

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **31<sup>st</sup> October, 2014 at 12.30 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4<sup>th</sup> floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

---

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member

Smt. Manisha M. Mhaiskar Member Secretary and Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra and Dr. Arun Jamkar, Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik being unable to attend the meeting were granted leave of absence.

Invitees:

- 1) Dr. P.H. Shingare : Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 2) Shri R.B. Nakve : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik

Shri P. E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. holding additional charge of Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

**Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Monday, the 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai.**

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti - Medical Education held on Monday, the 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed



**Item No. 2(a): To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.**

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on 29<sup>th</sup> September, 2014 details of which are as below:-

<b>Meeting of 29<sup>th</sup> Sept. 2014</b>	<b>Actionable Points</b>	<b>Action Taken by Office</b>
Item No.1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 29 <sup>th</sup> September 2014.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 13/10/2014.
Item No. 3	To review – Present Scenario – in respect of First Year Medical and Dental courses Admissions at Institute level after the Last Round of Asso-CET-2014 for Academic Year 2014-15.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.
Item No. 4	To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute level for the Academic Year 2014-15.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes and Students/Parents by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.
Item No. 5	To discuss and conduct the verification process in respect of vacancies after last CAP round of Asso-CET-2014 at institute level for Medical and Dental courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 - on the basis of observation report submitted by the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State as per the Hon'ble High Court order in Review Petition No. 120 of 2006 and Writ Petition No. 7799 of 2010.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Directorate by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.
Item No. 6	To consider the letter dated 3 <sup>rd</sup> November 2014 received from Dr. Jamkar, Hon'ble Member and Vice Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik related to the issues of its powers, authority and jurisdiction in the matter of grant of Affiliations.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to Hon'ble Member and concerned Association by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.
Item No. 7	To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submission of 20 <sup>th</sup> August 2014 in respect of a request for enlisting with Govt. CET for the admission of Academic Year 2014-15, letters dated 7/8/2014, 17/07/2014 and 23/07/2014 received from Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil Deemed University Trust, Pune, 2) V.N.S.P. Mandal's Vasatrao Naik Inst. Of Nursing, Jalna and 3) Maharashtra Inst. Of Physiotherapy, Latur.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.

Meeting of 29 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 8	<p>To consider and decide on following letters/representations received in connection with conduct of CET-2014 for admissions to Minority Managements Quota admissions for the Academic Year 2014-15 and 2015-16.</p> <p>a) Letters dated 28<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from the M.C.E. Society's M.A. Rangoonwala College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Pune for admissions to first year B.D.S. and Post Graduate Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2015-16.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 1<sup>st</sup> September 2014 received from Seva Mandal Education Society's College of Nursing, Mumbai submitting court order and information brochure for conduct of Minority CET for B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.</p>
Item No. 9	<p>To consider and decide on the following letters/representations received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra:-</p> <p>a) Letter dated 30/08/2014 requesting to treat the copy of merit list submitted on 25-08-2014 as the final merit list of APGP-CET-2014 for the admissions of Post Graduate M.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 10/09/2014 enclosing the data CD of Third Round of Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of First Year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 10/09/2014 requesting for guidelines for the admission process of Shri Gurudatta Pratishtan Nanded's Dental College, Nanded for the Academic Year 2014-15 (College affiliated to MUHS on 6-9-2014, permitted by DCI on 14-07-2014).</p> <p>d) Letter dated 22/09/2014 regarding admission process of SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik for the admissions of first year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Associations by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.</p>

*dw*

Meeting of 29 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 10	<p>To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:-</p> <p>a) Letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> August 2014 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> July 2014 (at Item No. 6).</p> <p>b) Letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik commenting upon the draft brochure of APGH-CET-2014 for the Admissions of Post Graduate Homoeopathy courses for the AY 2014-15.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 11<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Smt. Bakul Tambat Institute of Nursing Education, Pune requesting for permission to revert back to Association CET for admissions P.B.B.Sc, B.Sc. and M.Sc. Nursing courses for the AY 2014-15.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 1<sup>st</sup> September 2014 received from Swargiya Dadasaheb Kalmegh Smruti Dental College and Hospital, Nagpur requesting for personal Hearing in respect of refund of fees to Ms. Sanskruti Kale admitted in First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2013-14.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to University and concerned Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.</p>
Item No. 11	<p>To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> October 2013.</p> <p>a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.</p> <p>b) To discuss and decide on proposals where the relation between candidate and sponsor is other than first degree blood relative</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to University and concerned Associations/Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.</p>
Item No. 12	<p>To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.</p> <p>a) To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submissions of 20<sup>th</sup>, 23<sup>rd</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in respect permission to admit the candidates from Asso-CET-2014 for the Admissions of First Year BDS course for the AY 2014-15, letters dated 26<sup>th</sup>, 17<sup>th</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> Sept. 2014 received from Dr. D.Y. Patil Deemed Vidyapeeth, Pune and DMER, Mumbai, respectively.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to University and concerned Associations/Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.</p>

