

Minutes of Meeting of the **Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education)** held under the **Chairmanship of Justice D.K. Deshmukh (Retd.)** on Friday, the **25th July, 2014 at 12.30 p.m.** in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, 4th floor, Government Dental College Building, St. Georges Hospital Campus, Near CST, Fort, Mumbai - 400 001

Following Members and Officers were present:

1. Dr. Ravi Bapat : Member
2. Dr. M.S. Kekre : Member
3. Dr. Arun Jamkar : Member and Vice-Chancellor, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik (Participated through Video Conferencing System)

Smt. Manisha M. Mhaiskar Member Secretary and Secretary Medical Education and Drugs Department, Government of Maharashtra being unable to attend the meeting were granted leave of absence.

Invitees:

- 1) Dr. P.R. Raikar : Officer on Special Duty on behalf of Director, Medical Education and Research, Maharashtra State
- 2) Shri R.B. Nakve : Asst. Registrar on behalf of Registrar, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik
- 3) Shri N.R. Patil : Office Superintendent on behalf of Director, Department of AYUSH, Maharashtra State

Shri P. E. Gaikwad, I.A.S. holding additional charge of Office Secretary, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Mrs. K.V. Sane. Desk Officer, Pravesh Niyantran Samiti, Mumbai was present.

Copies of Agenda along with copies of the relevant documents were circulated to the Members.



Item No. 1: To approve and confirm Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti (Medical Education) held on Friday, the 4th July 2014 in the Conference Hall office of the Regional Center, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai.

Minutes of the Meeting of Pravesh Niyantran Samiti - Medical Education held on Friday, the 4th July 2014 in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre, Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai - 400 001 are approved and confirmed:

Item No. 2(a): To review action taken by office on decisions arrived at in the previous meetings.

Samiti perused the action taken report on the decisions arrived at in its previous meeting held on 4th July, 2014 details of which are as below:-

Meeting of 4th July 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No.1:	To convey the approval and confirmation of the Minutes of the Samiti dated 4 th July 2014.	Minutes of Meeting are displayed on the Website and Notice Board of the Samiti on 10/07/2014.
Item No. 3	To conduct the verification process for first round of Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra – letter dated 26 th June 2014 received from Association submitting data of First Round.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 10/07/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Association by a separate letter dated 7/7/2014 and 17/07/2014.
Item No. 4	To consider and decide on the Government resolution dated 13 th June 2014 in respect of admission of B.Sc. Nursing course done on the basis of MT-CET for the Academic Year 2013-14.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 10/07/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Department by a separate letter dated 7/7/2014 and 17/07/2014.
Item No. 5	To discuss, decide and plan for the verification of admission process in Health Science courses for Academic Year 2014-15.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 10/07/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Directorate/University /Association/ Colleges by a separate letter dated 17/07/2014.

DS

Meeting of 4th July 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 6	To discuss and decide norms in respect of admission process – after the closure of "Common Admission Process" for the Academic Year 2014-15.	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 10/07/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Directorate/ Association/ Colleges by a separate letter dated 17/07/2014.
Item No. 7	<p>To consider and decide following letters/representations requesting to enlist with Govt. CET for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>a) Letter dated 23rd June 2014 received from M.I.M.E.R. Medical College, Pune for admissions to Post Graduate Medical Course.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 16th June 2014 received from L.M.F. College of Physiotherapy, Pune for admissions to First Year B.P.Th. Course.</p>	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 10/07/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Directorate/ Association/ Colleges by a separate letter dated 17/07/2014.
Item No. 8	<p>a) Letter dated 2nd July 2014 received from N.K.P. Salve Institute of Medical Sciences and Lata Mangeshkar Hospital, Nagpur submitting clarification in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 20th June 2014 (at Item No. 6[j]) regarding approval of admissions of admitted students through NEET-PG-CET-2013 for Post Graduate Medical Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14.</p> <p>b) Letter dated 2nd July 2014 received from Post Graduate Institute of Swasthiyog Pratishthan, Miraj asking to permission to admit the candidates from PGM-CET-2014 or AICET2014 for admissions to Post Graduate Medical courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>c) Letter dated 30th June 2014 received from various students complaining against the Guardian Dental College, Thane regarding refuse to admit the students selected through the first round of Asso-CET-2014 for First Year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p>	Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 10/07/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Directorate/ Association/ Colleges by a separate letter dated 17/07/2014.

