

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **2<sup>nd</sup> November, 2012 at 4.00 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of Director, Technical Education, 3, Mahapalika Marg, Mumbai - 400 001

---

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member

Invitees:

- 1) Shri. N.N. Ambhore : Joint Director, Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Government of Maharashtra.
- 2) Shri R.B. Nakave : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Science, Nashik

Shri I.S. Chahal Member Secretary and Secretary, Dr. Arun Jamkar, Member and Vice Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik were granted leave of absence.

Shri P. E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

**Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Saturday, the 28<sup>th</sup> September 2012 and 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 in the Office of Director Technical Education, Mumbai.**

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyran Samiti - Medical Education held on Saturday, the 28<sup>th</sup> September 2012 & 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Director, Technical Education, 3, Mahapalika Marg, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed.

Samiti decides that the decisions shall be communicated to the concerned Departments / Associations and the Colleges / Institutes for further necessary action through official website of Samiti.



**Item No. 2 : To review action taken by the office on decisions arrived at in the previous meeting.**

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at by Samiti in its previous meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> September, 2012, details of which are as below:-

Meeting on 28 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2012	Actionable Points	Action taken
Item No. 1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of Samiti on <b><u>10/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 3(a)	To discuss, consider and ratify the decisions taken on circulatory submission on 7th September 2012 regarding second selection list of Asso-CET-2012 for admissions to first year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2012-13.	Decision is conveyed to Respective Association by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 3(b)	To discuss, consider and ratify the decisions taken on circulatory submission on 11th September 2012 regarding institute level admission process in respect of vacant seats of after second round of Asso-CET-2012 along with email dated 10/09/2012 received from Shantanu Kale.	Decision is conveyed to Prof. Shantanu Kale by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 4	Letter dated 7th September 2012 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra regarding second provisional list of Asso-CET-2012 along with office note dated 10th September 2012.	Decision is conveyed to Respective Association by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 5(a)	Letter dated 17th September 2012 received from Association of Management of Unaided Nursing Colleges, Pune requesting to permit the admissions of B.Sc. Nursing course on the basis of MHT-CET and 12th Science pass students for the Academic Year 2012-13.	Decision is conveyed to Respective Association by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 5(b)	Letter dated 17th September 2012 received from Association of Management of Unaided Nursing Colleges, Pune requesting to permit admissions of P.B.B.Sc. nursing on the basis of Non CET and asking to permit to admit non APGN-CET candidates in NRI quota for M.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2012-13.	Decision is conveyed to Respective Association by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 5(c)	Letter dated 17th September 2012 received from Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College & Hospital, Jalgaon regarding schedule of admission process for first year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2012-13.	Decision is conveyed to Principal of Respective College by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>

Meeting on 28 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2012	Actionable Points	Action taken
Item No. 5(d)	Letter dated 5th September 2012 received from Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru Memorial Institute of Homoeopathic Medical Sciences, Amravati requesting to permit admissions of 1) Dr. Farhan Monis Ahmed Anis Ahmed and 2) Dr. Chandan Pradip Dhole admitted in Academic Year 2010-11 and 2011-12 respectively on the basis of Council norms.	Decision is conveyed to Principal of Respective College by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 5(e)	Letter dated 31st August 2012 received from Swargiya Dadasaheb Kalmegh Smruti Dental College & Hospital, Nagpur in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 28th June 2012 (at Item No. 2[c]) regarding over and above admission done in 15% NRI Quota for Post Graduate Medical course for the Academic Year 2012-13.	Decision is conveyed to Principal of Respective College by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 5(f)	Letter dated 6th September 2012 received from Kasturba Health Society, Wardha requesting to enlist with State CET for its P.B.B.Sc. Nursing and M.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2012-13.	Decision is conveyed to Secretary of Kasturba Health Society, Wardha by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 5(g)	Hon'ble High Court order dated 9th August 2012 in respect of Writ Petition No. 2500 of 2012 regarding admission of Rangoli R. Jaiswal admitted for B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2011-12 at V.S.P.M. College of Physiotherapy, Nagpur.	Decision is conveyed to Maharashtra University of Health Science & Respective College by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 6	To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process done at Institute level for the Academic Year 2012-13 (Enclosed as Annexure - A)	Decision is conveyed to Principal of Respective College by a separate letter dated <b><u>28/9/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 7	To discuss and conduct the verification process in respect of vacant seats of after last CAP round of Asso-CET-2012 done at institute level for Medical and Dental courses for the Academic Year 2012-13.	Decision is conveyed to Director, Directorate of Medical Education and Research by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 8(a)	Letter dated nil received from under graduate students of S.V.N. Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Rahuri, Ahmednagar regarding permission of the said colleges from concerned authorities.	Decision is conveyed to Under Graduate Students Batch 2011-12 of Respective College by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>
Item No. 8(b)	Letter dated 25th September 2012 received from Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College & Hospital, Jalgaon in respect of vacant seats of first year M.B.B.S. course for the Academic Year 2012-13	Decision is conveyed to Respective College by a separate letter dated <b><u>12/10/2012.</u></b>

20

Meeting on 28 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2012	Actionable Points	Action taken
Item No.8(c)	Letter dated 18th September 2012 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara regarding cancellation of admission of Ms. Jaivy Joshi admitted in first year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2012-13.	Decision is conveyed to Director, Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra 7 Respective College by a separate letter dated <b>12/10/2012.</b>

Minutes of the Meeting, 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of Samiti on 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2012.