Meeting of 29 <sup>th</sup> Sept. 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 12	<p>b) To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submissions of 23<sup>rd</sup> and 25<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in respect admission process of first year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, letters dated 24/09/2014 and 22/09/2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Satara.</p> <p>c) To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submissions of 12<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in respect asking permission to admit the students from Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 as a new College/Institute, letter dated 9/9/2014 received from Shri Gurudatt Pratishthan Dental College, Nanded.</p> <p>d) To discuss, consider and ratify the decision taken on circulatory submissions of 20<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in respect admission process of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, as a new College/Institute, letter dated 15/09/2014 received from S.M.B.T. Sevabhavi Trust, Ahmednagar.</p> <p>e) Letter dated 23<sup>rd</sup> September 2014 received from Shri R.A. Sonawane complaining against S.M.B.T. Medical College, Nashik regarding acceptance of form for the admission of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with office note dated 23/09/2014.</p> <p>f) Letter dated 24/09/2014 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra submitting data of first round of selection process of BAMS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>g) To consider and decide on the following complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute level for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>(i) Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Sajjan Patil complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik.</p> <p>(ii) Letter dated 23<sup>rd</sup> September 2014 received from Kum. Kamini Dattatray Surushe complaining against 1) N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur, 2) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon, 3) Dr. P.D. Medical College, Amravati, 4) Pad. Dr. Vitthalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar and 5) Dr. V P Medical College, Nashik.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 13/10/2014. Decision is conveyed to University and concerned Associations/Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 20/10/2014.</p>

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

**Item No. 3: To review – Present Scenario – in respect of First Year Medical and Dental courses Admissions for Academic Year 2014-15 - after cut-off-date.**

Samiti perused the chart submitted by the office, listed in **Annexure - A.**

It is observed that Colleges Viz. – 1) S.M.B.T. Dental College, Sangamner, Ahmednagar, 2) M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune, 3) Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur, 4) V.Y.W.S. Dental College, Amravati, 5) Sinhgad Dental College, Pune, 6) Shivtej Arogya Seva Sanstha's Yogita Dental College, Khed, Ratnagiri, 7) Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Ambarnath, Thane and 8) Aditya Dental College, Beed. have not submitted the details through "Online" to Samiti within the stipulated time period prescribed by Samiti.

After deliberations, Samiti directs aforesaid Colleges/Institutes to submit their explanation as to why they failed to submit the admission details "Online" within the time limit prescribed and as to why their admissions should not be disapproved. Explanations should reach the office of Samiti within a period of 15 working days. After receipt, the explanations be placed before Samiti for its consideration.

**Item No. 4: To consider and decide on the complaints/representations received from students/parents during admission process conducted at Institute level for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

**Item No. 4(a): Letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Atul Kaneja complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission for non availability of Transfer Certificate at the time of admission and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 30/09/ 2014 received from Atul Kaneja in respect of complaint against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission for non availability of Transfer Certificate at the time of admissions.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Mr. Atul Kanjea. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(b): Letter dated Nil received from Gore Krushnprasad complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission admitted less meritorious candidates for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated Nil received from Mr. Gore Krushnprasad in respect of complaint against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admissions to meritorious candidates for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said letter submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Mr. Gore Krushnprasad. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(c): Letter dated 29/09/2014 received from Sakshi Patil complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission to meritorious students for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 29/09/2014 received from Ms. Sakshi Sajjan Patil in respect of complaint against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission to meritorious students for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said letter submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Ms. Sakshi Sajjan Patil. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(d): Letter dated 7/10/2014 received from Vishwajit R. Gaikwad complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik admitting students who were not present for counseling and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 7/10/2014 received from Mr. Vishwajit R. Gaikwad in respect of complaint against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik admitting the students who were not present for counseling.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Mr. Vishwajit R. Gaikwad. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

