

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **5th September, 2014 at 12.30 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member

Smt. Manisha M. Mhaskar Member Secretary and Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra and Dr. Arun Jamkar, Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik being unable to attend the meeting were granted leave of absence.

Invitees:

- 1) Shri Vispute : Administrative Officer on behalf of Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 2) Shri R.B. Nakve : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik
- 3) Shri N.R. Patil : Office Superintendent on behalf of Director, Department of AYUSH, Maharashtra State

Shri P. E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. holding additional charge of Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.

DN

Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 25th July 2014 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai.

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti - Medical Education held on Friday, the 25th July 2014 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed:

Item No. 2(a): To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on 25th July, 2014 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 25 th July 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 25 th July 2014.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 5/8/2014.
Item No. 3	To conduct the verification process for Second round of Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order in Writ Petition (Civil) No(s). 433 of 2013 and Hon'ble High Court order in Review Petition No. 120 of 2006, Writ Petition No. 7799 of 2010.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 5/8/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Association by a separate letter dated 21/08/2014.
Item No. 4	To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:- a) Letter dated 11 th July 2014 received from C.S.M.S.S. Dental College, Aurangabad submitting clarification in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 20 th June 2014 (at Item No. 6[j]) regarding approval of admissions of admitted students through NEET-PG-CET-2013 for Post Graduate Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14. b) Letters dated 26 th June 2014 received from Shivtej Arogya Seva Sanstha's Yogita Dental College and Hospital, Khed, Ratnagiri requesting to permit to admit the candidates from MH-CET-2014 for the admissions of first year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15. c) Letter dated 30 th June 2014 received from Lokmanya Medical Foundations and Research Center's College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to permit to admit the candidates from MH-CET-2014 / All India PMT for the admissions of first year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 5/8/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 21/08/2014.

Meeting of 25 th July 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 5	<p>To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013)</p> <p>a) To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.</p> <p>b) To consider, discuss and decide on proposals received for approval of admissions where there are discrepancies.</p> <p>c) To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 5/8/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Colleges/Institutes by a separate letter dated 21/08/2014.</p>
Item No. 6	<p>a) Reply dated 22nd July 2014 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 4th July 2014 (at Item No. 3) regarding first round of "Common Admission Process" of Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of First Year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>b) Email dated 23rd July 2014 received from Advocate Pravin Satale asking permission to engage senior counsel for filling Transfer Case in respect of Minority cases.</p> <p>c) Email dated 2nd July 2014 received from Shantanu Kale regarding admission process of Private Medical and Dental Colleges in the Academic Year 2012-13.</p> <p>d) Letter dated 14th July 2014 received from Bombay Hospital College of Nursing, Mumbai asking permission to permit to admit candidates from Open category in reserved category and NRI Quota for the first year B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>e) Following Colleges/Institutes asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 conducted by DMER, Mumbai for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with affidavit.</p> <p>i) Letter dated 18th July 2014 received from Late Shri Y.C. Memorial Medical and Rural Development Foundations, Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar.</p> <p>ii) Letter dated 22/07/2014 received from Tatysaheb Kore Dental College, Kolhapur.</p> <p>f) Colleges/Institutes requesting to permit to allow to admit the candidates from Asso-CET-2014, MH-CET-2014 and AIPMT-CET-2014 for the admissions of first year B.Sc. Nursing Course for the AY 2014-15.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 5/8/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Association Colleges/ Institutes by a separate letter dated 21/08/2014.</p>

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

DD

Item No. 3: To conduct the verification process for Third round of Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order in Writ Petition (Civil) No(s). 433 of 2013 and Hon'ble High Court order in Review Petition No. 120 of 2006, Writ Petition No. 7799 of 2010.

Samiti perused the Verification and Observation report submitted by Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai in respect of the verification process for Third Round of Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra

Expert Committee accordingly has submitted its verification and observation report on 5th September 2014, listed in **Annexure - A**.

Samiti directs the Association to allot the candidates only to those colleges who have permission/ affiliation/continuation of their respective council, Central Government of India, Government of Maharashtra and Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik for Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti decides to provisionally approve Third Round of Selection Process of Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of first year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 conducted by Association on the basis of data CD submitted on 4th September 2014, subject to fulfillment of discrepancies as pointed out by Expert Committee. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4: To discuss and decide in respect of verification of admission process of P.B.B.Sc. Nursing and M.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 (Ref. : Government Resolution No. एनयुआर-१४१४/प्र.क्र. १२९/शिक्षण-२, dated 7/6/2014).