Samiti noted and approved it.

**Item No. 3 :** To consider and decides on the Letters/ Representations received :

**Item No. 3 (a):** Letter dated 6th October 2012 received from M.F. Quraishi, Nagpur Complaining that the Constitutional Reservation was not protected by Association in respect of admission done in Private Medical Colleges for AY 2012-13.

Samiti perused the letter under reference.

After deliberation, Samiti directs that copy of the letter to be sent the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai. DMER to Submit verification and observation Report in light of contents of the letter. After receipt of the same it will be placed before Samiti for its Consideration.

**Item No. 3(b) :** Application under the Right to information Act, 2005 dated 4th October 2012 received from Ratneshkumar Jaynarayan Vishwakarma asking the Information of Medical colleges about their Admission process for first year MBBS Course for Academic Year 2012-13.

Samiti perused the letter under reference.

The description of the information required is in the form of questions. Applicant is expecting answers from the Samiti. Documents as defined under sec. 2 (2) i of Right to Information Act 2005 and those are available in the records of the establishment can be made available to the applicant, *in case he applies for the same*

21

Applicant may be provided the facilities to go through relevant record if any in the office within office hours on any working day. He may inspect and then ask for specific documents if he to desires. He be informed accordingly.

**Item No. 3(c) :** **Letter dated 3rd October 2012 received from MCE Society's M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences & Research centre, Pune regarding decision taken in the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti held on 28th June 2012. (Ref : Agenda of 28th June 2012 Item No. 6 (e) )**

Samiti perused the letter under reference and noted the contents. Vice-Chancellor of the University to opine. Matter to be taken thereafter.

**Item No. 3(d) :** **Letter dated 5th October 2012 received from Association of Management Homoeopathic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra Mumbai asking for permission to fill 12th Passed (Non CET) Students for BHMS Course for Academic Year 2012-13.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Samiti also perused Govt. letter no. MED1012/प्र. क्र. 279/12/शिक्षण - 2 dt. 30/10/2012 received from Medical Education Department, Mantralaya. However, the aspect of granting the permission to admit Non-CET students in BHMS, BAMS, BPMT does not come within the purview of Samiti.

**Item No. 3(e) :** **Letter dated 5th October 2012 received from Association of Management Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra Mumbai asking for permission to fill 12th Passed (Non CET) Students for BAMS Course for Academic Year 2012-13.**

and

**Item No. 3(f) :** **Letter dated 14th September 2012 received from MVPS's Dr. Vasantrao Pawar Medical College Hospital & Research Centre Nashik, asking for permission to admit 12th Passed (Non CET) Candidate in BPMT Course for AY 2012-13.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference

The aspect of granting the permission to admit Non-CET students in BHMS, BAMS, BPMT does not come within the purview of Samiti.

**Item No. 3(g) :** **Letter dated 11th October 2012 received from Forum For Fairness In Education Mumbai, regarding complaints of irregularities and malpractices reported during the AMUPMDC admission procedure.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference

Forum for fairness in education Mumbai, has pointed out some of the irregularities and malpractices reported during the AMUPMDC admission process in respect of following candidates :-

- 1) Miss Naheeda Abdul Rasheed sheikh
- 2) Miss Sadiya Ajaz Rawoot
- 3) Miss Supriya Mahadeo Margale
- 4) Morris Marrann Christie
- 5) Mr. Ram Mankekar
- 6) Lubna RIZWAN
- 7) Faraz Khan
- 8) Ruchi Malik.

All the complaints to be sent to the respective colleges for their explanations / remarks. After receipt of the same, the matter to be kept before the Samiti for its consideration.

**Item No. 3(h) :** **Petition dated 27/9/2012 received from Ganesh Ashok Munde against Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College in respect of first year MBBS admissions accompanied by an order passed by Hon'ble High Court in Writ Petition No. 7968 of 2012.**

Samiti perused the petition presented in furtherance of the order passed by Hon'ble High Court in Writ Petition No. 7968 of 2012.

After deliberation, Samiti decides to treat the petition as a complaint lodged with Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti.