Meeting of 4 th July 2014	Actionable Points	Action Taken by Office
Item No. 8	<p>d) Letter dated 4th July 2014 received from Dr. Salve Institute of Nursing, Gadchiroli requesting to enlist with Government CET for admissions to First Year B.Sc. Nursing Course for the Academic Year 2014-15.</p> <p>e) Letter dated 30th June 2014 received from Directorate of AYUSH, Maharashtra State regarding remarks on draft brochure of APGA-CET-2014 : Ref.- Agenda of the Meeting dated 20th June 2014 (at Item No. 8[d]).</p> <p>f) Letter dated 3rd July 2014 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik asking guidelines in respect of approval of admissions of M.Sc. Nursing, P.B.Sc. Nursing and B.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2012-13 along with Government resolution ,u;qvkj&1414\$iz-dz-25\$14\$f{k{k.k&2] dated 2nd July 2014.</p> <p>g) Letter dated 26th June 2014 received from Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik regarding observation report in respect of admission process of Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14.</p>	<p>Decision of the Samiti is displayed on the website and notice board on 10/07/2014. Decision is conveyed to concerned Directorate/ Association/Colleges by a separate letter dated 17/07/2014.</p>

Samiti noted and approved the action of the office.

Item No. 3: To conduct the verification process for Second round of Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order in Writ Petition (Civil) No(s). 433 of 2013 and Hon'ble High Court order in Review Petition No. 120 of 2006, Writ Petition No. 7799 of 2010.

Samiti perused the Verification and Observation report submitted by Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai in respect of the verification process for Second Round of Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra

Expert Committee accordingly has submitted its verification and observation report on 25th July 2014, listed in **Annexure - A.**

DN

Samiti directs the Association to allot the candidates only to those colleges who have permission/ affiliation/continuation of their respective council, Central Government of India, Government of Maharashtra and Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik for Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti decides to provisionally approve Second Round of Selection Process of Asso-CET-2014 for the Academic Year 2014-15 conducted by Association, subject to fulfillment of discrepancies as pointed out by Expert Committee. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4: To consider and decide on letters/representations received from:-

Item No. 4(a): Letter dated 11th July 2014 received from C.S.M.S.S. Dental College, Aurangabad submitting clarification in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 20th June 2014 (at Item No. 6[j]) regarding approval of admissions of admitted students through NEET-PG-CET-2013 for Post Graduate Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from C.S.M.S.S.'s Dental College, Aurangabad submitting clarification in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 20th June 2014 (at Item No. 6[j]) regarding approval of admission of admitted students through NEET-PG-CET-2013 for Post Graduate Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2013-14 along with affidavit.

It is noticed that said affidavit is not notarized or verified before an Executive Magistrate. After deliberation, Samiti directs the aforesaid College/Institute to submit the affidavit properly. After receipt of the same it will be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(b): Letters dated 26th June 2014 received from Shivtej Arogya Seva Sanstha's Yogita Dental College and Hospital, Khed, Ratnagiri requesting to permit to admit the candidates from MH-CET-2014 for the admissions of first year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Shivtej Arogya Seva Sanstha's Yogita Dental College and Hospital, Khed, Ratnagiri requesting to permit to admit the candidates from MH-CET-2014 for the admissions of first year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti observes that the aforesaid Colleges has chosen to opt for Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra for admission to first year BDS course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

am

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as reproduced hereunder:

" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".

Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 4(c): Letter dated 30th June 2014 received from Lokmanya Medical Foundations and Research Center's College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to permit to admit the candidates from MH-CET-2014 / All India PMT for the admissions of first year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Lokmanya Medical Foundations and Research Center's College of Physiotherapy, Pune requesting to permit to admit the candidates from MH-CET-2014 / All India PMT for the admissions of first year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti observes that the aforesaid Colleges has chosen to opt for Asso-CET-2014 conducted by Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra for admission to first year B.P.Th. course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

In view of the above, after deliberations, Samiti directs the College to admit students from the merit list drawn on the basis of results of only one CET as contemplated and mandated by Hon'ble Supreme Court of India is (2003) 6 Supreme Court cases 697 Islamic Academy of Education v. State of Karnataka Para No. 16 as reproduced hereunder:

gW

" We thus hold that the management could select students, of their quota, either on the basis of the common entrance test conducted by the State or on the basis of a common entrance test to be conducted by an association of all colleges of a particular type in that State e.g. medical, engineering or technical etc. The common entrance test, held by the association, must be for admission to all colleges of that type in the State. The option of choosing, between either of these tests, must be exercised before issuing of prospectus and after intimation to the concerned authority and the Committee set up hereinafter. If any professional college chooses not to admit from the common entrance test conducted by the association then that college must necessarily admit from the common entrance test conducted by the State. After holding the common entrance test and declaration of results the merit list will immediately be placed on the notice-board of all colleges which have chosen to admit as per this test. A copy of the merit list will also be forthwith sent to the concerned authority and the Committee. Selection of students must then be strictly on the basis of merit as per that merit List".

Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 5: **To review - admissions in 15% NRI Quota for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. (Ref.: As per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 25th October 2013 (at Item No. 9[a]).**

Item No. 5(a): **To consider and decide on proposals where there are no discrepancies.**

Samiti perused the Verification Report submitted by office on the status of the NRI candidates who were admitted to Post Graduate and Under Graduate courses in Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14. Documents were verified and checked by section officer, Pravesh Niyrantran Samiti.

In consideration of the above, Samiti decides to approve admissions of the following NRI candidates for the Academic Year 2012-13 and 2013-14, the details of which are as follows:-

Sr. No.	Name of the College	Name of the Student
1)	Y.M.T Dental College , Navi Mumbai MDS, A.Y 2012-13	1)Maggi Johny Vettiyatil
		2)Zope Sameer Ramesh
2)	Saraswati Dhanwantari Dental College, Purbhani, BDS, A.Y 2013-14	1)Aniket Ashokrao Jogdand
		2)Satyam Madhukar Karle

an

Sr. No.	Name of the College	Name of the Student
3)	Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapure, BDS, A.Y 2013-14	1) Dhanshree Bhalchandra More
		2) Kale Apeksha Dilip
		3) Bobade Padmaja Tanaji
		4) Sabah Sajid Qazi
4)	Vasantdada Patil Dental College, Sangli BDS, A.Y 2013-14	1) Parab Sidharth Babu
		2) Raut Shivaratna Pandit
		3) Deshpande Swamini Ratnakar
		4) Pore Aishwarya Kedar
5)	Maharashtra Institute of Medical College, Latur, MD.MS A.Y 2014-15	1) Ekam Chaturbhuj Gupta
		2) Mashayak Sikandar Yusufoddin
		3) Sriteja Devalla
6)	Pandit Deendayal Upadhyay Dental College, Solapur. MDS A.Y 2014-15	1) Wagaj Harshad Dilip
7)	Maharashtra Institute of Dental College, Latur, MDS. Orthodontics A.Y 2014-15	1) Kendre Shilpa Mahadev

Item No. 5(b): To consider, discuss and decide on proposals received for approval of admissions where there are discrepancies.