Samiti perused the aforesaid Government resolution dated 7/6/2014 issued by the Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra in respect of admissions of P.B.B.Sc. Nursing course on the basis of Non-CET.

Samiti went through the Government resolutions No. एनयुआर-१४१४/प्र.क्र. १२९/शिक्षण-२, dated 7/6/2014.

After deliberations, Samiti calls for the clarification from Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra as to whether said resolutions is applicable to Private and Unaided Nursing Colleges/Institutes. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Dil

Item No. 5: Letter dated 17th July 2014 received from Dr. Balaji Kinikar, M.L.A. complaining against Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences, Ambernath, Thane.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Dr. Balaji Kinikar, M.L.A. in respect of granting various permissions of Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences, Ambernath, Thane.

After deliberations, Samiti concludes that the aspect of granting permission/affiliation of Colleges/Institutes does not come within the purview of Samiti. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 6: Letters dated 6th and 27th July 2014 received from Sameera M. Shaikh complaining against Post Graduate admission process of N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur for the Academic Year 2014-15 and reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 7/7/2014 along with office note dated 8/7/2014.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letters received from Ms. Sameera M. Shaikh in respect of complaint against Post Graduate Admission Process of N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur for the Academic Year 2014-15 and reply submitted by the College/Institute vide its letter dated 7/7/2014 along with office note dated 8/7/2014.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said grievance to the N.K.P. Salve Medical College, Nagpur for their say in the matter. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 7: To consider and decide on the following letters/representations received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra:-

Item No. 7(a): Letter dated 4/8/2014 regarding Second round of Asso-CET-2014.

And

Item No. 7(b): Letter dated 13/08/2014 regarding admission process of P.B.Sc. Nursing and M.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the letter under references. Noted.

20

Item No. 7(c): Letter dated 11/08/2014 regarding conduct of APGP-CET-2014 along with draft brochure for the admission of Post Graduate Physiotherapy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra regarding conduct of APGP-CET-2014 along with draft brochure for the admission of Post-Graduate Physiotherapy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti decides that the copy of draft brochure for conducting APGP-CET-2014 submitted by Association would be sent to the Expert Committee i.e. Office of Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State for their scrutiny and comments/remarks, if any. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 8: To consider and decide on following letters/representations regarding conduct of CET-2014 for admissions to Minority Managements Quota admissions for the Academic Year 2014-15

Item No. 8(a): Letters dated 1st August 2014 received from the Association of Muslim Minority's Medical Educational Institutions of Maharashtra, Pune for admissions to first year B.U.M.S. and Post Graduate Unani Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Association of Muslim Minority's Medical Educational Institutions of Maharashtra, Pune requesting for permission to conduct CET for Minority Quota admissions for First Year B.U.M.S. and Post Graduate Unani courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti observes that per the law laid down by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in its judgment in the case of Islamic Academy versus State of Karnataka (2003) 6 supreme Court cases 697 (para 16) there is no provision for separate CET for minority institutes.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti decides not to accede to the request made by the aforesaid Institute. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 8(b): Letter dated 6th August 2014 received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane for admissions to first year B.D.S. courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Shaan Education Society's Guardian College of Dental Sciences and Research Center, Thane requesting for a permission to conduct CET for Minority Quota admissions for First Year B.D.S. courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti observes that per the law laid down by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in its judgment in the case of Islamic Academy versus State of Karnataka (2003) 6 supreme Court cases 697 (para 16) there is no provision for separate CET for minority institutes.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti decides not to accede to the request made by the aforesaid Institute. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 9: To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:-

Item No. 9(a): Letter dated 5th August 2014 received from Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai regarding list of newspapers for publishing advertisement for admissions to vacant seats for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai regarding names of newspapers for publishing advertisement for admission process of vacant seats – after last "Common Admission Process" for M.B.B.S. and B.D.S. courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

