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2013 conducted by DMER, Mumbai for the Academic Year 2013-14, along with affidavit.</p> <p>h) Verification and observation report submitted by the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State in respect of admission process of Post Graduate Medical and Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14 and 2014-15.</p> | Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 20/09/2014. Decision is conveyed to the concerned College/Institute by a separate letter dated 24/09/2014. |

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

**Item No. 3: To review – Present Scenario – in respect of First Year Medical and Dental courses Admissions at Institute level after the Last Round of Asso-CET-2014 for Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the chart submitted by the office, listed in **Annexure - A**.

It is observed that Colleges Viz. – 1) Saraswati Dhanwantri Dental College, Parbhani and 2) Aditya Dental College, Beed have not submitted the details to Samiti within the stipulated time period prescribed by Samiti.

After deliberations, Samiti directs aforesaid Colleges/Institutes to submit their explanation as to why they did not submit the admission details to Samiti within the time limit prescribed and as to why their admissions after third round of "Common Admission Process" should not be disapproved. Explanations should reach the office of Samiti within a period of 15 working days. After receipt, the explanations to be placed before Samiti for its consideration.

*g*

**Item No. 4:** **To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute level for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the complaints/representations received during the admission process – Academic Year 2014-15, Samiti also perused replies there on submitted by the Colleges/Institutes.

**1) Dr. Panjabrao Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati**

- a) Name of the Complainant : Shri Arjit Durgadas Tonde
- Nature of complaint : College/Institute denied admission on the basis of Bonafied Certificate
- Contention of College : College vide its letter dated 25/09/2014 pointed out that the admission was given to the said student for first year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.
- Decision of the Samiti : Applicant having been admitted, complaint stands disposed off accordingly.
- b) Name of the Complainant : Kum. Pruthvi Arun Bhogi
- Nature of complaint : Application form was not signed by the candidate, therefore, College/Institute denied the claim
- Contention of College : College/Institute vide its letter dated 25/09/2014 stated that the said deficiency is to be rectified by the concerned candidate upto 1:00 pm on the same date, but candidate did not approach within the time to rectify the error. Therefore her application was rejected.
- Decision of the Samiti : Considering the submission of the college, case is disposed off accordingly.

20

**2) Annsaheb Chudaman Patil Mermorial Medical College, Dhule**

- a) Name of the Complainant : Pooja Gajanan Nagargoje
- Nature of complaint : College/Institute admitted less meritorious students
- Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply, but in the list submitted by the College/Institute on 25/09/2014 it is observed that the last admitted candidate in NT-3 category is having 151 marks in Asso-CET-2014 and said complainant has score of 149 in Asso-CET-2014.
- Decision of the Samiti : Considering the above, case is disposed off accordingly.

- b) Name of the Complainant : Prerana Ramdas Sonawane
- Nature of complaint : Applicant's name did not appear in the Merit List.
- Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply, but in the list submitted by the College/Institute on 25/09/2014 it is observed that the last admitted candidate in SC category is having 129 marks in Asso-CET-2014 and said complainant has score of 126 in Asso-CET-2014.
- Decision of the Samiti : Considering the above, case is disposed off accordingly.

**3) Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical College, Nashik**

- a) Name of the Complainant : Prerana R. Sonawane
- Nature of complaint : Applicant's name did not appear in the Merit List.
- Contention of College : College vide its letter dated 27/09/2014 has submitted that the applicant did not submit the application form. Even at the time of counseling she was absent.
- Decision of the Samiti : Considering the submission of the College/Institute, case is disposed off accordingly.





- b) Name of the Complainant : Shri Sidhant P. Pol
- Nature of complaint : Those Candidates who are admitted through CAP round are not eligible for Vacant Seats admission process.
- Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply,
- Decision of the Samiti : Applicant has stated that his son was already admitted in A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule in third round of "Common Admission Process" of Asso-CET-2014 for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

In view of the above, case is disposed off.

**4) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon**

- a) Name of the Complainant : Shri Vijay Kumar Shrivastav
- Nature of complaint : College denied admission to applicant, because Nationality Certificate was not produced.
- Contention of College : College vide its letter dated 26/09/2014 stated that the candidate did not have Nationality or valid Indian Passport or Leaving Certificate mentioning Nationality as per clause No. 6.1 of Asso-CET-2014 brochure and Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik letter No. MUHS/C.1/3172/2014, Dated 8/8/2014.
- Decision of the Samiti : Samiti heard Dr. N.S. Arvikar, Dean and representative of the College/Institute. He stated that the institute will call the candidate on 30/09/2014 and verify the Nationality of the student and admit him accordingly as per the merit.