After deliberations, Samiti decides **not to approve** admissions of following candidate as the respective Colleges/Institutes have not submitted the requisite documents to the satisfaction of the claim of the candidates as NRI, the details of which are as follows:

Sr. No	Name of the College	Name of the Student	Remarks	To Prove the status following document are required
1	Maharashtra Institute of Dental College, Latur (MDS Course for AY 2014-15)	1) Pathan Mariyam Layakali Khan	Relation between candidate & Sponsors is not proved.	1) Candidate Mother's PAN Card/ Marriage Certificate/ Card

Samiti further directs the Colleges/Institutes to comply with the requirements within four weeks to Samiti for approval of NRI admissions failing which admissions are liable to be disapproved.

Item No. 5(c): To consider and decide on proposals under scrutiny of the office.

Office to scrutinize and place the proposals before Samiti in due course.

dw

Item No.6: **To consider and decide on the following matter with the permission of the Chair.**

Item No. 6(a): **Reply dated 22nd July 2014 received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra in respect of the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 4th July 2014 (at Item No. 3) regarding first round of "Common Admission Process" of Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of First Year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges of Maharashtra in respect of the first round of "Common Admission Process" of Asso-CET-2014 for the admissions of First Year Health Science Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti also went through the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 4th July 2014 (at Item No. 3).

It is noticed that as per the decision taken by the Samiti in its meeting held on 4th July 2014 (at Item No.3) Association needs to submit its explanation in the form of affidavit, but said Association failed to submit its explanation in the form of affidavit. Samiti directs Association to submit its explanation in this respect as to why it did not submit affidavit as per the directions of the Samiti in its meeting held on 4th July 2014 (at Item No. 3).

Decision taken by the Samiti on 4th July 2014 is based on the observation of Expert Committee i.e. Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai and Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik.

In view of the above, Samiti decides to forward the aforesaid letter dated 22nd July 2014 submitted by the Association to Directorate of Medical Education and Research, Mumbai and Maharashtra university of Health Sciences, Nashik and call the comments upon the issue. After receipt of the same, it be placed before Samiti for its consideration. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 6(b): **Email dated 23rd July 2014 received from Advocate Pravin Satale asking permission to engage senior counsel for filling Transfer Case in respect of Minority cases.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid email received from Pravin Satale, Advocate from Supreme Court asking permission to engage senior counsel for filling transfer case in respect of Minority cases.

ms

In view of these, Samiti accedes to the request as made aforesaid to appoint the senior counsel in respect of minority cases. Samiti further directs that the compliance in this respect be submitted at the earliest to Samiti. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 6(c): **Email dated 2nd July 2014 received from Shantanu Kale regarding admission process of Private Medical and Dental Colleges in the Academic Year 2012-13.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid email received from Shantanu Kale regarding Institute level admission process of Private Medical and Dental Colleges in the Academic Year 2012-13.

Samiti already has suggested to Government of Maharashtra to for moving the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, New Delhi for permissions to fill in the resultant vacancies, extension of cut-off-date and also praying their in that all admissions even after CAP rounds be brought under "Common Admission Process" only.

In light of above observations, after deliberation, Samiti feels no action was necessary. Filed. To be informed accordingly.

Item No. 6(d): **Letter dated 14th July 2014 received from Bombay Hospital College of Nursing, Mumbai asking permission to permit to admit candidates from Open category in reserved category and NRI Quota for the first year B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2014-15.**

Samiti perused the aforesaid letter received from Bombay Hospital College of Nursing, Mumbai asking permission to permit to admit candidates from Open category in reserved category and NRI quota for the first year B.Sc. Nursing course for the Academic Year 2014-15.

After deliberations, Samiti directs the aforesaid College/Institute to follow the rules, regulations and norms as laid down by the respective authorities. Office to inform accordingly.

Item No. 6(e): **Following Colleges/Institutes asking for approval of admissions of admitted students for Post Graduate MDS course on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 conducted by DMER, Mumbai for the Academic Year 2014-15, along with affidavit.**

Item No. 6(e)(i): **Letter dated 18th July 2014 received from Late Shri Y.C. Memorial Medical and Rural Development Foundations, Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar.**

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Late Shri Y.C. Memorial Medical and Rural Development Foundations, Dental College and Hospital, Ahmednagar regarding approval of admissions of admitted students through PGD-CET-2014 for Post Graduate Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

2nd

Samiti went through the decisions taken by it in its meeting held on 4th July 2014 (at Item No. 8[a]) and 8[b]).