**Item No. 4:** **Letters received from various colleges/Associations asking permission to admit Non CET Candidate in respective courses.**

**4(a):** **Letter dated 15th October 2012 received from Association of the Management of Unaided Nursing Colleges (Maharashtra) Pune for P.B.B.Sc. (Nursing) and MSc. (Nursing) Course.**

**4(b):** **Letter Dated 15th October 2012 received from Ganpatrao Adake College of Nursing Nashik. for P.B.B.Sc. (Nursing)**

**4(c):** **Letter dated 15th October 2012 received from Hiranandani College of Nursing Mumbai. for P.B.B.Sc. (Nursing)**

**4(d):** **Letter dated 15th October 2012 received from Hiranandani College of Nursing Mumbai. (B.Sc. Nursing)**

*rw*

- 4(e):** Letter dated 15th October 2012 received from Sir H.N. Hospital & Research Centre College of Nursing Mumbai (B.Sc. Nursing)
- 4(f):** Letter dated 15th October 2012 received from The Principals of Nursing Colleges Under MUHS of Mumbai. (B.Sc. Nursing)

Samiti perused the letters under reference.

The aspect of granting the Permission to admit Non-CET students in MSC (Nursing), P.B.B.Sc. (Nursing) and B.Sc. (Nursing) does not come within the purview of Samiti.

- Item No. 5 :** To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process at Institute level for the Academic Year 2012-13 along with the remarks submitted by concerned colleges.

Enclosed as Annexure – A

- Item No. 6 :** To discuss and conduct the verification process in respect of vacant seats after last CAP round of Asso-CET-2012 at institute level for Medical and Dental courses for the Academic Year 2012-13.

The report is submitted by Director, Medical Education & Research, Mumbai today. Members need to go through it. Samiti therefore decides to consider it in the next meeting.

- Item No. 7 :** Any other matter with the permission to the Chair.

- Item No. 7(a) :** Letter dated 17/10/2012 and 19/10/2012 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences Nashik and CSMSS's Ayurved Mahavidyalaya Aurangabad requesting to Approve the admission of Mandge Sachin Ashok admitted in first year PG Ayurved course for the Academic Year 2011-12. Samiti perused the letter under reference.

Samiti perused the letter under reference.

Director Ayurved to opine. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration.

- Item No. 7(b) :** Letter dated 18/10/2012 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental

*aw*

**Colleges of Maharashtra Mumbai Explaining reply of Item no. 8(c) of the minutes of the Meeting held on 28/9/2012.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Samiti observes that no grievance is made out by the student concerned. Samiti however feels that the association needs to verify the required documents of the students to ensure that only eligible students appear for the examination. With these observations Samiti noted the contents and direct to file the letter.

**Item No.7(c) :** **Letter dated 17/10/2012 received from N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Lata Mangeshkar Hospital Nagpur asking for approval of PG admissions done on the basis of Non CET for AY 2012-13. (Ref: Agenda item No. 1 Minutes of Meeting held on 16th July 2012.)**

and

**Item No. 7(d) :** **Letter Dated 8/10/2012 received from Dr. Anchawale A. Ahmednagar requesting to approve MD (Community Medicine) admission done on the basis of Non CET for AY 2012-13. (Ref: Agenda item No. 1 Minutes of Meeting held on 16th July 2012.)**

Samiti perused the letters under reference. The aspect of granting the permission to admit Non CET students does not come within the purview of Samiti.

**Item No. 7(e) :** **Letter dated 22/10/2012 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences Nashik regarding eligibility of NRI admitted candidate in Dental course for AY. 2011-12 and 2012-13.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. The university has sought the guidance on specific points. Matter to be taken up in the next meeting.

**Item No. 7(f):** **Letter dated 6/10/2012 received on 1/11/2012 from Abdul Bashir complaining that the denied the admission Dean, Panjabrao Deshmukh Medical College because of non availability of Caste Validity Certificate for AY. 2012-13.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. It is accompanied by order dated 28/9/2012 passed by Hon'ble High Court of Judicature at Bombay, Bench of Aurangabad in writ petition no. 8039/2012. In furtherance of this order complainant has presented this letter. Office to treat it as complaint against admission process followed by the said college.

*Handwritten signature/initials*



**Item No. 7(g): Report dated 5th Oct. 2012 & 23rd Oct. 2012 received from P.V.Page & Co. regarding Internal Audit for 2003-04 & 2004-2005 respectively of Shikshan Shulk Samiti and Pravesh Niyantran Samiti.**

Both the Samiti's have since their inception from time to time passed on instructions to charge/recover penalties from defaulter institutions for late submission of their Proposals. The audit of the accounts pertaining to the amounts so recovered and expended from Samiti's funds was not done so far. Office has taken the initiative and started the said work. Report for the year 2003-04 & 2004-05 is now complete and presented before the Samiti. Samiti appreciates the work.

Samiti directs to take necessary steps and complete the remaining work speedily and as early as possible.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on Thursday, the 8<sup>th</sup> November 2012 at 3:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, office of the Director, Technical Education, Mumbai - 400 001.

Date:

  
(D.K. DESHMUKH)  
CHAIRMAN