After deliberation, considering the submission of the College/Institute, case is disposed off accordingly.

*SD*

**5) Dr. Hegdewar Smruti Dental College, Hingoli.**

- a) Name of the Complainant : Shri Mithilesh S. Solanki
- Nature of complaint : Refund of fees and original documents.
- Contention of College : College has not submitted its reply.
- Decision of the Samiti : Samiti directs the College/Institute to submit its reply within one week, after receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration.

**Item No. 5: To discuss and conduct the verification process in respect of vacancies after last CAP round of Asso-CET-2014 at institute level for Medical and Dental courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 - on the basis of observation report submitted by the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State as per the Hon'ble High Court order in Review Petition No. 120 of 2006 and Writ Petition No. 7799 of 2010.**

The selection list in respect of admissions done by the College/Institute at institute level after the third round of Asso-CET-2014 and submitted by the various Medical and Dental Colleges/Institutes is sent to the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai for their scrutiny and remarks/suggestions.

It is observed that report of Expert Committee is not yet received. Samiti directs the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai to verify and scrutinize the list of provisionally admitted candidates admitted by the Colleges at Institute level submitted by the various Medical and Dental Colleges/Institutes and submit their report to Samiti within one week, positively. Final decision shall be subject to the scrutiny by Samiti.

**Item No. 6: To consider the letter dated 3<sup>rd</sup> November 2014 received from Dr. Jamkar, Hon'ble Member and Vice Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik related to the issues of its powers, authority and jurisdiction in the matter of grant of Affiliations.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter submitted by the Dr. Jamkar, Hon'ble Member and Vice Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik related to the issue of its powers, authority and jurisdiction in the matter of grant of affiliations.

After deliberations, Samiti directs the all concerned Associations and all Private and Unaided Health Science Courses Colleges/Institutes to allot the candidates only to those colleges who have permission/ affiliation/continuation of their respective council, Central Government of India, Government of Maharashtra and Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik. Samiti further decides not to approve admissions of selected/admitted candidates to those Colleges/Institutes who do not have permissions/affiliations/continuation of their respective authorities for Academic Year 2014-15.

**Item No. 7:** **To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submission of 20<sup>th</sup> August 2014 in respect of a request for enlisting with Govt. CET for the admission of Academic Year 2014-15, letters dated 7/8/2014, 17/07/2014 and 23/07/2014 received from Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil Deemed University Trust, Pune, 2) V.N.S.P. Mandal's Vasatrao Naik Inst. Of Nursing, Jalna and 3) Maharashtra Inst. Of Physiotherapy, Latur.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letters received from 1) Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil University Trust, Pune, 2) V.N.S.P. Mandal's Vasatrao Naik Institute of Nursing, Jalna and 3) Maharashtra Institute of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to enlist with Government CET for admissions to Undergraduate and Post Graduate courses for the Academic Year 2014-15, said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti for the decision vide its circulatory submission dated 20/08/2014..

Samiti ratifies the decision of allowing the aforesaid Colleges/Institutes to join State CET and to follow CET rules as per Government policy, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Samiti further directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 8:** **To consider and decide on following letters/representations received in connection with conduct of CET-2014 for admissions to Minority Managements Quota admissions for the Academic Year 2014-15 and 2015-16.**

**Item No. 8(a):** **Letters dated 28<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from the M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Pune for admissions to first year B.D.S. and Post Graduate Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Pune requesting for permission to conduct own CET for Minority Quota admissions for Post Graduate MDS courses and First Year BDS courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.