As per the Hon'ble High Court order in writ petition No. 7799 of 2010 - para no. 39 the Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State has informed the names of five newspapers viz. - 1) Daily Loksatta, 2) Daily Lokmat, 3) Daily Pudhari, 4) Daily Times of India and 5) Daily Indian Express for publishing the advertisement in the news papers for admission process of in the case of vacancy arises after the last "Common Admission Process" rounds conducted by Asso-CET-2014 for the M.B.B.S. and B.D.S. courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

In view of the above and with reference to decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 4th July 2014 - Item No. 6 clause (A) sub clause (b) Samiti hereby directs the Competent Authority, Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra and all Private and Unaided M.B.B.S. and B.D.S. Colleges/Institutes (Except those Colleges/Institutes who joined admission process of MHT-CET-2014 – conducted by Directorate of Medical Education and Research, M.S.) to publish the vacancy position, if any vacancy arises after the last "Common Admission Process" rounds conducted by Asso-CET-2014 in the five news papers viz. - 1) Daily Loksatta, 2) Daily Lokmat, 3) Daily Pudhari, 4) Daily Times of India and 5) Daily Indian Express, as suggested by Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State, strictly without fail. Office to take necessary steps.



Item No. 9(b): Letter dated 18th July 2014 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik regarding eligibility and enrolment of candidates admitted in M.A. Rangoonwala College of Physiotherapy, Pune in first year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of approval of admissions of selected candidates in first year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2013-14 on the basis of CET conducted M.A. Rangoonwala College of Physiotherapy, Pune

Samiti went through the decision taken in its held on 15th March 2013 (at item No. 4(a) & 4(b) has resolved as under :-

"Samiti perused the letters under reference.

In view of there being no provision for Separate CET for Minority Quota Admissions, request of the aforesaid College/Institute to conduct CET for Minority Quota admissions for the Academic Year 2013-14 is rejected."

University to note the above. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 9(c): Letter dated 25th July 2014 received from Association of Management of Ayurvedic Medical Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to send Observer for ASSO-PGA-CET-2014 for the admission to Post Graduate Ayurved Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Noted.

Item No. 9(d): Letter dated 20th August 2014 received from Association of Management of Unaided Nursing Colleges, Pune asking for permission to admit candidates on the basis of Non-CET for M.Sc. and P.B.B.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Association of Management of Unaided Nursing Colleges, Pune asking for a permission to admit students on the basis of Non-CET for M.Sc. and P.B.B.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti concludes that the aspect of granting the permission to admit Non-CET students does not come within the purview of Samiti. Office to inform accordingly.

al

Item No. 9(e): Letter dated 20th August 2014 received from Sinhgad Dental College and Hospital, Pune requesting for permission to allow to admit the students from Asso-CET-2014 or any other recognized CET for the admissions of first year B.D.S. Course for the academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Sinhgad Dental College and Hospital, Pune requesting to permit to allow to admit the candidates from Asso-CET-2014 or any other recognized CET for the admissions of first year B.D.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti observes that the aforesaid College has opted for the admissions process conducted by Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State on the basis of results of MH-CET-2014 for admissions to first year B.D.S. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as reproduced hereunder:

" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".

Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 9(f): Letter dated 5th August 2014 received from Seva Mandal Education Society's College of Nursing, Mumbai requesting to enlist with Govt. CET for admissions to Non Minority Quota for B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Seva Mandal Education Society's College of Nursing, Mumbai requesting for permission to enlist it with Govt. CET for admissions to Non Minority Quota for B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

sw

Samiti make it clear that per the law laid down by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India in its judgment in the case of Islamic Academy versus State of Karnataka (2003) 6 supreme Court cases 697 (para 16) there is no provision for separate CET for minority institutes.

Samiti further directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as re- produced hereunder:

" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".

Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 9(g): Letter dated 4th August 2014 received from C.S.M.S.S's Dental College, Aurangabad requesting to permit to allow to submit the admission details through online.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from C.S.M.S.S.'s Dental College, Aurangabad requesting to permit to allow to submit the admission details through online.

After deliberation, Samiti accede to the request made by the College/Institute and permits to submit the admission details of Post Graduate Dental Courses for the academic Year 2014-15 through online. Office to inform accordingly.

pw

Item No. 9(h): Letters dated 2nd August 2014 and 11th August 2014 received from Vasantdada Patil Dental College, Sangli and K.B.H. Dental College, Nashik asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 conducted by DMER, Mumbai for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with affidavit.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Vasantdada Patil Dental College, Sangli and K.B.H. Dental College, Nashik asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 conducted by Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with affidavit.