*DR*

**Item No. 4(e): Letter dated 5/10/2014 received from Shahrukh Khan complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission for non availability of Transfer Certificate at the time of admission and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 30/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 5/10/2014 received from Mr. Shahrukh Khan respect of a complaint against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik denying admission on the ground of non availability of Transfer Certificate at the time of admissions.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Mr. Shahrukh Khan. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(f): Letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Sai Akhil Tarun complaining against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admissions to meritorious students for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Mr. Sai Akhil Tarun in respect of complaint against S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik in respect of denial of admission and admission of less meritorious candidates for the First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward letter the submitted by the aforesaid complainant to the College/Institute viz. S.M.B.T. Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Nashik and directs to submit the explanations within 8 days. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(g): Letter dated 16/10/2014 received from Akshay S. Suryawanshi asking for admission in vacant seats for the First Year B.H.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15 at Smt. Chandaben Mohanbai Patel Homoeopathic Medical College, Mumbai**

Samiti perused the letter dated 16/10/2014 received from Akshay S. Suryawanshi asking for admission in vacant seats for the First Year BHMS course for the academic Year 2014-15 at Smt. Chandaben Mohanbai Patel Homoeopathic Medical College, Mumbai.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter submitted by the aforesaid candidate to the College/Institute viz. Smt. Chandaben Mohanbai Patel Homoeopathic Medical College, Mumbai and directs to submit the explanation within 8 days. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

*2022*



**Item No. 4(h): Letter dated 14/10/2014 received from Ms. Prachi Bhide complaining against M.A.E.E.R's College of Physiotherapy, Pune in respect of refund of fees and original documents.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 14/10/2014 received from Ms. Prachi S. Bhide complaining against M.A.E.E.R's College of Physiotherapy, Pune in respect of refund of fees and original documents.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter dated 14/10/2014 submitted by the Ms. Prachi S. Bhide to the College/Institute viz. M.A.E.E.R's College of Physiotherapy, Pune and directs to submit its explanations within 8 days. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(i): Letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Ms. Sharwaree P. Sawant complaining against Yogita Dental College, Khed, Ratnagiri in respect of refund of fees and return of original documents and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 28/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Ms. Sharwaree P. Sawant complaining against Yogita Dental College, Khed, Ratnagiri in respect of refund of fees and return of original documents.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter dated 28<sup>th</sup> October 2014 submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Ms. Sharwaree P. Sawant. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(i): Letter dated 9/10/2014 received from Mr. Kapil Baliram Shekdar complaining against Yashwant Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Kolhapur refusing the admission because of delay in submission of fees to Post Graduate Ayurved course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 27/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 9/10/2014 received from Mr. Kapil Baliram Shekdar complaining against Yashwant Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Kolhapur refusing to admission because of delay in submission of fees for the admission to Post Graduate Ayurved course for the Academic Year 2014-15

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward letter the submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Mr. Kapil Baliram Shekdar. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

*Handwritten signature/initials*

**Item No. 4(j): Letter dated 4/10/2014 received from Ms. Prerana B. Bhide complaining against Kedari Redekar Ayurved College, Kolhapur asking donation for admission to First Year BAMS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 22/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 4/10/2014 received from MS Prerana B. Bhide complaining against Kedari Redekar Ayurved College, Kolhapur. Complaints seeking of a donation for admission because of late reporting to First Year BAMS course for the Academic Year 2014-15

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward letter the submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Ms. Prerana B. Bhide Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(k): Letter dated 23/09/2014 received from Ms. Kamini D. Surushe asking for admission in vacant seats of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 at 1) N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur, 2) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgon, 3) Dr. P.D. Medical College, Amravati, 4) Pad. Dr. Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar and 5) MVP Dr. Vasantao Pawar Medical College, Nashik and there on replies submitted by the Colleges/Institutes viz. 1) N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur, 2) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon and 3) Pad. Dr. Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar vide its letters dated 30/09/2014 and 14/10/2014 respectively**

Samiti perused the letter dated 23/09/2014 received from Ms. Kamini D. Surushe asking for admission in vacant seats of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15 at 1) N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur, 2) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgon, 3) Dr. P.D. Medical College, Amravati, 4) Pad. Dr. Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar and 5) MVP Dr. Vasantao Pawar Medical College, Nashik