Samiti observes that per the law laid down by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in its judgment in the case of Islamic Academy versus State of Karnataka (2003) 6 supreme Court cases 697 (para 16) there is no provision for separate CET for minority institutes.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti decides not to accede to the request made by the aforesaid Institute. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 8(b): Letter dated 1<sup>st</sup> September 2014 received from Seva Mandal Education Society's College of Nursing, Mumbai submitting court order and information brochure for conduct of Minority CET for B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Seva Mandal Education Society's College of Nursing, Mumbai along with Hon'ble High Court order dated 14<sup>th</sup> August 2014 in Writ Petition (L) No. 2060 of 2014 and information brochure for the Minority CET for admissions to First Year B.Sc. Nursing Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberation, Samiti feels no action was necessary at this stage from Samiti. Court orders to be obeyed. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 9: To consider and decide on the following letters/representations received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra:-**

**Item No. 9(a): Letter dated 30/08/2014 requesting to treat the copy of merit list submitted on 25-08-2014 as the final merit list of APGP-CET-2014 for the admissions of Post Graduate M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

And

**Item No. 9(b): Letter dated 10/09/2014 enclosing the data CD of Third Round of Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of First Year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

And

**Item No. 9(c): Letter dated 10/09/2014 requesting for guidelines for the admission process of Shri Gurudatta Pratishtan Nanded's Dental College, Nanded for the Academic Year 2014-15 (College affiliated to MUHS on 6-9-2014, permitted by DCI on 14-07-2014).**

And

**Item No. 9(d): Letter dated 22/09/2014 regarding admission process of SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik for the admissions of first year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letters under references. Noted.



**Item No. 10:** **To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:-**

**Item No. 10(a):** **Letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> July 2014 (at Item No. 6).**

At per Item No.6 above.

**Item No. 10(b):** **Letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik commenting upon the draft brochure of APGH-CET-2014 for the Admissions of Post Graduate Homoeopathy courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik commenting upon the draft brochure of APGH-CET-2014 for the admissions of Post Graduate Homoeopathy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti directs the Competent Authority, Association of Management of Homoeopathic Medical Colleges, Maharashtra to follow the norms, rules, and regulations laid down by the Central Council of Homoeopathy, New Delhi and other respective authorities. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 10(c):** **Letter dated 11<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Smt. Bakul Tambat Institute of Nursing Education, Pune requesting for permission to revert back to Association CET for admissions P.B.B.Sc, B.Sc. and M.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Smt. Bakul Tambat Institute of Nursing Education, Pune requesting to permission to revert back to Association CET for admissions to P.B.B.Sc., B.Sc. and M.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti grants its permission to aforesaid College/Institute to join Association CET and to follow CET rule and regulations issued by the respective authorities time to time, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Samiti further directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16. Office to inform accordingly.

*D*

**Item No. 10(d): Letter dated 1<sup>st</sup> September 2014 received from Swargiya Dadasaheb Kalmegh Smruti Dental College and Hospital, Nagpur requesting for personal Hearing in respect of refund of fees to Ms. Sanskruti Kale admitted in First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Swargiya Dadasaheb Kalmegh Smruti Dental College, Nagpur requesting for personal hearing in respect of refund of fees to Ms. Sanskruti Kale admitted in First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

It is notice that said College/Institute in its aforesaid letter dated 1<sup>st</sup> September 2014 stated that Ms. Sanskruti Kale was admitted in 2<sup>nd</sup> Round of selection process of Asso-CET-2013 on 14/09/2014 and she cancelled her admission on 23/09/2014.

Samiti observed that while approving the draft brochure of Asso-CET-2013 by the Samiti in its meeting held on 18<sup>th</sup> April 2014 at Item No. 4[c], clause (o) sub clause (i) resolve as under:-

- i) *"If a candidate cancels his/her admission before the cut-off-date, then College/Institute has deduct only Rs. 1,000/- as administrative charges and balance amount of fees paid by a student be refunded within two days, otherwise the same amount to profiteering and charging of capitation fees. The samiti further directs that the College/Institute should also return the original documents / certificates collected from the students within two days."*

In view of the above, after deliberations Samiti directs the aforesaid College/Institute to follow the above decision of the Samiti and deduct only Rs. 1,000/- and refund the entire amount of fees to Ms. Sanskruti Kale immediately. Samiti further feels that there is no need for personal hearing. Office to take necessary steps and inform accordingly.

**Item No. 11: To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).**

**Item No. 11(a):To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

Samiti perused the Verification Report submitted by office on the status of the NRI candidates who were admitted to Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. Documents were verified and checked by section officer, Pravesh Niyrantran Samiti.