It is observed that the affidavit submitted by the aforesaid Colleges/Institutes is incomplete and does not cover all requisite points.

In view of these, after deliberations, Samiti directs the aforesaid Colleges/Institute to submit an affidavit explaining therein on following points along with all admission details.

- a) That the list of candidates qualified from the APGD-CET-2014 is exhausted, Therefore, College/Institute requested Samiti for permission to admit candidate from another CET.
- b) Sufficient advertisements for filling in vacant seats was also given in leading newspapers and was published on website as well as notice board (Dates and names of news papers to be given)
- c) That no meritorious candidates of APGD-CET-2014 were denied admissions.
- d) That no candidate of APGD-CET-2014 has filed any complaint against College for Post Graduate admissions.

Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 9(i): Letter dated nil received from Mr. Bharat S. Ladge in respect of decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 20th June 2014 (at Item No. 6[i]) regarding complaint against Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune for the admission process of Academic Year 2013-14.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received Mr. Bharat S. Ladge in respect of decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 20th June 2014 (at Item No. 6[i]) regarding complaint against Smt. Kahibai Navle Medical College, Pune for the Academic Year 2013-14.

It is observed that Smt. Kashibai Navle Medical College, Pune vide its letter dated 6/11/2013 has stated that Kum. Anushka Bharat Ladge was absent at the time of personal counseling After coming late also she did not have original documents. Applicant Shri Bharat Ladge also admits that he was late.



In view of the above, considering the submission of the college/Institute as well as of applicant, case is disposed off accordingly. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 10: To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).

Item No. 10(a):To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.

Samiti perused the Verification Report submitted by office on the status of the NRI candidates who were admitted to Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. Documents were verified and checked by section officer, Pravesh Niyrantran Samiti.

In consideration of the above, Samiti decides to approve admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14, the details of which are as follows:-

Sr. No.	Name of the College	Name of the Student
1)	Y.M.T Dental College , Navi Mumbai (MDS, A.Y 2012-13)	1)D'costa Osric Newton
2)	Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmenagar, (MD. MS A.Y 2013-14)	1)Sandip Patel
3)	SMBT Dental College, Sangamner. (BDS A.Y 2013-14)	1)Rehmmat Ara
4)	Y.C.M Dental College, Ahmadnagar (BDS A.Y 2013-14)	1)Pavan Pravin Kothari
5)	Vasantdada Patil Dental College , Sangli (MDS A.Y 2014-45)	1)Bulbule Rutul Vinod
		2)Dorkar Pavan Shrimant
6)	SMBT Dental College, Sangamner. (MDS A.Y 2014-15)	1)Giri Neha Vishnu

90

Sr. No.	Name of the College	Name of the Student
7)	Dr. Vasant Rao Pawar Medical College, Nashik (MD.MS A.Y 2014-15)	1) Meetali Mukund Khairnar
		2) Davay Minal Yogendra
		3) Pawar Aniket Chandrasingh
		4) Shah Maiyri Amitkumar
		5) Achala Ghanashyam Kamath
8)	Dr. Panjabrav Alias Bhausahab Deshmukh Medical College, Amravati (FY MBBS 2013-14)	1) Rupali Chordia
		2) Patel Jawaidullah Khan
9)	Dr. Vithalrao Vikhe Patil Medical College, Ahmednagar (MD.MS for A.Y 2014-15)	1) Jariwala Nikhil Naresh
10)	Saraswati Dhanwantari Dental College, Parbhani (BDS for A.Y 2012-13)	1) Kalyani K. Kawale
11)	Sirhgad Dental College, Pune (BDS for A.Y 2012-13)	1) Medha Dubal
		2) Patil Pushkar
		3) Aman Raj
12)	Tatyasaheb Kore Dental College, Kolpure (MDS 2013-14)	1) Saisravan Dandapani