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letters dated 30/09/2014 and 14/10/2014 submitted by the a) N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur, 2) Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College, Jalgaon and 3) Pad. Dr. Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar, respectively to complainant viz. Kamini D. Surushe Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. Samiti further directs 1) Dr. P.D. Medical College, Amravati and 2) MVP Dr. Vasantao Pawar Medical College, Nashik to submit their explanations within 8 days. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

*Handwritten signature*

**Item No. 4(l): Letter dated 20/09/2014 received from Mr. Mithilesh S. Solanki complaining against Dr. Hegdewar Smruti Dental College, Hingoli in respect of refund of fees and return of original documents and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 28/09/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 20/09/2014 received from Mr. Mithilesh S. Solanki complaining against Dr. Hegdewar Smruti Dental College, Hingoli in respect of refund of fees and return of original documents.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Mr. Mithilesh S. Solanki. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(m): Letter dated 26/08/2014 received from Vivek Alnure complaining against M.G.M. College of Physiotherapy, Navi Mumbai admitting open category students in vacant seats for First Year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 20/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated dated 26/08/2014 received from Vivek Alnure complaining against M.G.M. College of Physiotherapy, Navi Mumbai admitting open category students in vacant seats for First Year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Mr. Vivek Alnure. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(n): Letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Ms. Snehal Sonawane complaining against Sangam Sevabhavi Trust Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Sangamner, Ahmednagar denial admission for want of Nationality Certificate and Original documents for admission to First Year B.A.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15 and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 14/10/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 30/09/2014 received from Ms. Snehal Sonawane complaining against Sangam Sevabhavi Trust Ayurved Mahavidyalaya, Sangamner, Ahmednagar denying admission for want of Nationality Certificate and Original documents for admission to First Year B.A.M.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letter submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute to complainant viz. Ms. Snehal Sonawane. Student/Parent to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 4(o): Letter dated 7/8/2014, 26/09/2014 and 29/09/2014 received from Dr. Harsh Tiwari complaining against A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule asking for return of original documents and refund of fees and there on reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 4/9/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter dated 7/8/2014, 26/09/2014 and 29/09/2014 received from Dr. Harsh Tiwari complaining against A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule asking for return of original documents and refund of fees.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the letters dated 26<sup>th</sup> and 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 submitted by the complainant to A.C.P.M. Medical College, Dhule and College/Institute to respond thereupon immediately. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 5: To decide on circulatory submission in respect of a letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai about admissions in Sinhgad Dental College, Pune and M.I.D.S.R Dental College, Latur on the basis of Asso-CET-2014, along with office note dated 30/09/2014.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai about the admissions in Sinhgad Dental College, Pune and M.I.D.S.R. Dental College, Lagur on the basis of Asso-CET-2014 for the First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti for the decision vide its circulatory submission dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 2014..

Samiti observes that the aforesaid Colleges chose to opt for MH-CET-2014 conducted by Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai for admission to First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti directs the Colleges/Institutes to admit students from amongst the merit lists drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated accordingly mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as re- produced hereunder:

*DW*

*" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".*

Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 6: To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:-**

**Item No. 6(a): Letter dated 24<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai conveying remarks on draft brochure of APGP-CET-2014 – Ref.: Agenda of the meeting dated 5<sup>th</sup> September 2014 (Item No. 7[c]).**

Samiti perused the letter under reference and letter dated 24<sup>th</sup> September 2014 submitted by the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai

Considering the suggestions of Expert Committee on the draft brochure and after deliberations, Samiti allows the Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra to conduct APGP-CET-2013 for admission to Post Graduate Physiotherapy course for Academic Year 2014-15, subject to the following:-

- a) CET and CAP should be conducted in fair and transparent manner and as per the directives, orders, norms, rules and regulations laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, New Delhi, 2) Hon'ble High Courts, 3) Respective Council, 4) Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik, 5) Govt. of Maharashtra and 6) Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti, Maharashtra State.