*gn*

In consideration of the above, Samiti decides to approve admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14, the details of which are as follows:-

| Sr. No | Name of the College   | Name of the Student           |
|--------|---|-------------------------------|
| 1      | Terna Dental College, Nerul<br>(MDS A.Y 2012-13)                              | 1)Shashank Babel              |
| 2      | Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College,<br>Latur (BDS A.Y 2013-14)          | 1)Vaishali Vasant Jare        |
|        |   | 2)Sampada Sunil Patil         |
| 3      | SMBT Dental College, Amrutnagar<br>(BDS A.Y 2014-15)                          | 1)Surbhi Yogesh Asopa         |
|        |   | 2)Smit Pramod Mirashi         |
| 4      | Y.M.T Dental College, Kharghar<br>(MDS A.Y 2014-15)                           | 1)Akshata Jaikumar Handigund  |
| 5      | SMBT Dental College, Amrutnagar<br>(MDS A.Y 2014-15)                          | 1)Deepali Bhaskar Nipunge     |
| 6      | PDO'S NETT College of Physiotherapy, Thane<br>(B.P.Th A.Y 2014-15)            | 1)Puja Kamal Lalwani          |
| 7      | Dr. Vasant Rao Pawar Medical College,<br>Nashik(MD Pediatric(PG) A.Y 2014-15) | 1)Niravkumar Dineshbhai Patel |
| 8      | Maharashtra Institute of Medical College,<br>Latur (MBBS A.Y 2014-15)         | 1)Viraj Vinay Pargaonkar      |

Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 11(b): To discuss and decide on proposals where the relation between candidate and sponsor is other than first degree blood relative**

Samiti perused the chart submitted by the office in respect of the admissions done by the Colleges/Institutes in 15% NRI Quota and where the relation between candidate and sponsor is other than first degree blood relative.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to change the criteria for the admissions of 15% NRI Quota in Post Graduate and Under Graduate Health Science courses from the Academic Year 2015-16 onwards. In the light of the judgments of the Hon'ble Supreme Court. The Samiti proposes that the guidelines should be framed in a such a way that only those candidates who are Non-Resident Indians themselves get admission against the seats earmarked for N.R.I.'s

Considering the above, after deliberation, Samiti directs that a copy of this resolutions be sent to concerned Associations/Colleges/Institutes calling upon them to submit their views/suggestions/objections within 15 days positively to the office of the Samiti. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to take necessary steps.

**Item No.12:** **To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.**

**Item No. 12(a): To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submissions of 20<sup>th</sup>, 23<sup>rd</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in respect permission to admit the candidates from Asso-CET-2014 for the Admissions of First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, letters dated 26/09/2014, 17/09/2014 and 22/09/2014 received from Dr. D.Y. Patil Deemed Vidyapeeth, Pune and Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai, respectively.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letters received from Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil Deemed University Trust, Pune requesting to admit the candidates from Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti for the decision vide its circulatory submission dated 20<sup>th</sup>, 23<sup>rd</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup> September 2014..

Samiti observes that the aforesaid College has opted for the admissions process conducted by Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State on the basis of results of MH-CET-2014 for admissions to first year B.D.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as reproduced hereunder:

*" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".*

Samiti ratifies the said decision. Office to inform accordingly.





**Item No. 12(b): To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submissions of 23<sup>rd</sup> and 25<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in respect admission process of first year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, letters dated 24/09/2014 and 22/09/2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Satara.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letters received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Satara regarding admission process of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti for the decision vide its circulatory submission dated 23<sup>rd</sup> and 25<sup>th</sup> September 2014.

Samiti also went through the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 18<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in Writ Petition (Civil) No. 469 of 2014.

After deliberation, Samiti feels no action was necessary at this stage from Samiti. Court orders to be obeyed. Samiti ratifies the said decision. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 12(c): To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submissions of 12<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in respect asking permission to admit the students from Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 as a new College/Institute, letter dated 9/9/2014 received from Shri Gurudatt Pratishthan Dental College, Nanded.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Shri Gurudatt Pratishthan Dental College, Nanded asking for permission to admit the students from Asso-CET-2014 for the Admissions of First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 as a new College/Institute, said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti for the decision vide its circulatory submission dated 12<sup>th</sup> September 2014.

After deliberations, Samiti ratifies the decision to accede to the request made by the aforesaid College/Institute to admit the students from Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions to First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, subject to following conditions:-

- 1) Admission process should be conducted in Merit, Fairness and Transparent manner as per the directives of Hon'ble Supreme Court order in the matter of T.M.A. Pai Foundation V. State of Karnataka, (2002) 8 SCC 481 Para No. 137.
- 2) College/Institute should follow the directives, rules, regulations, norms, eligibility criteria as per the 1) Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, New Delhi, 2) Hon'ble High Courts, 3) Dental Council of India, New Delhi, 4) Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik, 5) Government of Maharashtra and Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti, Maharashtra State.