Aforesaid College/Institute in its affidavit stated that "merit has not been compromised and no injustice has been done to any of the candidates and none of the meritorious student was denied admission. No candidate has filed any complaint against the College for Post Graduate Admission process in the Academic Year 2014-15".

In view of the above, after deliberations, on the basis of affidavit submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute Samiti decides to approve the admissions of admitted candidates in Post Graduate Dental Courses on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 for the Academic Year 2014-15, subject of fulfillment of rules, regulation, norms and eligibility criteria laid down by the respective authorities. Office to inform.

Item No. 6(e)(ii): Letter dated 22/07/2014 received from Tatyasaheb Kore Dental College, Kolhapur.

Samiti perused aforesaid letter received from Tatyasaheb Kore Dental College, Kolhapur regarding approval of admissions of admitted students through PGD-CET-2014 for Post Graduate Dental Courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti went through the decisions taken by it in its meeting held on 4th July 2014 (at Item No. 8[a]) and 8[b]).

Aforesaid College/Institute in its affidavit stated that "merit has not been compromised and no injustice has been done to any of the candidates and none of the meritorious student was denied admission. No candidate has filed any complaint against the College for Post Graduate Admission process in the Academic Year 2014-15".

In view of the above, after deliberations, on the basis of affidavit submitted by the aforesaid College/Institute Samiti decides to approve the admissions of admitted candidates in Post Graduate Dental Courses on the basis of PGD-CET-2014 for the Academic Year 2014-15, subject of fulfillment of rules, regulation, norms and eligibility criteria laid down by the respective authorities. Office to inform.

Item No. 6(f): Colleges/Institutes requesting to permit to allow to admit the candidates from Asso-CET-2014, MH-CET-2014 and AIPMT-CET-2014 for the admissions of first year B.Sc. Nursing Course for the academic Year 2014-15.

Samiti perused various letters received from Colleges/Institutes requesting to permit to allow to admit the candidates from Asso-CET-2014, MH-CET-2014 and AIPMT-CET-2014 for the admissions of first year B.A.M.S., B.H.M.S., B.P.Th. and B.Sc. Nursing courses for the Academic Year 2014-15.

Handwritten signature/initials

Samiti also perused the notice dated 22/07/2014 issued by the Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical and Dental Colleges, Maharashtra and same is displayed on their website. In the said notice where the Association stated that "if vacancies remain the nursing colleges, will be given NOC to admit students from MH-CET-2014 conducted by Govt. of Maharashtra".

Samiti makes it clear that Association does not have any right or powers to issue permission to admit candidates from MH-CET-2014 for B.Sc. Nursing Course to the Colleges/Institutes those who enlisted with ASSO-CET-2014. Samiti feels that the mistakes are serious in nature and same should not happen in future, kindly note.

After deliberation, Samiti accede to the request made by colleges to admit the students from other CET i.e. MH-CET-2014, ASSO-CET-2014, AIPMT-2014 for the admissions of first year B.A.M.S., B.H.M.S. B.P.Th. and B.Sc. Nursing Courses for Academic Year 2014-15. Samiti further decides that the approval of such admitted students will be given only after submitting sufficient evidence as to the list of qualified students in ASSO-CET-2014 having been exhausted fully for Academic Year 2014-15 for allied courses by the Competent authority, Association of Management of Unaided Private Medical & Dental Colleges of Maharashtra and Directorate of Medical Education and Research before the admission.

Next meeting of Pravesh Niyantaran Samiti (Medical Education) will be held on **Friday, the 5th September, 2014** at 12:30 p.m. in the Conference Hall, Office of the Regional Centre of Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Mumbai – 400 001.

Date: **F 5 AUG 2014**


(D.K. DESHMUKH)
CHAIRMAN