- b) List of notified centers with details of seating arrangement made in each such centers and list of eligible candidates appearing for examination to be provided to Samiti. No. of seats available college wise to be provided to Samiti.
- c) Schedule of CET and CAP should be as per directives of Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, New Delhi and Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik, if any.
- d) Samiti directs the Association to declare the result of the said CET within 10 days
- e) Result of CET should be displayed on website and the notice boards of the Association. Result of APGP-CET-2014 to be submitted to the Samiti office, within two days from the date of declaration of result.
- f) Association should ensure that allotment of students to colleges is made strictly as per merit and as per the options of choices exercised. Association should also ensure that colleges submit Fee Approval proposals to Shikshan Shulka Samiti, Maharashtra State for finalization of fee structure for the Academic Year 2014-15. It should also to be ensured that allotment of students is done only to the colleges who are permitted/affiliated to Council/University for the academic year 2014-15. Association should ensure that colleges submit the list of admissions within two days form the cut off date to Samiti's office.
- g) Association conducting CET/ CAP should communicate to Samiti's office vacancy details immediately after the each round is over.
- h) The Competent Authority of the Association and / or Representatives of Director, Directorate of Ayurved, Maharashtra State will be Grievance Redressal Authority who will take care of all complaints of students/parents during CET examinations and admission process. Association should further ensure appointment of appellate authority to hear and decide and dispose of grievances against the decisions of said competent authority.
- i) All admissions to be done on the basis of CET conducted by the Associaton with the requisite mark.
- j) Association/Colleges are directed to display details of their infrastructure available on their website.
- k) Association should submit detailed information in respect of appointments of moderators/examiners their names qualifications, etc to Samiti immediately.
- l) Where seats are likely to be increased, Association to publish the details before hand in Local as well State Level News papers, notice boards and websites of association and respective Colleges also and invite/call the fresh preferences / choices from the candidates for such seats.
- m) Samiti further directs the Association to submit the following information to office from time to time without fail:-

DN

- i) No. of students appeared
- ii) No. of students qualified in the Exam.
- iii) No. of participating Colleges with subjects and their sanctioned intake capacity.
- iv) Course/Subject/category wise seat matrix of each round, before and after rounds.
- v) List of selected candidates after each round.
- vi) Details of complaints received during the process and details of action taken by Competent Authority and the Appliate Authority.

Samiti further directs, to incorporate following changes in final Rules and Information Brochure of APGP-CET-2014 as suggested by Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai listed in Annexure - A.

- 1) **Rule Refund of Fees** : The Association/Colleges/Institutes are directed to follow following in the matter of refund of fees and incorporate the same clause as follows:
  - I) "If a candidate cancels his/her admission before the cut-off-date, then College/Institute has deduct only Rs. 1,000/- as administrative charges and balance amount of fees paid by a student be refunded within two days, otherwise the same amount to profiteering and charging of capitation fees. The samiti further directs that the College/Institute should also return the original documents / certificates collected from the students within two days.
  - II) If a candidate expires within three months from the date of admission full refund shall be made after deducting Rs. 1,000/- as administrative charges.
  - III) After cut-off-date except as in (b) above no refund shall be made.

After deliberation, Samiti, subject to the aforesaid changes/conditions, grants its approval to the draft brochure of APGP-CET-2014 of Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra for admissions to Post Graduate Physiotherapy course for Academic Year 2014-15.

**Item No. 6(b): Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Mr. R.A. Sonawane requesting for personal counselling admission process for vacant seats – after CAP rounds of MBBS and BDS courses, along with office note dated 30/09/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Noted.

*dw*

**Item No. 6(c): Letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara conveying the details of admission process being followed by the institute in view of order in W.P.(Civil) 469/2014 date 25/09/2014 passed by Hon'ble supreme court of India for First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

And

**Item No. 6(d): Letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara asking for approval of admissions of students admitted under 15% NRI Quota for First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

- 1) Samiti perused the letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara conveying the details of admission process being followed by the institute in view of order in W.P. (Civil) 469/2014 dated 25/09/2014 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India regarding admissions of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014
- 2) Samiti also perused the letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 2014 received from aforesaid College/Institute in respect of approval of admissions of admitted candidates in 15% NRI Quota for First Year M.B.B.B. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.
- 3) It is seen that the aforesaid College/Institute has vide its letter dated 22/09/2014 requested to approve the schedule for admissions at institute level along with Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 18/09/2014. Samiti vide its circulatory submission dated 23/09/2014 resolved as under :

***"The order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court even if it applies requires that the students should be taken from the State Merit list and not from the merit list prepared by the Colleges. In the letter dated 22/09/2014 the College has relied on an order of the Delhi High Court but copy of the order cited has not been produced . Rather an order from of the Hon'ble Supreme Court dated 18/09/2014 in writ petition No. 469 of 2014 is filed. Permission for the schedule cited in the letter submitted by the College therefore can not be granted. "***