*D*

- 3) It is made clear that College/Institute having all permissions, affiliations and continuations of their respective Councils, Central Government, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik and Government of Maharashtra before admitting students for the First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.
- 4) Samiti further directs the aforesaid College/Institutes to submit the following information to Samiti office immediately.
- Seat distribution - (*Annexure - A*).
  - Copy of advertisements - (*Annexure - B*).
  - Merit list prepared by concerned College - (*Annexure - C*).
  - List of Applicant along with photocopy of applications - (*Annexure - D*).
  - List of provisional admissions granted by the College/Institute- (*Annexure - E*).
  - Names of students in Merit list but not selected - (*Annexure - G*).
  - Refusal letters from Merit Candidates, if not selected - (*Annexure - H*).
  - Any other information which could be important to assess the transparency of the system - (*Annexure - I*).

Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 12(d): To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submissions of 20<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in respect admission process of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, as a new College/Institute, letter dated 15/09/2014 received from S.M.B.T. Sevabhavi Trust, Ahmednagar.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letters received from S.M.B.T. Sevabhavi Trust, Ahmednagar in respect of admission process of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15. as a New College/Institute, said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti for the decision vide its circulatory submission dated 12<sup>th</sup> September 2014.

After deliberations, Samiti ratifies its decision to accede to the request made by the aforesaid College/Institute to admit the students in First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, subject to following conditions:-

- Admission process should be conducted in Merit, Fairness and Transparent manner as per the directives of Hon'ble Supreme Court order in the matter of T.M.A. Pai Foundation V. State of Karnataka, (2002) 8 SCC 481 Para No. 137.



- 2) College/Institute should follow the directives, rules, regulations, norms eligibility criteria as per the 1) Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, New Delhi, 2) Hon'ble High Courts, 3) Medical Council of India, New Delhi 4) Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik, 5) Government of Maharashtra and Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti, Maharashtra State.
- 3) It is made clear that College/Institute having all permissions, affiliations and continuations of their respective Councils, Central Government, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik and Government of Maharashtra before admitting students for the First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.
- 4) Samiti further directs the aforesaid College/Institutes to submit the following information to Samiti office immediately.
  - a) Seat distribution - *(Annexure - A)*.
  - b) Copy of advertisements - *(Annexure - B)*.
  - c) Merit list prepared by concerned College - *(Annexure - C)*.
  - d) List of Applicant along with photocopy of applications - *(Annexure - D)*.
  - e) List of provisional admissions granted by the College/Institute- *(Annexure - E)*.
  - f) Names of students in Merit list but not selected - *(Annexure - G)*.
  - g) Refusal letters from Merit Candidates, if not selected - *(Annexure - H)*.
  - h) Any other information which could be important to assess the transparency of the system - *(Annexure - I)*.

Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 12(e): Letter dated 23<sup>rd</sup> September 2014 received from Shri R.A. Sonawane complaining against SMBT Medical College, Nashik regarding acceptance of form for the admission of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with office note dated 23/09/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Noted.

**Item No. 12(f): Letter dated 24<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra submitting data of first round of selection process of BAMS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Noted.

sw

**Item No. 12(g): To consider and decide on the following complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute level for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

(i): **Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Sajjan Patil complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Pune.**

And

(ii): **Letter dated 23<sup>rd</sup> September 2014 received from Kum. Kamini Dattatray Sureshe complaining against 1) N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur, 2) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon, 3) Dr. P.D. Memorial Medical College, Amravati, 4) Pad. Dr. Vitthalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar and 5) Dr. Vasanttrao Pavar Medical College, Nashik.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid complaints/representations received during the admission process conducted by the Private and Unaided M.B.B.S. and B.D.S. Colleges/Institutes – after the closure of last "Common Admission Process" of Asso-CET-2014 for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said complaints/representations to the concerned College/Institute. College/Institute to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Friday, the 31<sup>st</sup> October, 2014** at 12:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.

  
(D.K. DESHMUKH)  
CHAIRMAN

Date: 10 OCT 2014