900

Sr. No.	Name of the College	Name of the Student
13)	M.A. Rangoonwala Dental College, Pune (BDS for A.Y 2012-13)	1)Aliyah Muhammed Murtaza
		2)Sima Mohammed Murtaza
		3)Khan Ruhani
		4)Jambughodawala Maria Shabbir
		5) Bhargava Hemakshi Manish
		6) Radhika Shivaji Jadhav
		7) Anoli Sandip Agarwal
14)	SMBT Dental College, Sangamner (MDS for 2013-14)	1)Pooja Pradip Gunjal
15)	SMBT Dental College, Sangamner (BDS for 2013-14)	1)Keshwani Karuna
		2) Mallick Sana Iftakhar
16)	SMBT Dental College, Sangamner (BDS for 2012-13)	1)Dodal Prija

Item No. 10(b): To discuss and decide on proposals where the relation between candidate and sponsor is other than first degree blood relative

Samiti decide to consider the matter in the next meeting.

gwd

Item No.11: **To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.**

Item No. 11(a) : **Letter dated nil received from Bhavin Pankaj Rawal complaining against Aditya Dental College, Beed regarding cancellation of admission and refund of fees with original documents.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received Bhavin Pankaj Rawal complaint against Aditya Dental College, Beed regarding cancellation of admission and refund of fees with original documents.

After deliberations, Samiti decides to forward the said letter to the Aditya Dental College, Beed. College/Institute to respond thereupon. After receipt of the same it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 11(b): **Letters dated 22nd and 25th August 2014 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra requesting to visit exam centers of APGP-CET-2014 and submitting result of APGP-CET-2014 for the admissions of Post Graduate Physiotherapy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the letter under reference. Noted.

Item No. 11(c): **Letter dated 25th August 2014 received from Sancheti Institute for Orthopedics and Rehabilitation College of Physiotherapy, Pune asking for permission to admit the students against vacant seats from Govt CET for the Post Graduate Physiotherapy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received Sancheti Institute of Orthopedics and Rehabilitation College of Physiotherapy, Pune asking for permission to admit the students against vacant seats from Govt. CET for the Post Graduate Physiotherapy Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti observes that the aforesaid College has opted for the admissions process conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra on the basis of results of APGP-CET-2014 for admissions to Post Graduate Physiotherapy courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

RD

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti directs the College to admit students from amongst the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as reproduced hereunder:

" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".

Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 11(d): Letter dated 25th August 2014 received from Smt. Kashibai Navle College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to enlist with Govt. CET for the admissions of Post Graduate Physiotherapy Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Smt. Kashibai Navle College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to enlist it with Govt. CET for the admissions of Post Graduate Physiotherapy courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti grants its permission to aforesaid College/Institute to join State CET and to follow CET rules as per Government policy, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Samiti further directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET i.e. PGP-CET-2014 as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16. Samiti ratifies the said decision. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 11(e): Letter dated 20th August 2014 received from Shri Shivaji Education Society's Amravati asking for permission to enlist with Govt CET for the admission of first year MBBS and Post Graduate Medical Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15 onwards.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Shri Shivaji Education Society's, Amravati asking for permission to enlist with Govt. CET for the admissions of first year M.B.B.S. and Post Graduate Medical courses for the Academic Year 2015-16 onwards.

Samiti grants its permission to aforesaid College/Institute to join State CET and to follow CET rules as per Government policy, subject to final approval/affiliation/permissions from respective Authorities. Samiti further directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16. Samiti ratifies the said decision. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 11(f): Letter dated 27th August 2014 C.S.M.S.S. Dental College and Hospital, Aurangabad asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 conducted by DMER, Mumbai for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with affidavit.

And

Item No. 11(g): Letter dated 30th August 2014 received from SMBT Dental College and Hospital and Post Graduate Research Center, Ahmednagar asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2013 conducted by DMER, Mumbai for the Academic Year 2013-14, along with affidavit.

As per at Item No.9(h) above.

Item No. 11(h): Verification and observation report submitted by the Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State in respect of admission process of Post Graduate Medical and Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14 and 2014-15.

Samiti perused the report under reference.

MD

PNS(Medical)
5th September 2014

After deliberation Samiti decides that, where there are no discrepancies such admissions stand approved, where there are discrepancies such admissions are approved, subject to the Expert Committee sorting out and disposing off with said discrepancies after appropriate compliances within four weeks from respective Institutions for Academic Year 2013-14 and 2014-15, the details which are enclosed as **Annexure - B.**

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Monday, the 29th September, 2014** at 12:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.

Date:

17 SEP 2014


(D.K. DESHMUKH)
CHAIRMAN