- 4) College has again submitted a letter dated 24/09/2014. It was also circulated amongst the members of Samiti vide its circulatory submission dated 25/09/2014. Samiti went through an order passed by Hon'ble Supreme Court dated 18/09/2014. The extract of which are as under:-

000



***"Notwithstanding any directions given in the case of Priya Gupta (supra), if undertaking as stated hereinabove are filed by the institutions managing medical colleges for the academic year 2014-15, admissions shall be given to the students from the merit list prepared by the States ....."***

In consideration of it, Samiti has resolved as under:

***"The Students can be taken from only one source".***

- 5) Samiti also went through Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 25/09/2014 in writ petition No. 469 of 2014 para 5 and 6, which run as under :

*"5. In cases where two separate lists are prepared and sent by the State agencies and relating to State quota and the other relating to management quota in private institutions, we clarify that for the current academic year there shall be only one list and that shall be the "State quota" alone. There shall not be any management quota list to be sent to the private colleges or institutions taking the benefit under our order dated 18th September, 2014. The Management quota shall also to be filled through the State list and the fees chargeable for the management quota shall also be charged at the same levels and rates as applicable to State quota list.*

*6. We further clarify that private institutions taking benefit under our order dated 18th September, 2014 shall have to take students only from the State agencies and at fees chargeable for students in Government medical Colleges as stated above, regardless of their status or claim as Minority Institutions or Deemed Universities. "*

- 6) Samiti in its meeting held on 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 - at item no. 12(b) has resolved as under :-

*Samiti perused aforesaid letters received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research Center, Satara regarding admission process of First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, said letter was circulated amongst the members of Samiti vide its circulatory submission dated 23<sup>rd</sup> and 25<sup>th</sup> September 2014.*

*Samiti also went through the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 18<sup>th</sup> September 2014 in Writ Petition (Civil) No. 469 of 2014.*

*After deliberation, Samiti feels no action was necessary at this stage from Samiti. Court orders to be obeyed. Samiti ratifies the said decision. Office to inform accordingly. "*

Considering what has been stated in the foregoing paragraphs, after deliberations, Samiti directs the aforesaid College/Institute to note the above decision of Samiti cited in **para 6** above. Office to inform accordingly.

*22*

**Item No. 6(e): Letter dated Nil received from Pad. Dr. D.Y. Patil Vidyapeeth, Pune requesting to approve the admissions of students selected on the basis of Asso-CET-2014 for the First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Dr. D.Y. Patil Vidyapeeth, Pune requesting to approve the admissions of students selected on the basis of Asso-CET-2014 for the First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti observes that the aforesaid Colleges has chosen to opt for MH-CET-2014 conducted by Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai for admission to First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti directs the Colleges/Institutes to admit students from amongst the merit lists drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated accordingly mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as re- produced hereunder:

*" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".*

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti decides not to accede to the request made by the aforesaid Institute for admissions amongst the students qualified in Asso-CET-2014. Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No. 6(f): Letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from JIIU's Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Medical College, Jalna submitting admission details of admitted students for First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15, in furtherance of order in W.P.(Civil) 469/2014 passed by Hon'ble supreme court of India on 18/09/2014.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Noted.

22

**Item No. 6(g): Letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Saraswati-Dhanwantari Dental College, Parbhani submitting an explanation in respect of decision taken by Samiti in its Meeting held on 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 (at Item No.3).**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Saraswati-Dhanwantari Dental College, Parbhani submitting an explanation in respect of decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 at Item No. 3.

It is observed that as per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 4<sup>th</sup> July 2014 - at Item No. 6 aforesaid College/Institute has not submitted their admissions details done at Institute level - after the last round of "Common Admission Process" of Asso-CET-2014 within the stipulated time period given by the Samiti of first year BDS course

In view of the above, after deliberation, Samiti decides to charge the penalty to the aforesaid College/Institute of Rs. 25,000/-. Samiti further directs the College/Institute that payment should be paid in the form of Demand Draft / Pay order in favour of "PRAVESH NIYANTRAN SAMITI, MUMBAI", payable at Mumbai. Office to take necessary steps.

**Item No. 7: To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25<sup>th</sup> October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).**

**Item No. 7(a): To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

Nil

**Item No. 7(b): To discuss and decide on proposals where the relation between candidate and sponsor is other than first degree blood relative**

Samiti perused the list submitted by office on the status of the NRI candidates who were admitted to Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14 and where the relations between candidate and sponsor is other than first degree blood relative.

Samiti went through the decision taken by it earlier in its meeting held on 27<sup>th</sup> September 2007.

After deliberation, on the basis of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 27<sup>th</sup> September 2007. at Item No. 3 sub clause 3(d) Samiti decides to provisionally approve the admissions of following students in 15% NRI Quota, subject to submission of documentary proof of guardianship before the Samiti, the details of which are as follows:-



Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student
1	Swargiya Dadasaheb Kalmegh Dental College, Nagpur (BDS For A.Y 2012-13)	1)Shruti A Prasad
2	Institute of Medical Science Research Mayani ( M.B.B.S A.Y 2012-13)	1)Amol C. Deshmukh
		2)Sanjog M. Deshmukh
		3)Kapil Rajesh Kashikar
		4)Parag Ashok Hiray
		5)Komal D. Pachangane
3	Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur (BDS for A.Y 2013-14)	1)Mhajabeen Allaudhin Shaikh
		2)Shaikh Sanan Faiyyaz
4	Y.M.T. Dental College, Kharghar (BDS for A. Y 2013-14)	1)Kapsi Sofiya Shabbir
		2)Nagani Zainab Faruk
5	MGV. KBH Dental College, Nashik. (MDS for A.Y 2013-14)	1)Lunawat Snehal Dilip
6	MGM Dental College, New Mumbai (MDS for A.Y 2013-14)	1)Vivek P.S
		2)Shaikh Saimanaaz Abdulhakeem
7	Dr. Panjabrao D.M Medical College, Amravati (MD.MS A.Y 2013-14)	1)Rphit R. Chordia
8	Institute of Medical Science Research, Mayani (M.B.B.S A.Y 2013-14)	1)Swapnil Chandrakant Shirole
		2)Wahidfajal Vallahmad Tamboli
		3) Suyog Vijaykumar Katkar
		4) Rajeshwari Shiddeshwar Devkar
		5)Chintala Nagasai Manojkumar
9	Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur (BDS for A. Y 2013-14)	1)Arbaz Anwar Shaikh
10	MGV.K.B.H.Dental College (BDS for A.Y 2013-14)	1)Mahajan Anusha Atul

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student
11	Vidarbha Youth Welfare Dental College, Amravati (BDS for A.Y 2012-13)	1)Sweety S. Nigurkar
12	NKP Salve Institute of Medical College, Nagpur (P.G Diploma for A. Y 2012-13)	1)Priti Ambadas Yadav
13	Saraswati Dhanwantari Dental College, Parbhani (BDS for A.Y 2013-14)	1)Barkule Snehal S.
14	Dr. Panjabrao D.M Medical College, Amravati (MDS A.Y 2014-15)	1)Deepa S. Patil

Office to inform accordingly.

**Item No.8:** To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.

**Item No. 8(a):** Letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Dy. Registrar, High Court of Bombay, Nagpur Bench, Nagpur in respect of W.P. No. 4051/2014 – Sameera M. Shaikh v/s Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai regarding Post Graduate admissions for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Noted.

**Item No. 8(b):** Letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Satara submitting admissions details of admitted candidates in First Year MBBS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

As per Item No.6 above.

**Item No. 8(c):** Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra asking for permission to conduct Second CET for admissions of Post Graduate Ayurved Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

And

**Item No. 8(d):** Letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> October 2014 received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to permit to admit candidates on the basis of BAMS degree holder, APGA-CET and PGA-CET for the admissions of Post Graduate Ayurved Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letters received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra in respect of admissions of Post Graduate Ayurved courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

20

After deliberations, Samiti directs the aforesaid Association to submit the following information to Samiti office immediately.

- a) List of Colleges/Institutes enlisted with APGA-CET-2014
- b) No. of sanctioned seats available – subject and category wise, college wise
- c) No. of Students Appeared in APGA-CET-2014
- d) No. of Qualified Students in APGA-CET-2014
- e) No. of eligible students who did not get admissions in Post Graduate Ayurved Course for Academic Year 2014-15 through the APGA-CET-2014
- f) No. of vacant seats - after last "Common Admission Process"

After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Friday, the 12<sup>th</sup> December, 2014** at 12:00 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.

Date: 7 NOV 2014

  
**(D.K. DESHMUKH)**  
**CHAIRMAN**